## Section 9 What did the pupils learn? The pupils' views

#### 9.0 Summary

At the discretion of their teachers, pupils were asked to complete one of the two Form B questionnaires. 9415 pupils completed the questionnaires, which asked for their responses about the visit or outreach session they had just completed. The results are presented in this section, first in two summary sheets, then in more detail grouped by age and the five Generic Learning Outcomes.

The 7354 pupils who completed Form B KS2 clearly enjoyed their museum visit and were very enthusiastic about it. Although this form was intended for pupils aged 7-11, a small number of children aged 7 and under also completed the form. 91% of these pupils aged 4-11 agreed that they had enjoyed their visit, 90% agreed that they had learned some interesting new things and 83% thought the museum was an exciting place. Pupils' tended to be most enthusiastic at age 8-9, but enthusiasm was slightly less marked in 10 and 11 year olds. However, most children felt that the visit gave them lots of ideas for things to do (71%) and on the whole enthusiasm for museum visits was high from ages 4-11yrs.

Pupils of KS3 and above (11-18 yrs) are increasingly more reflective about their own learning processes but can be less enthusiastic. It was encouraging therefore that the KS3 and above pupils who completed questionnaires were, on the whole, very positive about their experiences. 89% of KS3 and above pupils agreed that they had discovered some interesting things from the visit and 86% felt that the museum was a good place to learn to learn in a different way to school. Encouragingly, 77% felt the experience had given them a better understanding of the subject and 64% agreed a visit to a museum or gallery makes school work more inspiring.

Results from the DCMS/DfES scheme have been compared with the results from the evaluation of the Renaissance in the Regions Education Programme, which used the same two pupil questionnaires. The results for both evaluations were strikingly similar. However, it is interesting that in the DCMS/DfES programme, pupils at KS2 tended to be slightly less enthusiastic for most questions than those in the Renaissance evaluation, while pupils at KS3 and above were slightly more enthusiastic in most questions. Overall, the evidence from pupils is very positive indeed.

#### 9.1 Pupils' views of their own learning as a source of evidence

The data from the pupils' questionnaires gives their perspectives on their own learning. It can be placed alongside the evidence from the teachers and act to confirm or challenge the teachers' views. Pupils show a very high level of enthusiasm for museums and believe museums are useful and interesting places to learn in a different way from school.

It is possible that some pupils did not take the questionnaires seriously and some may have copied their friends' responses. However the similarity of results from the questionnaires completed for the DCMS/DfES scheme and questionnaires completed for Renaissance in the Regions (which had over 20,000 pupils completing questionnaires), and the number of pupils completing questionnaires (over 9000 across the two age ranges) adds weight to the data and seems to confirm that nationally, young people are enthusiastic about museum visits.

There are some indications that pupils are more enthusiastic than their teachers in some respects about the extent to which the museum experience has supported their learning. This will be analysed in the following sections.

#### 9.2 Who completed the questionnaires?

Two age-related questionnaires were used in the evaluation. 7354 pupils completed the questionnaire for the younger age group (Form KS2) and this group was almost equally divided between boys and girls.

Total number of pupils completing Form B KS2	7354	
Percentage of boys completing Form B KS2	48%	
Percentage of girls completing Form B KS2	50%	
Not stated	2%	

#### Table 9.1 Numbers of pupils completing Form B KS2

2061 pupils completed the questionnaire for KS3 and above. In this group there was a larger percentage of females than males.

Total number of pupils completing Form B KS3 and above	2061
Percentage of boys completing Form B KS3 and above	42%
Percentage of girls completing Form B KS3 and above	57%
Not stated	1%

#### Table 9.2 Numbers of pupils completing Form B KS3 and above

#### 9.3 Summary of results

#### 9.3.1 Summary of results for the younger pupils

The younger pupils clearly enjoyed their museum visit and were very enthusiastic about it. Ninety-one percent agreed that they had enjoyed their visit, 90% agreed that they had learned some interesting new things and 83% thought the museum was an exciting place. Some of the pupils' enthusiasm waned as they got older, and they were slightly less confident about visiting giving them lots of ideas for things to do (71%), but on the whole enthusiasm for museum visits was high among the pupils aged 4 to 11 who completed this form.

Question	Yes	No	Don't know
1. I enjoyed today's visit	91%	2%	7%
2. I learned some interesting new things	90%	3%	7%
3. I could understand most of the things we saw and did	79%	7%	14%
4. This is an exciting place	83%	5%	12%
5. Visiting has given me lots of ideas for things I could do	71%	13%	16%
6. A visit is useful for school work	83%	6%	11%
7. The visit has made me want to find out more	73%	11%	15%

Base: all KS2 and below pupils (7354)

#### Table 9.3: What KS2 and below pupils said about their learning

#### 9.3.2 Summary of results for the older pupils

Pupils of KS3 and above (11-18 yrs) are increasingly more reflective about their own learning processes but may be less enthusiastic. It was encouraging therefore that the KS3 and above pupils who completed questionnaires were, on the whole, very positive about their experiences. Eighty-nine percent of KS3 and above pupils agreed that they had discovered some interesting things from the visit and 86% felt that the museum was a good place to learn to learn in a different way to school. Encouragingly, 77% felt the experience had given them a better understanding of the subject and 64% agreed a visit to a museum or gallery makes school work more inspiring.

Question	Yes	No	Don't know
1. Today's visit has given me lots to think about	77%	9%	14%
2. I discovered some interesting things from the visit today	89%	5%	6%
3. A visit to the museum / gallery makes school work more inspiring	64%	13%	23%
<ol><li>The visit has given me a better understanding of the subject</li></ol>	77%	9%	13%
5. A museum visit is a good chance to pick up some new skills	70%	12%	17%
<ol><li>The museum is a good place to learn in a different way to school</li></ol>	86%	5%	10%
7. I could make sense of most of the things we saw and did at the museum	74%	8%	18%
8. I would come again	55%	15%	30%
9. I've left the museum more interested in the subject than when I came	63%	16%	21%

Base: all KS3 and above pupils (2061)

Table 9.4: What KS3 and above pupils said about their learning

### 9.4 Comparing the DCMS/DfES results with Renaissance in the Regions

When the data from both programmes is compared, the very high levels of enthusiasm for museums as interesting places to be and useful places for learning can be seen.

The tables below compare the positive responses from both programmes.

The DCMS/DfES pupils who completed Form B KS2 were slightly less positive in their responses to each question than those in the Renaissance evaluation, except for Question 2 where the response was the same.

	DCMS/DfES	Renaissance
Question	Yes	Yes
1. I enjoyed today's visit	91%	94%
2. I learned some interesting new things	90%	90%
3. I could understand most of the things we saw and did	79%	81%
4. This is an exciting place	83%	87%
5. Visiting has given me lots of ideas for things I could do	71%	73%
6. A visit is useful for school work	83%	87%
7. The visit has made me want to find out more	73%	77%

 Table 9.5: What KS2 and below pupils said about their learning. Comparison

 for DCMS/DfES scheme and Renaissance in the Regions evaluations

The pupils at KS3 and above were consistently more enthusiastic in their responses in the DCMS/DfES programme than in the Renaissance evaluation. The only exception was Question 8, where an equal proportion of pupils responded that they would visit again.

	DCMS/DfES	Renaissance
Question	Yes	Yes
1. Today's visit has given me lots to think about	77%	73%
2. I discovered some interesting things from the visit today	89%	87%
3. A visit to the museum/gallery makes school work more inspiring	64%	58%
4. The visit has given me a better understanding of the subject	77%	72%
5. A museum visit is a good chance to pick up new skills	70%	62%
6. The museum is a good place to learn in a different way from school	86%	82%
7. I could make sense of most of the things we saw and did at the museum	74%	70%
8. I would come again	55%	55%
9. I've left the museum more interested in the subject than when I came	63%	59%

Table 9.6: What KS3 and above pupils said about their learning. Comparison for DCMS/DfES scheme and Renaissance in the Regions evaluations

#### 9.5 The learning outcomes for KS2 and below pupils

Pupils at KS2 and below have a limited understanding of their own learning. They find it difficult to reflect in an objective manner about their experiences. The questionnaire was planned to be as simple as possible and there was no question on learning skills. However, children of this age range do know when they feel positive about experiences and they are likely to be more openly enthusiastic then older pupils.

Form B KS2 was designed to be used with children aged 7-11. However, some teachers did use Form B with children below 7 yrs, for instance when all the children in a small school took part in an activity together. The data therefore show results from a very small number of very young children. It is felt that these very young children were unlikely to have fully understood the significance of the questions. However, there were only a very small number of children aged under 7, so this is unlikely to have affected the results overall. Two children were aged 4 years, 5 were aged 5 and 26 were aged 6.

During the development of the questionnaire it was suggested by museum education staff that an open-ended section at the end of the form would allow those children with poor writing skills to join in the research. During the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation it was acknowledged that although there was no time to analyse the results of this section thoroughly, it was found to be a very rich resource. A very large number of children used the space to write or draw about those things that they had found amazing on their visit. Some of these writings and drawings have been used to illustrate this section.

From the initial questionnaires sent to RCMG from the DCMS/DfES scheme it has been found that, similar to the Renaissance evaluation, a number of children have used the space to write comments or draw the thing they found most amazing, and specific kinds of learning outcome are demonstrated. A complete analysis however would require a detailed knowledge of individual children and an in-depth knowledge of the school and museum contexts, which is beyond the scope of this report.

What amazed me most on my visit..... The thing that amazed me on Visite is when they showed what they would eat and what would use to cook and they what sailors would ship to Africa, 1 learnt that British Sailors would take guns to Africa and Grade or shing who aculo be laker

#### 9.5.1. Questions about Knowledge and Understanding at KS2 and below

There were two questions on Form B that asked about Knowledge and Understanding.

#### Question 2. I learnt some interesting new things

This question set out to discover whether pupils had increased their knowledge and understanding after the visit or outreach session. Overwhelmingly, 90% of pupils agreed with this.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils (7354)

#### Figure 9.1: Form B KS2 and below. Question 2. I learnt some interesting new things

Comparing these results with those of the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation, it can be seen that exactly the same numbers of KS2 pupils were in agreement with this question: 90%.



Base: all Renaissance KS2 and below pupils (17198)

Figure 9.2: Renaissance in the Regions Evaluation. Form B KS2 and below. Question 2. I learnt some interesting new things

Children were most enthusiastic that they had learnt some interesting new things at age 9, closely followed by 8 and 10 year olds.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their age (7120)

Figure 9.3: Form B KS2 and below. Question 2. I learnt some interesting new things by age

Girls were slightly more enthusiastic than boys.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their gender (7187)

### Figure 9.4: Form B KS2 and below. Question 2. I learnt some interesting new things by gender

#### Question 3. I could understand most of the things we saw and did

Did the pupils understand what they had been exposed to at the museum or outreach session? Although the majority of pupils agreed with the question, it was in lower numbers than for Question 2. Seventy-nine percent of pupils agreed with this statement whilst 21% were either not sure or did not understand most of the activity.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils (7354)

### Figure 9.5: Form B KS2 and below. Question 3. I could understand most of the things we saw and did

For the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation, slightly more KS2 and below pupils agreed with this statement (81%).



Base: all Renaissance KS2 and below pupils (17198)

### Figure 9.6 Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS2 and below. Question 3. I could understand most of the things we saw and did

Pupils' understanding of the activities they took part in increased with age (discounting the very small numbers of very young children under 7). This is the only question in which responses actually became more positive as children grew older.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their age (7120) (Number of pupils in each age band: 4 yrs (2); 5 yrs (5); 6 yrs (26); 7 yrs (1025); 8 yrs (2198); 9 yrs (1787); 10 yrs (1514); 11 yrs (563))

### Figure 9.7: Form B KS2 and below. Question 3. I could understand most of the things we saw and did by age

Girls were more positive than boys that they had understood most of the things they had seen and done.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their gender (7187)

### Figure 9.8: Form B KS2 and below. Question 3. I could understand most of the things we saw and did by gender

#### 9.5.2 Questions about Attitudes and Values at KS2 and below

#### **Question 4. This is an exciting place**

Did the pupils find the museums they visited an exciting place? Eighty-three percent of the younger pupils agreed with this statement.





#### Figure 9.9: Form B KS2 and below. Question 4. This is an exciting place

Very similar numbers of KS2 and below pupils, who completed questionnaires as part of the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation, were in agreement with this question (87%).



Base: all Renaissance KS2 and below pupils (17198)

### Figure 9.10: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS2 and below. Question 4. This is an exciting place

Most children were extremely positive about their visit regardless of age. Discounting the small number of children under 7, the 8 and 7 year olds were most positive, with enthusiasm tailing off slightly as children grew older.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their age (7120) (Number of pupils in each age band: 4 yrs (2); 5 yrs (5); 6 yrs (26); 7 yrs (1025); 8 yrs (2198); 9 yrs (1787); 10 yrs (1514); 11 yrs (563))

#### Figure 9.11: Form B KS2 and below. Question 4. This is an exciting place by age



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their gender (7187)

#### Figure 9.12: Form B KS2. Question 4. This is an exciting place by gender

#### Question 6. A visit is useful for school work

Of the KS2 and below pupils, 83% agreed that a visit was useful for school work.





### Figure 9.13: Form B KS2 and below. Question 6. A visit is useful for school work

Almost the same number of pupils agreed with this question (87%) when completing Form B KS2 and below for the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation.



Base: all Renaissance KS2 and below pupils (17198)

### Figure 9.14: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS2 and below. Question 6. A visit is useful for school work

There is a general agreement across the age ranges that a visit is useful for school work, although girls are slightly more certain about this than boys.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their age (7120) (Number of pupils in each age band: 4 yrs (2); 5 yrs (5); 6 yrs (26); 7 yrs (1025); 8 yrs (2198); 9 yrs (1787); 10 yrs (1514); 11 yrs (563))

### Figure 9.15: Form B KS2 and below. Question 6. A visit is useful for school work by age



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their gender (7187)

### Figure 9.16: Form B KS2. Question 6. A visit is useful for school work by gender

### 9.5.3. Questions about Enjoyment, Inspiration, Creativity at KS2 and below

#### Question 1. I enjoyed today's visit

91% of KS2 and below pupils agreed that they had enjoyed the visit.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils (7354)

#### Figure 9.17: Form B KS2 and below. Question 1. I enjoyed today's visit

Evidence from the teachers' questionnaires and focus groups related to the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation showed how strongly enjoyment and inspiration are linked to knowledge gain. Teachers continually emphasised in discussions the value of visiting museums and the fun that pupils experienced. The evidence from the KS2 pupils was very similar to that from the DCMS/DfES evaluation; 94% of KS2 pupils stated that they had enjoyed the visit.



Base: all Renaissance KS2 and below pupils (17198)

### Figure 9.18: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS2 and below. Question 1. I enjoyed today's visit

Eight and nine year olds were most enthusiastic, with 94% saying that they had enjoyed the visit. Enthusiasm declined slightly in pupils aged 10 and 11, although 89% and 87% still said that they had enjoyed the visit.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their age (7120) (Number of pupils in each age band: 4 yrs (2); 5 yrs (5); 6 yrs (26); 7 yrs (1025); 8 yrs (2198); 9 yrs (1787); 10 yrs (1514); 11 yrs (563))

#### Figure 9.19: Form B KS2 and below. Question 1. I enjoyed today's visit by age



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their gender (7187)

### Figure 9.20: Form B KS2 and below. Question 1. I enjoyed today's visit by gender

#### 9.5.4 Questions about Action, Behaviour, Progression at KS2 and below

There were two questions on Form B KS2 and below that focused on development and progression that might occur after the visit.

#### Question 5. Visiting has given me lots of ideas for things I could do

Did the museum visit stimulate interest and the potential to take things further? 71% of KS2 and below pupils agreed that the visit did.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils (7354)

### Figure 9.21: Form B KS2 and below. Question 5. Visiting has given me lots of ideas for things I could do

Slightly more KS2 and below pupils who completed Form B as part of the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation agreed with the question (73%).



Base: all Renaissance KS2 and below pupils (17198)

#### Figure 9.22: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS2 and below. Question 5. Visiting has given me lots of ideas for things I could do

Younger pupils were most positive that the visit had given them ideas for things to do, and again enthusiasm declined in the older children at age 10 and 11.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their age (7120) (Number of pupils in each age band: 4 yrs (2); 5 yrs (5); 6 yrs (26); 7 yrs (1025); 8 yrs (2198); 9 yrs (1787); 10 yrs (1514); 11 yrs (563))

### Figure 9.23: Form B KS2 and below. Question 5. Visiting has given me lots of ideas for things I could do by age



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their gender (7187)

### Figure 9.24: Form B KS2 and below. Question 5. Visiting has given me lots of ideas for things I could do by gender

A second question based on Action, Behaviour, Progression was designed to see if the visit or outreach session resulted in motivation to continue learning.

#### Question 7. The visit has made me want to find out more

More KS2 and below pupils agreed with this question than for Question 5.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils (7354)

### Figure 9.25: Form B KS2 and below. Question 7. The visit has made me want to find out more

The percentage of pupils agreeing with this question as part of the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation was very similar to KS2 and below pupils completing questionnaires as part of the DCMS/DfES scheme (77%).



Base: all Renaissance KS2 and below pupils (17198)

### Figure 9.26: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS2 and below. Question 7. The visit has made me want to find out more

Older KS2 pupils aged 10 and 11 are again less likely to be in agreement with this question than the younger pupils. Boys are also less enthusiastic than girls about increased motivation after a visit or outreach session.



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their age (7120) (Number of pupils in each age band: 4 yrs (2); 5 yrs (5); 6 yrs (26); 7 yrs (1025); 8 yrs (2198); 9 yrs (1787); 10 yrs (1514); 11 yrs (563))

### Figure 9.27: Form B KS2 and below. Question 7. The visit has made me want to find out more by age



Base: all KS2 and below pupils who gave their gender (7187)

#### Figure 9.28: Form B KS2 and below. Question 7. The visit has made me want to find out more by gender

Pupils at KS2 and below appear to have been more positive that the visit made them want to find out more than some of their teachers expected.

Question 7 on Form B KS2 asked pupils whether the visit made them want to find out more, while Question 20 on Form A asked their teachers whether they thought the visit would lead to pupils' increased motivation to learn. The responses of the teachers and the children in their particular groups can be compared, since each group was identified by a unique Evaluation Pack number. This analysis reveals that even when teachers were uncertain, or thought it unlikely that pupils would have increased motivation to learn, high proportions of the pupils in their groups still answered that the visit had made them want to find out more.

In Figure 9.29, each column represents the pupils whose teachers answered that increased motivation to learn was very likely, quite likely, quite unlikely, very unlikely or neither. The proportions of these teachers' pupils who answered yes, no and don't know, are indicated on the columns. For example, the figure shows that where teachers thought it very likely that the visit would give pupils increased motivation to learn (column on the left), 79% of the pupils in these groups said that they wanted to find out more. However, where teachers thought it quite unlikely (second column from the right), 65% of these pupils still said they wanted to find out more. Overall, only 4 teachers answered quite unlikely and 1 teacher answered very unlikely, so the samples of pupils for these categories are much smaller. However, this does appear to indicate that these pupils were more positive about the outcomes of the visit than their teachers.



Form A. Question 20. To what extent do you anticipate that the museum visit will support pupil development - in increased motivation to learn?

Base: 6369 KS2 and below pupils whose teachers answered Question 20 (2729 very likely, 3120 quite likely, 457 neither, 40 quite unlikely, 23 very unlikely)

# Figure 9.29: Form A. Question 20. To what extent do you anticipate that the museum visit will support pupil development – in increased motivation to learn? Form B. KS2 and below. Question 7. The visit has made me want to find out more

#### 9.6 Learning in the museum at KS2 and below

Pupils at KS2 and below were highly enthusiastic about their museum experience, with 91% saying that they had enjoyed the visit and 90% saying that they had learned some interesting new things.

The last section of the KS2 questionnaire asked the pupils what amazed them most about the visit.

From the drawings and comments made by the pupils, it is clear that children were really surprised and delighted by what they had experienced at the museum.

Below are two examples of comments from returned Form Bs that illustrate some of the pupils' responses to their experiences.

What amazed me most on my visit ... ky Seeing things from thousands of years ago and atually touching them and it amazies Me by how heavy the coins feel. It also amazes the by seeing people live like that years ago. What amazed me most on my visit..... I was amazed by the chain because to see what the slaves were chained me dissappointed me most because they should not be treated that way,

#### 9.7 The learning outcomes for KS3 and above pupils

Pupils of KS3 and above (11-18 yrs) are increasingly more reflective about their own learning processes may generally be less enthusiastic. Peer pressure grows in importance and the need to be seen to be "cool" may interfere with the interest in learning.

It is encouraging therefore that the KS3 and above pupils who completed questionnaires were, on the whole, very positive about their experiences. The evidence from the data collected for the DCMS/DfES scheme evaluation supports the evidence from the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation that older pupils are more measured in their enthusiasm but that they appreciate the value of a museum visit. However, pupils at KS3 and above were consistently more enthusiastic in their responses in the DCMS/DfES programme than in the Renaissance evaluation.

What did the older pupils think about their museum visits?

89% of KS3 and above pupils agreed that they had discovered some interesting things from the visit and 86% felt that the museum was a good place to learn to learn in a different way to school. Encouragingly, 77% felt the experience had given them a better understanding of the subject and 64% agreed a visit to a museum or gallery makes school work more inspiring.

63% agreed that they left the museum more interested in the subject than when they came and 55% also thought that they would come again.

Generally, the male pupils tended to be slightly less enthusiastic than the female pupils and there were some variations in attitude across the ages but these are difficult to account for.

#### 9.7.1 Questions about Knowledge and Understanding at KS3 and above

Five questions asked pupils to think about their increased Knowledge and Understanding after the visit or outreach session.

#### Question 1. Today's visit has given me lots to think about



76% of the KS3 and above pupils agreed with this statement.

Base: all KS3 and above pupils (2061)

### Figure 9.30: Form B KS3 and above. Question 1. Today's visit has given me lots to think about

As a percentage, slightly more KS3 and above pupils who completed questionnaires as part of the DCMS/DfES scheme evaluation agreed with this question than for Renaissance in the Regions evaluation.



Base: all Renaissance KS3 and above pupils (3406)

### Figure 9.31: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS3 and above. Question 1. Today's visit has given me lots to think about

It is interesting that agreement with this question rises with age, most noticeably for the oldest pupils who responded, those aged 16 years and over. However, the number of pupils aged 16 or over is relatively small (99 pupils), with only 24 pupils older than 17.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their age (2022) (Number of pupils in each age range: 11 yrs (185); 12 yrs (288); 13 yrs (570); 14 yrs (663); 15 yrs (217); 16 yrs (48); 17 (27); 18 + yrs (24))

### Figure 9.32: Form B KS3 and above. Question 1. Today's visit has given me lots to think about by age



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their gender (2030)

### Figure 9.33: Form B KS3 and above. Question 1. Today's visit has given me lots to think about by gender

#### Question 2. I discovered some interesting things from the visit today



A significant number of KS3 and above pupils who completed Form B agreed with this question, 89% of the total.

Base: all KS3 and above pupils (2061)

### Figure 9.34: Form B KS3 and above. Question 2. I discovered some interesting things from the visit today

This result is similar to the responses of KS3 and above pupils in the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation.



Base: all Renaissance KS3 and above pupils (3406)

### Figure 9.35: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS3 and above. Question 2. I discovered some interesting things from the visit

Although some pupils of this age may be difficult to engage, it appears that museum visits or outreach sessions are able to stimulate interest in pupils of this age group. The data from both the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation and DCMS/DfES scheme evaluation supports this view, with similar percentages of KS3 and above pupils agreeing with the question.

Responses to this question were variable across the different age groups; 12, 13 and over 17 year olds were more positive that they had discovered some interesting things.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their age (2022)

### Figure 9.36: Form B KS3 and above. Question 2. I discovered some interesting things from the visit today by age



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their gender (2030)

Figure 9.37: Form B KS3 and above. Question 2. I discovered some interesting things from the visit today by gender

### Question 7. I could make sense of most of the things we saw and did at the museum

74% of KS3 and above pupils agreed that they could make sense of all the things they saw and did at the museum.

It is interesting to compare this to the KS2 pupils' responses to Question 3, I could understand most of the things we saw and did. 79% of KS2 and below pupils answered yes to this question. The older pupils are less confident that they had understood the activities. This may have been because older pupils appreciated the complexity of what they saw in the museum and recognised that they could not understand everything.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils (2061)

### Figure 9.38: Form B KS3 and above. Question 7. I could make sense of most of the things we saw and did at the museum

Pupils who completed a questionnaire as part of the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation were less confident in response to this question than those in the DCMS/DfES evaluation.



Base: all Renaissance KS3 and above pupils (3406)

### Figure 9.39: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS3 and above. Question 7. I could make sense of most of the things we saw and did in the museum

As with pupils at KS2, pupils appeared to increase in confidence that they had understood most of what they had done as they grew older. Males and females were in very close agreement regarding this question.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their age (2022) (Number of pupils in each age range: 11 yrs (185); 12 yrs (288); 13 yrs (570); 14 yrs (663); 15 yrs (217); 16 yrs (48); 17 (27); 18 + yrs (24))

### Figure 9.40: Form B KS3 and above. Question 7. I could make sense of most of the things we saw and did at the museum by age



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their gender (2030)

#### Figure 9.41: Form B KS3 and above. Question 7. I could make sense of most of the things we saw and did at the museum by gender

#### Question 4: The visit has given me a better understanding of the subject

78% of pupils agree with this question.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils (2061)

### Figure 9.42: Form B KS3 and above. Question 4. The visit has given me a better understanding of the subject

Again, pupils in the DCMS/DfES programme were slightly more enthusiastic than those in the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation, where 72% of KS3 and above pupils agreed with this question.



Base: all Renaissance KS3 and above pupils (3406)

### Figure 9.43: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS3 and above. Question 4. The visit has given me a better understanding of the subject

There is quite a significant decline in agreement with this question as pupils grow older. The youngest KS3 pupils, aged 11 years, are most positive that the visit has given them a better understanding (82%), but only 63% of the oldest pupils aged over 17 agreed.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their age (2022) (Number of pupils in each age range: 11 yrs (185); 12 yrs (288); 13 yrs (570); 14 yrs (663); 15 yrs (217); 16 yrs (48); 17 (27); 18 + yrs (24))

Figure 9.44: Form B KS3 and above. Question 4. The visit has given me a better understanding of the subject by age



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their gender (2030)

### Figure 9.45: Form B KS3 and above. Question 4. The visit has given me a better understanding of the subject by gender

Pupils at KS3 and above appear to have been more positive that they had gained a better understanding of the subject than some of their teachers expected.

While Question 4 on Form B KS3 and above asked pupils whether the visit had given them a better understanding of the subject, Question 20 on Form A asked their teachers whether they thought the visit would have supported pupils' subject-related understanding. These responses can be compared since each group was identified by a unique Evaluation Pack number.

In Figure 9.46, each column represents the total pupils whose teachers answered very likely, quite likely, neither, or quite unlikely. The proportions of their pupils who answered yes, no and don't know are indicated by the proportions within the columns.

For example, where teachers thought it very likely that the visit would support subject-related understanding, 78% of these pupils felt they had a better understanding of the subject (column on the left). Yet when teachers thought it quite unlikely, an even higher 83% of these students said they had gained a better understanding (column on the right). Similar proportions of pupils responded yes, regardless of their own teachers' responses. There were fewer teachers who answered neither or quite unlikely, so the sample sizes of pupils are smaller for these categories. However, this does appear to indicate that where teachers lacked confidence in learning outcomes, many of their pupils did not agree and felt more positive than their teachers. This echoes the finding about teachers' expectation of increased motivation at KS2 (see Section 9.5). This pattern is also repeated in other comparisons of the responses to Form A and Form B KS3 and above, which will be discussed throughout this section.



Form A. Question 20. To what extent do you anticipate that the museum visit will support pupil development - in their subject-related understanding?

Base: 1690 KS3 and above pupils whose teachers answered Question 20 (1118 very likely, 508 quite likely, 10 neither, 54 quite unlikely)

Figure 9.46: Form A. Question 20. To what extent do you anticipate that the museum visit will support pupil development – in their subject-related understanding? Form B KS3 and above. Question 4. The visit has given me a better understanding of the subject

### Question 9. I've left the museum more interested in the subject than when I came



63% of KS3 and above pupils agreed with this statement.

Base: all KS3 and above pupils (2061)

#### Figure 9.47: Form B KS3 and above. Question 9. I've left the museum more interested in the subject than when I came

Again, the pupils in the DCMS/DfES programme are slightly more enthusiastic than those in the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation, where 59% agreed with this question.

Increased understanding of the subject seems to be a more general outcome for both evaluations than increased interest in a subject.

Enthusiasm for a specific subject area is much less marked than enthusiasm for the museum itself.



Base: all Renaissance KS3 and above pupils (3406)

Figure 9.48: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS3 and above. Question 9. I've left the museum more interested in the subject than when I came

There is some variation in agreement with this question by age, which seems difficult to explain. The least enthusiastic were the 17 year olds: only 41% of pupils in this group agree with the question. However, those aged over 17 appear to have been most enthusiastic, with 71% agreeing that they had left more interested than before.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their age (2022) (Number of pupils in each age range: 11 yrs (185); 12 yrs (288); 13 yrs (570); 14 yrs (663); 15 yrs (217); 16 yrs (48); 17 (27); 18 + yrs (24))



Figure 9.49: Form B KS3 and above. Question 9. I've left the museum more interested in the subject than when I came by age

Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their gender (2030)

Figure 9.50: Form B KS3 and above. Question 9. I've left the museum more interested in the subject than when I came by gender
## 9.7.2 Questions about Skills at KS3 and above

### Question 5. A museum visit is a good chance to pick up new skills

While it was felt that younger pupils would be unsure what this question might mean, a question about skills was judged to be appropriate for older pupils. 71% agreed with the statement.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils (2061)

# Figure 9.51: Form B KS3 and above. Question 5. A museum visit is a good chance to pick up new skills

More pupils agreed with this statement than KS3 and above pupils who completed questionnaires as part of the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation. Of these, 62% agreed that the museum visit was a good chance to pick up new skills.



Base: all Renaissance KS3 and above pupils (3406)

Figure 9.52: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS3 and above. Question 5. A museum visit is a good chance to pick up new skills

Responses to this question were very variable across the age groups, with 17 year olds least positive, and those over 17 most positive.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their age (2022) (Number of pupils in each age range: 11 yrs (185); 12 yrs (288); 13 yrs (570); 14 yrs (663); 15 yrs (217); 16 yrs (48); 17 (27); 18 + yrs (24))

Figure 9.53: Form B KS3 and above. Question 5. A museum visit is a good chance to pick up new skills by age



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their gender (2030)

Figure 9.54: Form B KS3 and above. Question 5. A museum visit is a good chance to pick up new skills by gender

# Question 6. A museum is a good way to learn in a different way to school

A very high 85% of KS3 and above students thought that museums were good places to learn in different ways from school.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils (2061)

# Figure 9.55: Form B KS3 and above. Question 6. A museum is a good way to learn in a different way to school

The results from the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation were also very positive, although a slightly lower proportion (82%) agreed with the statement.



Base: all Renaissance KS3 and above pupils (3406)

Figure 9.56: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS3 and above. Question 6. A museum is a good way to learn in a different way to school

Those pupils who were 16 years old appear to agree less with this statement than other age groups.



Base: all the KS3 and above pupils who gave their age (2022) (Number of pupils in each age range: 11 yrs (185); 12 yrs (288); 13 yrs (570); 14 yrs (663); 15 yrs (217); 16 yrs (48); 17 (27); 18 + yrs (24))





Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their gender (2030)

# Figure 9.58: Form B KS3 and above. Question 6. A museum is a good way to learn in a different way to school by gender

As in the case of increased understanding, pupils at KS3 and above again appear to have been more positive about museums and galleries than some of their teachers may have expected.

Question 6 on Form B KS3 and above asked pupils whether the museum was a good place to learn in a different way to school, while Question 17 on Form A asked their teachers whether they thought the visit would have enabled pupils to feel more positive about museums and galleries. Teachers' responses have been compared to those of the pupils in their groups. None of the KS3 and above teachers who answered this question, and whose pupils completed Form B, thought that pupils were unlikely to feel more positive about museums and galleries. However, some were uncertain. The proportion of pupils answering that the museum was a good place to learn in a different way from school was only slightly lower in groups whose teachers had answered neither than teachers who were more positive about outcomes.

For example, in Figure 9.59, when teachers thought it very likely that pupils would feel more positive about museums, 87% of these pupils thought the museum was a good place to learn (column on the left). However, when teachers were unsure, 83% of these pupils still thought the museum was a good place to learn (column on the right). Only a small number of teachers answered neither, so this sample of pupils is much smaller. However, the figure does indicate that where teachers lacked confidence in learning outcomes, their pupils did not necessarily agree and were often more positive.





Base: 1697 KS3 and above pupils whose teachers answered Question 17 (808 very likely, 806 quite likely, 83 neither)

Figure 9.59: Form A. Question 17. To what extent do you think the museum visit will have enabled pupils to feel more positive about the following – Museums/Galleries? Form B KS3 and above. Question 6. A museum is a good way to learn in a different way to school

# 9.7.4 Questions about Enjoyment, Inspiration, Creativity at KS3 and above

# Question 3. A visit to a museum / gallery makes school work more inspiring

64% of the KS3 and above pupils agreed that a museum visit or outreach session was inspiring for school work.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils (2061)

# Figure 9.60: Form B KS3 and above. Question 3. A visit to a museum / gallery makes school work more inspiring

Evidence from the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation that museum visits are enjoyable and inspiring, thus stimulating interest and increased learning, emerged strongly from the teachers' questionnaires and focus groups. Similarly 58% of KS3 and above pupils agreed that museum visits could make school work more inspiring.



Base: all Renaissance KS3 and above pupils (3406)

# Figure 9.61: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS3 and above. Question 3. A visit to the museum / gallery makes school work more inspiring

These results are pleasing considering that older pupils may generally be expected to be less enthusiastic about their school work.

As pupils grow older, there is a general increase in agreement with the statement that a visit to a museum/gallery makes school work more inspiring. The exception to this was the group of pupils aged 17.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their age (2022) (Number of pupils in each age range: 11 yrs (185); 12 yrs (288); 13 yrs (570); 14 yrs (663); 15 yrs (217); 16 yrs (48); 17 (27); 18 + yrs (24))





Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their gender (2030)

Figure 9.63: Form B KS3 and above. Question 3. A visit to a museum / gallery makes school work more inspiring by gender

Again, pupils at KS3 and above appear to have been more positive about the outcomes of the visit than some of their teachers with regard to increased motivation.

While Question 6 on Form B KS3 and above asked pupils whether a museum/gallery visit made school work more inspiring, Question 20 on Form A asked their teachers whether they thought the visit would lead to increased motivation to learn. Teachers' responses have been compared to those of the pupils in their groups.

Figure 9.64 shows that when teachers thought it very likely that pupils would have increased motivation, 70% of the pupils in these groups said that the visit made school work more inspiring (column on the left). However, when teachers thought it quite unlikely, 72% of these pupils thought the visit made school work more inspiring (column on the right). Only a small number of the KS3 and above teachers answered that this outcome was unlikely, or were unsure, so the samples of pupils for these teachers are much smaller. However, this figure does appear to show that where teachers were unconvinced about the learning outcomes in terms of increased motivation, their pupils did not necessarily agree and a high proportion were positive that the visit made school work more inspiring.



Form A. Question 20. To what extent do you anticipate that the musuem visit will support pupil development - in increased motivation to learn?

Base: 1655 KS3 and above pupils whose teachers answered Question 20 (626 very likely, 901 quite likely, 110 neither, 18 quite unlikely)

Figure 9.64: Form A. Question 20. To what extent do you anticipate that the museum visit will support pupil development – in increased motivation to learn? Form B KS3 and above. Question 3. A visit to a museum / gallery makes school work more inspiring

## 9.7.5 Questions about Action, Behaviour, Progression at KS3 and above

#### **Question 8. I would come again**

Over half the KS3 and above pupils (55%) agreed that they might visit the museum again. The proportion of pupils who answered that they didn't know was high for this question, and pupils may have been uncertain because of distance from home, transport and other circumstances. However, the proportion who said that they definitely would not visit again was low, at 15%.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils (2061)

#### Figure 9.65: Form B KS3 and above. Question 8. I would come again

The data from the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation is very similar and the same proportion of KS3 and above pupils agreed that they might visit the museum again.



Base: all Renaissance KS3 and above pupils (3406)

Figure 9.66: Renaissance in the Regions. Form B KS3 and above. Question 8. I would come again

With relation to age, 11 and 13 year olds are the least positive that they would visit again, and 15 year olds are the most enthusiastic with 64% agreeing that they would come again.



Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their age (2022) (Number of pupils in each age range: 11 yrs (185); 12 yrs (288); 13 yrs (570); 14 yrs (663); 15 yrs (217); 16 yrs (48); 17 (27); 18 + yrs (24))



Figure 9.67: Form B KS3 and above. Question 8. I would come again by age

Base: all KS3 and above pupils who gave their gender (2030)

Figure: 9.68 Form B KS3 and above. Question 8. I would come again by gender

Question 17 on Form A asked teachers whether they thought the visit would enable pupils to feel more positive about museums and galleries. This can be compared to the proportions of students who said that they would return to the museum.

Figure 9.69 shows that when teachers thought it very likely that pupils would feel more positive about museums, 61% of pupils in these groups said that they would return (column on the left). When teachers were unsure whether pupils would feel more positive, and answered neither, 51% of these pupils said that they would return (column on the right).

There is some correlation between teachers' and pupils responses, since the highest proportion of pupils who would return belonged to groups where teachers thought positive attitudes towards museums very likely, and the highest proportion of pupils who said they would not return belonged to groups where teachers were undecided about this outcome and answered neither (20% of these pupils answered no). However, the proportion of these pupils answering yes is still high at 51%, and is identical to the proportion in groups where teachers thought positive attitudes to museums quite likely. Again this seems to show that some teachers may underestimate the positive outcomes for pupils, when compared to their pupils' responses.



Form A. Question 17. To what extent do you think the museum visit will have enabled pupils to feel more positive about any of the following - museums and galleries?

Base: 1697 KS3 and above pupils whose teachers answered Form A Question 17 Museums and Galleries (808 very likely, 806 quite likely, 83 neither)

Figure 9.69: Form A. Question 17. To what extent do you think the museum visit will have enabled pupils to feel more positive about the following – museums and galleries? Form B. Question 5. The museum is a good place to learn in a different way to school

### 9.8 Learning in the museum at KS3 and above

The figures suggest a greater enthusiasm for museums than might be expected from this age group, which confirms and exceeds the similar findings of the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation. Although the overall figures vary by age and gender, the general conclusions are very encouraging and it is difficult to determine the reasons for slight variations in some cases. This group was not given the opportunity to add qualitative comments or drawings, which may have allowed them to develop their replies to the questions, which may have been useful in retrospect.

In addition, in some cases it is possible to compare the pupils' responses with their teachers' responses in Form A. Many of these comparisons reveal that when teachers are unsure that certain learning outcomes will have occurred, high proportions of pupils in these groups are positive about these aspects of the visit.

### 9.9 Conclusion

Over 9,000 pupils aged from 4-18 years completed questionnaires immediately after a DCMS/DfES programme visit to a museum or outreach visit. The responses from both KS2 and KS3 and above pupils were very encouraging although the younger pupils displayed a more overwhelming enthusiasm for museums than the more measured approval of the older pupils.

Pupils enjoyed their visits, found that the visit was exciting and felt that their experience at the museum would make their school work more inspiring. Pupils seemed to enjoy learning in different ways with 86% of KS3 and above pupils agreeing that a museum is a good place to learn in a different way to school. Pupils of KS2 age appreciated that the visit may be useful for school work (83%).

Pupils felt that they had learnt something at the museum and wanted to find out more. Overwhelmingly, 90% of the younger pupils felt that they had learned some interesting new things from the visit and 89% of the older pupils had discovered some interesting things from the visit. Of the younger pupils, 73% said they wanted to find out more after the visit. Teachers indicated that they thought pupils would learn subject related information during the visit, and 63% of KS3 pupils felt that they left the museum more interested in the subject than when they came. Furthermore 77% of KS3 and above pupils thought that the visit had given them a better understanding of the subject.

Most pupils agreed that they could understand most of what they saw and did at the museum (79% at KS2 and below and 74% at KS3 and above). This is encouraging as it suggests that most sessions are pitched appropriately to the pupils involved and that museum education staff are careful in their research and planning into the requirements and interests of their users. Perhaps there is room for improvement here, however, particularly with regard to KS3 and above pupils.

Many of the findings that emerged from analysis of the pupils' questionnaires from the DCMS / DfES scheme are very similar to the findings from the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation. This is very encouraging as it gives weight to the findings from the earlier evaluation and further supports the conclusion that pupils feel museums are inspiring places to learn in new ways. In general, KS2 and below pupils were slightly less enthusiastic in this programme than in the Renaissance evaluation, but KS3 and above pupils were consistently more enthusiastic than in the previous study.

With the DCMS/DfES data, cross-tabulations were carried out to compare teachers' responses with the responses of pupils in these groups, using the unique Evaluation Pack numbers to identify teachers and pupils in the same group. Many of these comparisons reveal that where teachers are unconvinced or unsure that certain learning outcomes may have occurred, pupils in these groups are often very positive about their experience and learning in these particular respects. Only a small number of cross-tabulations were carried out in this research, and in some cases the samples of pupils whose teachers were unsure about learning outcomes were relatively small. However the comparisons suggest that some teachers may underestimate the positive outcomes of the museum experience for their pupils, and this highlights an interesting area for further investigation.

# Section 10 The case-studies

## **10.0 Background to the case-studies**

The DCMS/DfES Strategic Commissioning National/Regional Museum Education Partnerships programme as a whole can be seen as a mosaic of smaller projects. While there are 12 large projects, these involve 39 museums and a very large number of other community organisations such as the Bilingual Centre in Liverpool and other organisations working closely with schools and museums.

The Familiarisation Visits enabled RCMG to develop an overview of the programme as a whole. Following this, more detailed and in-depth examination was undertaken with slightly more than half of the projects. Eight case-studies have been selected to probe some of the research questions.

The case-studies are intended to perform the following functions in the research:

- Produce qualitative data to deepen and give specific examples in relation to the quantitative data generated by the teachers' and pupils' questionnaires
- Enable the exploration of community projects and participants that were not covered by the quantitative surveys
- Explore the diversity of partnerships
- Give examples of learning outcomes for pupils and community members

The case studies are not intended to act as a complete evaluation of each of the projects, but serve to explore issues that are central to the programme as a whole.

For the purpose of anonymity, young people are not named but referred to using an initial.

#### 10.0.1 Choosing the case-studies

The themes for the case-studies were identified and discussed with DCMS in order to decide which projects and which elements of the projects to pursue. The following areas of interest were identified:

- Rural issues
- Young people
- Ethnic minorities
- Disability
- Health
- Citizenship and community cohesion

Additional practical matters were taken into consideration. In order to generate the information that was required, it was planned that for each case-study, the following data-collection activities would be undertaken:

- A minimum of two interviews with museum staff, project workers or project deliverers
- At least one observation in the museum
- If possible, one focus group
- A visit to a school or community venue
- If necessary and useful, follow-up telephone interviews and email correspondence
- Two members of the research team had to be available for each visit

Taking these matters into account, the following elements were identified as important in the selection of case-studies:

- The case-study will throw light on current political issues as identified by DCMS
- The case-study might provide a model for future recommendation
- Innovative strategies are being used
- There is evidence of valuable partnerships/issues
- Teachers' barriers and solutions can be identified
- There is added value of some kind
- Deliverers can be identified who are available for interview
- Group discussions might be possible
- Participants are available for interview and /or observation
- The museum education staff might prove to be good practice examples
- The potential dates are appropriate

Each of the projects was discussed thoroughly by the whole research team and considerable thought was given over a period of some weeks to the selection of case-studies. The selection was complicated because some projects were very rapid in getting off the ground, while others were delayed. It was hard, therefore, to develop an overview. In addition, each of the projects had several components, and each of the projects could have been used to address many of the themes that we wanted to explore. In the end, the following case-studies were selected as shown in Table 10.1.

Project	Project Code	Museum	Date	Researchers
Anim8ed	DCMS/DfES/F	Museum of	14 <sup>th</sup> &15 <sup>th</sup>	Helen O'Riain
		Photography, Film &	January	Jenny Woodward
		Television	2004	
		Cartwright Hall,		
		Bradford	th	
Take One Picture	DCMS/DfES/J1	Laing Art Gallery	15 <sup>th</sup> January	Jocelyn Dodd
			2004	Ceri Jones
Engaging	DCMS/DfES/O	National Museums	26 <sup>th</sup> January	Jocelyn Dodd
Refugees and		Liverpool	2004	Eilean Hooper
Asylum seekers				Greenhill
		Leicester City	29 <sup>th</sup> January	Jocelyn Dodd
		Museums	2004	-
			20 <sup>th</sup> March	Ceri Jones
			2004	Jocelyn Dodd
Image and	DCMS/DfES/IL	Manchester City Art	1 <sup>st</sup> February	Helen O'Riain
Identity		Gallery	2004	Ceri Jones

Project	Project Code	Museum	Date	Researchers
Moving Minds	DCMS/DfES/P	IWM North	5 <sup>th</sup> February	Jocelyn Dodd
			2004	Ceri Jones
Partners in Time	DCMS/DfES/C	IWM Duxford	11 <sup>th</sup>	Helen O'Riain
		Norfolk Museums	February	Jenny Woodward
		Luton Museums	2004	
			a oth	Eilean Hooper-
			26 <sup>th</sup>	Greenhill
			February	Helen O'Riain
l la de vetere divers		Duitiala Europina au d	2004	Jenny Woodward
Understanding	DCMS/DfES/EN	British Empire and Commonwealth	31 <sup>st</sup> March	Eilean Hooper- Greenhill
Slavery		Museum		Jenny Woodward
		wuseum		Jenny Woodward
		National Museums	14 <sup>th</sup> March	Jocelyn Dodd
		Liverpool		Ceri Jones
		National Maritime	24 <sup>th</sup> March	Jocelyn Dodd
		Museum		
		Thomas Tallis	1 <sup>st</sup> April	Jocelyn Dodd
		School	a the second	
People, Places,	DCMS/DfES/DM	Beningbrough Hall	30 <sup>th</sup> March	Jocelyn Dodd
Portraits		Goathland School	2004	Eilean Hooper-
				Greenhill

### Table 10.1: Case study visits selected for DCMS / DfES scheme evaluation

## 10.0.2 The case study visits

Visits were made to the chosen museums and organisations that make up the eight case studies between January and April 2004. Originally seven case-studies were planned but it was decided to add a small case study to specifically explore issues of rural exclusion.

Each visit produced a great deal of evidence of the impact of the project, and this information was transcribed, written up, discussed and reflected upon. Preliminary discussions were held to inform the Interim Report produced in March, which described briefly the visits to each of the case studies, and highlighted emerging issues and conclusions.

Further visits were made after the completion of the Interim Report. When all the visits were completed, for each case study, the information from the visits was collected together along with the original project bid to DCMS, Familiarisation visit notes, Form H and anything else that would inform the final analysis such as evaluations produced as a result of the project. The process of analysis was very thorough, with separate members of the research team taking each case study separately, highlighting key conclusions and issues from the interviews, and making comparisons across the evidence presented. The conclusions and issues from multiple perspectives were then taken together and developed into the finished case study format.

The case studies are presented below.

## 10.1 Take one picture North East Case study: Laing Art Gallery, Newcastle-upon-Tyne



## 10.1.1 Overview

*Take one picture north east* was a partnership between the National Gallery, London, and the Laing Art Gallery, Newcastle-upon-Tyne which aimed to provide high-quality, curriculum-based learning and development opportunities for young people in full-time education. The project was targeted at less advantaged groups, to increase their access to art, through involving thirteen schools within an Education Achievement Zone in the west end of Newcastle and Newcastle Bridges School, a group of seven Hospital schools in Tyne and Wear. This was a complementary project to *Take one picture south and west*, a partnership between the National Gallery and Bristol Museum and Art Gallery.

The outreach programme offered by the Laing Art Gallery built on the existing *Take* one picture methodology developed by the National Gallery for primary schools. Each year, one painting from the Gallery's collections is chosen to encourage teachers to use artworks imaginatively in the classroom, as inspiration for all areas of the curriculum. The featured painting for the Laing was *Isabella and the Pot of Basil* by William Holman Hunt. The Laing adapted the original Take One Picture format by involving a hospital school and organising artists residencies in schools. Teachers were introduced to the painting through a CPD course run at the gallery, which was followed by a week-long artists' residency in all schools involved to create work for an exhibition at the Laing.

The purpose of this case-study was two-fold:

First, to examine of the model for teaching from paintings for it's more general applicability.

Second, to explore the health-related issues to emerge from the involvement of the Laing Art Gallery with Hospital Schools, which represent a new partnership for museum education.



# Figure 10.1: Organisational map showing the relationship of the case study to the *Take one picture north east south west* project as a whole

### 10.1 2 Research processes

*Take one picture north east* was visited by Jocelyn Dodd and Ceri Jones on Thursday 15<sup>th</sup> January 2004. Visits were made to two of the units of the Bridges School, to one of the primary schools involved in the programme and to the Laing Art Gallery.

Visits were made to two units of the Newcastle Bridges School. The Bridges School is a collection of seven school units within the city which provides care for children and young people from across the North East who are prevented from attending mainstream education due to physical or mental ill-health or pregnancy. For the past two years, the school has worked in partnership with the National Gallery as part of Take one picture but this was the first time the school was directly involved with the Laing Art Gallery. At the Royal Victoria Infirmary Unit, interviews were held with Margaret Dover, the head-teacher of Bridges School, and the class teacher. It was intended to speak to some of the young people who had been involved in the outreach sessions but unfortunately they were not in hospital that day. A second visit was made to Ashlyns Unit at the Silverhill Centre, a pupil referral unit for pregnant school pupils and teenage mothers aged from 13-17 years. The unit offers a range of GCSE and GNVQ courses and believes that young girls should not be disadvantaged because of their pregnancies. They are keen to expose the girls to cultural experiences and widen their horizons as far as possible. The co-ordinator for the unit, Barbara Peacock, was interviewed along with the art teacher and three of the teenagers who had worked with the artist from the Laing.

A visit was made to St Marks Roman Catholic Primary School in Westerhope. This is a socially deprived area that is starting to benefit from regeneration initiatives but is still the second lowest area in Newcastle for educational achievement of adults. The school was confidently trying to readdress this issue by encouraging pupils to be actively engaged in learning and cultural opportunities, and persisting with a broad and balanced curriculum. They were keen to be involved in the *Take one picture* project and the school had taken a whole week from the curriculum to focus on working creatively with the painting. An interview was conducted with the headteacher, Angela Gawthorpe, and a focus group was held with three class teachers, all of whom felt an enormous sense of enjoyment and satisfaction from the project. A small group of pupils from the school were asked about their experiences of *Isabella*, which were also very positive.

The final visit was made to the Laing Art Gallery in the centre of Newcastle where a focus group was held with Julie Watson, the project leader for the Laing, and the three artists involved in the residencies at the Bridges School and St Marks Primary School. The overall feeling from the visit was a sense of inspiration, energy and enjoyment for both the participants and the Laing Art Gallery, and recognition of the value of the work for everybody involved.

## 10.1.3 The project and activities

Newcastle Bridges School had worked with the National Gallery previously using the *Take one picture* model, with visits made by an education officer from London to Newcastle. This was the first time however that they had worked in collaboration with the Laing Art Gallery. Twenty-two teachers, plus 8 learning support assistants, from the Hospital School attended the CPD course at the Laing, which was followed by artist-residencies at several of the units. Artists in residence worked in different units of the school; the length of experience varied, but there was generally less contact time than in the mainstream schools. The young people engaged in a number of diverse activities. At the Royal Infirmary they did literacy work, wrote diary extracts, undertook artworks in pastels, chalks and watercolours and made Isabella's shoes from paper. The group from the psychiatric unit had made Isabella's pot, moulding their faces in plaster to decorate it. The students at Ashlyns unit were also involved in plaster casting their body parts which were used in an installation which represents the memory of a dream and expresses a yearning for the life that Isabella might have had if she had been able to marry her love Lorenzo.

Six teachers from St Mark's RC Primary School in Westerhope, formerly part of the EAZ, attended the CPD course at the Laing, and the head teacher had visited the National Gallery in London for a similar course for head teachers. This was followed by a week-long artist's residency. The whole school came off the curriculum and devoted their week to activities that were inspired by the painting. The pupils engaged in drama and role-play to learn the story, wrote diary extracts and discussed alternative endings, painted, made a display related to Isabella and her pot, looked at basil and other herbs and generally related Isabella to all aspects of their work.

Examples of work from the schools was displayed in the Laing Art Gallery as part of an exhibition to celebrate the project.

## 10.1.4 Key findings

# Outcomes for the young people at the two units of Newcastle Bridges School

Participants displayed evidence of a range of learning outcomes, which demonstrated the value of the project in stimulating interest and enjoyment in young people, some of whom were highly vulnerable and disadvantaged. Ashlyns Unit is for pregnant girls and very young mothers.

#### Involvement after initial reluctance - differentiated engagement

Some of the young people involved in the project were not keen to get involved at first, however the patience of the artists was rewarded. The artist at first found it hard to connect with the girls at Ashlyns and because they would not do anything unless someone else did it first, progress was slow. However eventually they began to try things and the artist ensured they had an input into what they wanted to do. Most of the girls were interested in the artwork rather than the story, although one girl was the opposite so she concentrated on working with the computer. The artist thought casting was very appropriate for the girls because "it tricked them into thinking that they weren't doing anything" and got them involved because they were confident that they could do it.

# New perceptions of what art could be, feeling (a little bit) more positive about art and galleries

The artists at Ashlyns introduced new ways to engage with art which challenged the participants' perceptions of what art could be, for example, using plaster, rather than more traditional techniques such as drawing and painting, was different, risky and exciting.

The attitude of the girls towards art was also more positive after being involved in the session. N, who did not see herself as an "arty" person, became more interested art and was keen to have a go at other things. She was also interested in visiting the Laing to see their exhibition of work. V and G did not think much of the Laing – "we went to have a look though because we were bored – it was alright" – and did not see themselves as art kind of people were nevertheless interested in taking part in more art sessions or doing more moulding, and enjoyed working with the artist.

#### Making a relationship with the artists

Two of the artists used plaster-casting with the young people, which led to a connection between the artists and the young people on a personal level.

The Co-ordinator at Ashlyns Unit, talked about how "you are close and have to talk, which drew the girls out." The artist mentioned that smoothing plaster onto hands and faces was therapeutic in itself, also requiring a certain amount of trust between the artist and the young person. A second artist commented that the girls at Ashlyns "felt they were being pampered."

#### Increased sense of identity and self-esteem

The project enabled the young people to take ownership of their artwork and contribute to displays in their schools and in the Laing itself, although there was not an opportunity at this stage of the project to visit the gallery, which was closed for refurbishment.

The girls were really engaged and were "brave enough" to have their hands, tummies and faces cast". The personality of the artist also did much to change their perception of artists: "Z was scatty and appeared to be disorganised but this drew the girls in" (Ashlyns Unit co-ordinator).

She also spoke to the girls nicely which the Unit Co-ordinator commented was different to how other people normally treated them. These comments were reinforced by some of the girls who took part in the session: V commented that being with the artist was fun because it was a change, "different to normal work – more like play." The girls didn't really think she was an artist at first either or "do anything like that" – they thought she would draw.

### Helping young people to re-engage with the world around them

One of the artists involved commented that with casting there was no wrong of doing it, unlike drawing, plus it was fun and very messy. This was important for drawing the girls at Ashlyns into the project, because they weren't that interested in the painting but enjoyed the practical aspects of making things.

The sessions at the Bridges School led to some unexpected outcomes for the teachers in relation to the young peoples' responses to art and the artists. At Ashlyns Unit, M, a very young (12 years old) and withdrawn girl, who "wouldn't even lift her eyes to anybody", allowed the artist to cast her heavily - pregnant tummy and asked for a photograph to be taken. This was unexpected for the staff because she didn't normally like people to look at her, and for this she had to expose her stomach. For the artist it was a great expression of trust because as she made the cast she could feel the baby kicking in the stomach: "She was there everyday working with me, she was really sweet." The art was able to draw M out, and the co-ordinator of Ashlyns commented that since then she has been less withdrawn.

The project also engaged many young people who were described as psychotic, unable to connect to the ordinary, which was a surprise for the teachers. They all wanted to be involved and did not want the artist to leave.

#### Coming to terms with illness?

At the Royal Victoria Infirmary Unit, the head-teacher of Newcastle Bridges School talked about one young person who wrote a "doomy and gloomy" poem about the relationship with her illness which may have been a cathartic process for that young person, an opportunity which is not always possible through the curriculum.

Young people who were difficult to motivate and engage because of their illness were enthusiastic and keen to have their hands and faces put into plaster. The artist commented how children who had never been out of their rooms were coming to have a go at having their hands cast, including one boy who "hated getting his hands dirty."

#### Lack of certainty about long-term benefits?

Although the teachers at the Bridges School did not see the sessions having a lasting effect on the young people, they and the artists both talked about the benefits of reaching disturbed and vulnerable young people through art (although it was not possible to talk to any of the young people themselves).

#### **Continued Professional Development opportunities?**

Some of the teachers from Bridges School, who were quite negative about being involved in training alongside the mainstream schools, felt that they were able to gain something from the course at the Laing.

The artist who worked with the Bridges School in Newcastle found that the nurses were interested in having some training around art – possibly because they had seen the impact on the young people – and that the project helped to break down some of the tensions between the nurses and the teachers, who were both keen to be involved.

# Teachers beginning to see the value of engagement with art galleries and artists

The experience at the Hospital School illustrated the potential for art to be therapeutic and visits were made with individuals to art gallery for this purpose by Bridges School.

#### Teachers' views about art being challenged

The project helped to change some peoples' preconceived ideas and views about art. When the teachers at Ashlyns Unit first heard that they would be working with a sculptor they were challenged by this because they could not imagine sculpture would be accessible: "when you imagine a sculptress you imagine someone chipping away." The activities undertaken by the artist however went beyond their original expectations because it was based around plaster-casting, something that they could all take part in.



### Outcomes for St. Mark's and its pupils and teachers

This project had a very clear impact on the school, and a number of learning outcomes could be identified for the pupils and the teachers.

#### Developing art in the school

The project was an opportunity to develop art in the school as Newcastle LEA has lacked an arts advisor, although the school was experienced in working with artists and could really see the value in the short and long term for the pupils.

#### Using different teaching and learning styles

The project offered the school an opportunity to have one week off curriculum, and to expose the children to different ways of learning, "It's about making the whole child not just teaching them to read and write."

#### Enthusiasm and enjoyment

The sheer enthusiasm of the pupils from St Marks Primary School for the story of Isabella was conveyed by one of the class teachers: "Every parent and grandparent in Westerhope knows the story of Isabella and her pot of basil!"

Teachers talked about their engagement with the subject of the painting and the sessions with the artist with great enthusiasm.

#### Increased confidence and motivation

Increased motivation, confidence and enthusiasm were evident from the comments made by teachers. At St Marks School, the head teacher commented how non-academic children particularly benefited because many of them were good artists, "it boosted their confidence and kudos." The pupils at St Marks School were "puffed up with pride" at seeing their artwork displayed in the school (Head teacher, St Marks School).

#### New experiences

Children were encouraged to have new experiences. For example the artist at St Marks Primary School brought in different plants, including basil, to look at and taste. The enthusiasm for working with an artist was also evident. One pupil commented that they liked working with the artist because "you get to see how much art you've got inside you, and sometimes when you're not with an artist, when you're with a normal person, you don't get as much detail or anything out of it..."

#### Discussing difficult issues

The story of Isabella enabled the schools to talk about a challenging and disturbing subject although there were reservations from all the schools about the gruesome subject of the painting. However, the pupils at St Marks School really took the characters on board and showed a real depth of understanding concerning Isabella's fate – they were able to discuss difficult issues around relationships, death and violence, opening up an informal dialogue between the pupils and teachers.

The pupils also seemed quite capable of talking about the more gruesome elements of the story: "I dunno why but we started talking about suicide because she [Isabella] missed him so much but all the pieces [of the story] fit together so there was only like one way for it to be..." (Pupil, St Marks Primary School).

#### Extending beyond first-level interest and developing a piece of work in depth

Some changes in attitude were noticed in the pupils. For example at St Marks Primary School, the boys were at first inspired by the violence in the story but the teachers asked them to look at the love element of the story instead. This was successful and made the boys realise that violence is not the only thing to write about. Taking a week off curriculum enabled the children to spend a long time on their paintings and actually finish them, something that is not always possible during normal school time. Concentrating on one topic for an extended period of time also increased the pupils' confidence because "they can see that they can draw if they have the time" (Head teacher, St Marks Primary School).



#### Professional and personal development for the teachers

Professional development opportunities from the project were appreciated by the teachers from St Marks Primary School, who felt that they went on a lot of courses where they were talked at, but this made them feel involved. Working with other teachers also enabled them to share ideas and ways of working which was a change from planning at home. They were "allowed" to be creative, and in feeling inspired this enabled them to inspire the pupils.

Learning opportunities for the teachers encompassed their understanding of art but also the potential of art galleries. The head-teacher of St Marks School went to London to attend CPD course at the National Gallery and found there was more to London than shopping!

### Outcomes for the museums

#### Success for the Laing Art Gallery

The project was highly successful for the Laing – there was a sense of sheer enjoyment from the project for participants. The project was well managed by the project leader, who invested a huge amount of time and energy which paid off in terms of the enjoyment and inspiration generated by the project participants

#### New partnerships established

Key partnerships were created with schools and with a range of artists, with good possibilities for sustainability

#### Potential for sustainability

There are considerable possibilities for sustainability of the project's benefits as successful links have been established with schools in Newcastle and network of artists has been created whose capability of working with disadvantaged young people has been developed.

#### Professional and personal development for the project leader

In this project, the recruitment of an assistant to work on the project failed, and the Learning Officer from the Laing Art Gallery was forced by the shortness of the timescale to take over the management of the project herself. However, this has resulted in considerable professional development and the development of new skills, including thinking on a much larger scale, negotiation skills and working with a variety of people in a very in-depth way. Confidence in personal abilities was increased.

#### Weak links between this and earlier projects involving hospital schools

Some queries emerged concerning the relationship between the National Gallery and the Laing, as there appeared to be a lack of continuity between the sessions delivered by the National Gallery to the Hospital Schools and the project involving the Laing. Bridges School clearly appreciated the sessions from the Gallery, which were specifically focused on hospital schools, but seemed less involved in the Laing project which was not limited to hospital schools and did not seem to make a link between these two strands of *Take one picture*. If the links had been made would the School have been more positive?

### Using the model of Take one picture

#### A cross-curricular way to work which inspires teachers' confidence

*Take one picture*, as a way of working with paintings, enables a way in to art which does not depend on knowledge of art, or the artist or the techniques that they use. This breaks down some of the barriers that may prevent teachers or young people from benefiting because it enables teachers to talk about the ideas and stories behind the picture. This enabled those who were less confident about using or responding to art to use the painting. The project developed teachers' visual literacy skills, and gave them confidence to use paintings in their teaching.

#### A potential model for development

This is a successful model for development – it enabled close relationships to be developed with teachers, children to work in a more active way and increased the energy and enjoyment of the school. Although this approach could be seen as rather formulaic, it is very clear and simple, and this may be a reason for the huge success. When museums and schools are communicating across distances, with gaps in time of engagement, and considerable potential for misunderstanding, a clear and straightforward idea, where the steps to achievement are laid out and can be monitored, is essential. This model also enables a large-scale dissemination.

#### Strong learning outcomes

Strong evidence of learning outcomes from the teachers, artists and young people involved in the project was found, which testifies to the success of the project. Most important was the sense of enjoyment and energy put into the project by everybody involved. The Hospital Schools were less committed because they were less clear about the value of the project, but the researchers found some strong positive effects upon some of the young people involved.

### Working with hospital schools: issues to emerge about health

The interviews with the teachers from Bridges School revealed many of the barriers that these teachers feel they face as a hospital school. However, the success of this project has opened the door to new ways of working with young people who are very disadvantaged.

### Lack of teachers' confidence

The teachers at Royal Victoria Infirmary lacked confidence in teaching art. Although they were aware of some benefits for young people from art, it was in terms of a "nice experience". In teaching arts they mentioned feeling bound by the curriculum and contrasted this with the freedom of the artist, who was also a specialist and confident in her approach. They also commented that the young people enjoyed the sessions with the artist because it was something different to what they usually did in art, which was "probably really boring" usually.

The Hospital units were not very confident about the long-term benefit of the project and saw the project as a one-off event, rather than something that could be reinforced and used in a strategic way.

Newcastle Bridges School did see the benefits of working with an artist, particularly in the enjoyment shown by the young people, and were hoping to develop this in the future but they did not seem to be able to take advantage of the benefits of the project in a similar way to St Marks Primary School, who were more confident about the value of the project for the school.

#### Young people severely challenged

Many of the young people at Bridges School are very seriously ill, their illness dominating their lives and disrupting everyday life and education – some institutionalised, many vulnerable and some disturbed, this made learning problematic. Variable amounts of time were spent in the hospital which made it difficult for the teachers to expect any learning impact: "[The project] probably has an effect on how the children see art and paintings but [it] was not long enough to have a lasting effect" (Head teacher, Bridges School).

Furthermore, the young people have "more to think about than the average child" (Head teacher, Bridges School) so it was expected that although being involved in art sessions was a beneficial experience it would not impact upon them in the long-term because it could not compare to the importance of young person's illness.

#### Teachers doubtful about the long-term impact of working with artists

The teachers at Bridges School were not entirely convinced about the impact of the project (in contrast to the teachers at St Marks Primary School who were very clear about the benefits to their pupils). This was possibly because they lacked experience of working with artists and were perhaps not as aware of the potential benefits. Bridges School seemed more comfortable with their 2-year relationship with the National Gallery, whose staff visited once a year to deliver sessions using the basic *Take one picture* model. They described this as "exceptionally successful and enriching" for the young people who enjoyed talking about the different ideas and stories behind the paintings.

Even the co-ordinator of Ashlyns Unit, who felt it was important to broaden the young peoples' horizons through exposure to art and culture, did not feel that this project would have a long-term impact or be a life-changing experience. This was a pity, since although the teachers were in some ways trying to challenge the culture and behaviour of the girls, their lack of real engagement with the process was likely to

have an effect upon the outcomes for the young people's as there would be no effort to maximise the benefits of the sessions.

#### Doubts over the theme of the painting chosen

Doubts over the theme of the painting were raised primarily by the teachers from the Hospital Schools – highly specialised units for very vulnerable young people. They felt that the story of *Isabella* was not always suitable for the young people (the painting was described as sinister) because of the nature of their life experience, for example those who have to cope with terminal illness or domestic violence. However there is evidence that the challenging subject matter was handled by the young people and enabled them to engage with difficult subjects such as death and suicide.

The teachers also felt there was a lack of sympathy from the National Gallery, as other pictures had also covered themes they felt were inappropriate: "We take an awful lot for granted about kids" (Head teachers, Bridges School).

#### Relevance of the training?

The teachers were concerned because the training at the Laing had not brought up this issue so how could teachers be trained to talk to terminally ill young people about death?

#### Feeling different and marginalised

The Hospital units were defensive about their position and keen to put forward the view that they are different from the mainstream. They pointed out that they did play an important in providing education and learning opportunities for young people who might otherwise be excluded from school – they felt that the perceived view was that young people attending their schools were excluded by being kept separate. At Ashlyns Unit, for example, many of the girls who attended had not attended mainstream school for years (one girl, aged thirteen, had not been to school for five years) yet the Unit had managed to increase their attendance to 90% or more.

The Hospital units felt somewhat marginalised by the scope of the project. The head teacher of Bridges School commented that she thought that the original project was planned only to involve the Hospital units but then the EAZ schools were included; she felt this "marginalised" hospital schools because the focus shifted to mainstream education which does not always take into consideration the needs of the Hospital School.

# Initial difficulties in establishing trust between the Hospital units, the Laing and the artists

There was an initial wariness and lack of trust between the various agencies, as this project got under way, largely because of lack of knowledge of each other's worlds. To some extent, this remains, despite genuine efforts on the part of the artists and the Laing to build a productive relationship. The Hospital units were, understandably, very protective of their young people, and as is shown above, they were suspicious and anxious about the potential of the project. Although the project has gone well, the building of long-term relationships will take considerable time. There are training implications for both museum staff and Hospital unit staff.

#### 10.1.4 Issues of project management

#### Strong project management

The project was strongly managed, with a permanent member of staff taking over when the temporary project worker left after a short period of time. There was a real

sense that the project co-ordinator was passionate about the experience and benefited from having the freedom of a well-funded project. This commitment added a new dimension to the existing partnership with the National Gallery. The experience also resulted in considerable professional development for the member of staff concerned.

#### Towards sustainability - creating valuable networks and confident staff

The building of strong networks with schools and artists are a resource to build on for the future, with the potential to increase capacity and achieve sustainability. The experience of the permanent member of staff has also added valuable skills to the organisation.

## 10.1.5 Issues of partnerships

### The experience of the partnership - long-term impact?

The National Gallery and the Laing have increased their experience of working with each other. However, it is unclear at present how the innovative elements of the approach taken by the Laing will impact on the National Gallery. Working with artists in residence was a new and successful way of approaching *Take one picture*, which could be used elsewhere.

### Limited communication between project strands and personnel

There were gaps in communication between some of the elements of this project, which, had they been resolved, might have resulted in a more positive impact on the hospital schools. The National Gallery had already established links with Newcastle Bridges School (the Hospital School units) through the *Take one picture* programme, which focused on hospital schools for over two years prior to this project. However, the relationship between the Laing and the Hospital Schools was new. Even though the Hospital Schools were visiting the Laing, they had not been making use of the educational expertise and resources of the gallery, and thus links had not been made between the education department and these schools. The teachers at Newcastle Bridges School saw the earlier projects with the National Gallery and the present project as quite distinctive and separate. Had they made the link between the earlier project, which focused only on hospital schools, and the DCMS/DfES project, which involved both hospital schools and mainstream schools, they might have been able to appreciate this progression and to have felt less marginalised by the broader focus.

### 10.1.6 Critical success factors

#### Limited innovation

*Take one picture* is a well-established form of practice and a strong idea that was undertaken successfully with new people. The existing experience was successfully exported to new audiences.

#### Well-funded project that gave the Laing more freedom

The scale of the project enabled the Laing to expand the project in terms of and quality; and also of size – reaching 13 EAZ schools, Hospital Schools, over 100 teachers and over 1500 children.

#### Clearly focused project

Using one painting ensured the project was clearly focused; there was a sense that everybody involved understood what the project was about because of the clear messages about the project; teachers, project co-ordinator, artists and the participants were all engaged and motivated.

#### Celebrated the project with an exhibition

Having an end result (an exhibition) was one of the keys to success, as everybody understood there would be an exhibition of their work and a chance to celebrate their achievements in a public space.

#### Children and teachers motivated to do more

There was a real sense of energy and passion from the project. Teachers and children felt as though they had not finished with *Isabella* after a week and were motivated to do more. Pupils at St Marks Primary School were so impressed by the project and their work that they continued to refer to Isabella in lessons long after the project had finished.

## 10.2 Anim8ted Case study – Cartwright Hall

### 10 2.1 Overview

Anim8ted is a partnership between the National Museum of Photography, Film and Television, Cartwright Hall in Bradford and the Castle Museum in York to explore the potential of animation as a learning tool for supporting a variety of subjects across the National Curriculum. The project used collections of paintings, shadow puppets, early optical toys like clockwork automata, and animated magic lantern slides, to inspire young people to create their own animations by working with an artist. This case study focused on Cartwright Hall Art Gallery in Bradford who worked with two schools; Margaret McMillan Primary School in Bradford, classed as an inner-city school and Lees Primary School, described as a "semi rural" school. Lees Primary School had previously been involved in an animation project with Cartwright Hall and was in the early stages of a partnership with Margaret McMillan School as part of a Linking Schools programme developed by Education Bradford, which aims to develop community cohesion through cross community projects.

The focus for the *Anim8ted* case study was to explore the use of ICT and animation technology and analyse the focus of the project on skills learning.



# Figure 10.2: Organisational map showing the relationship of the case study to the *Anim8ed* project as a whole

### 10.2.2 Research processes

Helen O'Riain and Jenny Woodward visited the project at Cartwright Hall, and the two schools involved in *Anim8ted*.

Both researchers visited Cartwright Hall and Margaret McMillan Primary School in the Heaton area of Bradford on Wednesday 14<sup>th</sup> January 2004, and Lees Primary School in Keighley on Thursday 15<sup>th</sup> January 2004.

At Cartwright Hall, a semi-structured interview was held with Claire Ackroyd, Head of Creative Arts, concerning the progression of the project and the emerging outcomes for Cartwright Hall. At Margaret McMillan Primary School, classed by Cartwright Hall as an inner-city school, a focus group discussion was held with six children and the part-time class teacher. They discussed their experiences of the project and what they had learned. Further interviews were held with two class teachers, the Head Teacher and the teaching assistant. They were keen to discuss the learning outcomes for the pupils, the relationship with the second school involved in the project, and the benefits for the school.

At Lees Primary School focus groups were held with three small groups of children to ascertain their learning experiences from the project, and interviews were conducted with the class teacher and the Head Teacher. There was also the chance to observe one of the animation sessions at the school and to interview the animator, Emma Lazenby, and the project co-ordinator / animator, Louise Spraggon. It had been intended to observe both the schools working together during a session but unfortunately changes to the timetable meant this was no longer achievable.

## 10.2.3 The project and activities

Both schools visited Cartwright Hall in Bradford to get inspiration for their animations. They engaged in a number of activities including looking round the gallery and considering the stories behind some paintings. The main focus for the day was *Nursery Rhymes for Dmitri*, a painting by Balraj Khanna, chosen because the work is constructed from multiple cut-out shapes, which reflected the work the children would be doing to make their animations. The two schools worked together in mixed groups, discussing the colours and shapes in the painting and writing down lists of associated words and objects. Using their lists, the children then made up nonsense sentences and rhymes, shared them with each other, and drew characters to illustrate their written work.

Two examples of the nonsense rhymes produced by the children:

Starfish Blahfish went to the moor. Starfish Blahfish found a big door. He saw some green lollipops and some green leaves, he saw a big snake slither near to the trees (Lees Primary School)

The orange hairy orang-utan played the drums, bang bang bang. Waved his arms up and down, King of the Jungle showing his crown (Margaret McMillan Primary School)

Back at school the children continued to develop their rhymes and characters. With the animators, Louise Spraggon (also project co-ordinator) and Emma Lazenby, children worked on their animations using a "cut-out" technique. They drew and painted pictures of their characters inspired by the painting at Cartwright, cut them out, and scanned each moving part into the computer so that they could be animated using the software provided. Children chose views (close-ups etc); thought about perspective and movement; learnt that it takes12 frames per second to produce an animation and did the maths to work it out; moved the moving parts for each frame; and worked together in groups to produce animated sequences. The pupils also made more traditional shadow puppets (on sticks with black paper and coloured gel sheets to cover the cut-out shapes), which were then filmed in live action sequences. A musician visited both schools to help them create music to accompany their finished animations and shadow puppet plays.

The project had been running for several weeks at the time of the visits and strong learning outcomes were evident for the pupils, teachers and the schools as a whole. Pupils learnt art, animation and computer skills and developed communication and teamwork skills. Many of the children were visibly enthusiastic about the animation project and the museum visits and some had been inspired to develop their own animations. New friendships and links were developed between the pupils of both schools, who were from very different cultural and ethnic backgrounds. The teachers involved had also learnt new skills and ideas to incorporate into their teaching, which the project co-ordinator was keen to encourage.

## 10.2.4 Key findings

Rich evidence of learning outcomes in the pupils involved in the project was found when talking to the pupils and this was reinforced by the teachers and the animators; the multiple perspectives were consistent in their evidence of successful learning. There was also some evidence of teachers learning. There was evidence of learning in individual pupils, evidence of impact of the project on the curriculum and on the ways that teachers thought about their teaching.

While the staff involved from the National Museum of Photography, Film and Television (the Project Co-ordinator, Louise Spraggon) and Cartwright Hall (the Head of Creative Arts, Claire Ackroyd) were significant to the success of the project, the researchers were less confident about the penetration and impact of the project in both museums.

## Outcomes for the schools and pupils

#### Skills learning

This project emphasised skills and evidence was found that this was a strong outcome. Skills included ICT, teamwork, communication, using animation across the curriculum, life skills (meeting a new school, different cultures and names). Learning about a complex process together as a group required the use of planning skills, visualisation, understanding sequencing, process and project management, integration of a range of views, and the initiation and completion of work.

"They had to think ahead, and envisage what was going to happen before they began... It's quite complicated, understanding that 12 frames go into one second but they all did it, regardless of ability" (Teacher, McMillan School).

The children saw every stage of the animation and "saw how it all fitted together" (Teacher, McMillan School).

"So, enhancing speaking and listening skills, sharing language with a linking school. We just shared a few words to being with, and even their [Margaret McMillan] children's names... I just read out the list of names to start with and [my children] immediately said, "ooh!" So we talked about the types of children that we might expect to be in an inner city Bradford school..." (Teacher, Lees Primary School).





#### Inspiration, imagination and creativity

The children were inspired by the paintings at Cartwright Hall. They looked at *Nursery Rhymes for Dmitri* by Balraj Khanna, and used their imaginations to find shapes for their animations.

Anim8ed offered a chance to think in imaginative and creative ways, which engaged the children deeply. For example Andrew, at Lees School year 4, described how: "Last night, before I went to bed I were thinking of some more, and when they blow up, I thought of the spaceship spinning and getting smaller and smaller, then it came back, picked the buggy up, dropped it, and the spaceman came back, and then it went on his head and hit him right in the ground."

# All children were enabled to succeed, including those who were new, and those with special difficulties

The approach of the project co-ordinator, Louise Spraggon, was successful because she enabled every pupil to contribute in some way: "No one [person has] got ownership over the project... it doesn't matter if you can't draw, you could do some ideas and perhaps colour something in."

This approach enabled those pupils who do not normally succeed to participate and revealed new talents in some children:

"[Jasmine] was new to the school just before Christmas... She really designed 'Bluey Mooey' [and it was] quite obvious that it went down well with the rest of the group...that really established her in the class" (Teacher, Lees Primary School).

"There's a little boy in the class with quite severe learning difficulties...but when it came to doing the storyboards [the pupils] were quite happy that he produced some work... they accepted the fact that every child should have their work included. They've co-operated and worked together in teams... the individual child felt accepted." (Teacher, Margaret McMillan School).

The project offered practical ways of getting reluctant learners to engage with words using technology.

#### Increased confidence and self-belief through successful learning

Pupils were given responsibility through sharing skills with others in their school, assisting with "evaluation" by interviewing each other with a camcorder, by voting for the best work, and by peer teaching. This approach increased their self-confidence and pride in their work: "It will be exciting... we're gonna watch it and if it's a good film I'm gonna feel that we worked really hard and we did our best" (Pupil, Margaret McMillan School).

During the life of the project, children developed their ICT skills and understood that their skills had grown. This enabled a clear expression of technical competence and of progression: – "Well, at the beginning I didn't know what were what and all the buttons, and she showed us what, all the buttons and now I can just do anything to animate now" (Pupil, Lees Primary School).

"We practiced and now... we know how to do it". (Pupil, Margaret McMillan School).

# Broadening experience, enhancing the curriculum, making learning pleasurable

Children's experiences were extended through the project, and the curriculum was enhanced through the use of animation. Teachers saw the benefits of the project and saw how it could be used to overcome barriers to learning: "The main barrier to

[our] children is that their life experience is very narrow. Anything that broadens their life experience [is good]... The curriculum and the timetable are heavily weighted towards English lessons [and] there's an awful lot of grind because nothing like that happens at home" (Teacher, Margaret McMillan School).



# Teachers found a new way of working in the classroom to deliver literacy and oracy plans

Using animation presented a new way of teaching core subjects, making them more fun or introducing them in new ways. *Anim8ted* highlighted the significance of technology as a tool for learning, and it gave motivated teachers an induction into animation packages, developing their skills.

This method of teaching worked to reinforce understanding through innovative delivery. Having a clear purpose for the use of language enhanced the development of literacy skills. "In terms of writing, the poetry, the silly sentences, using rhyming couplets, sometimes when you do it in Literacy, it's a bit dry... And what this has allowed us to do is to use it... the work we did in lessons, we're going to use within our project so it's going to be meaningful. And it's got to help understanding" (Teacher, Lees Primary School).

Teachers readily found ways to use the project to take forward existing school goals and plans: "[There is] a focus on oracy in the school improvement plan. Language development and vocabulary enhancement are central because of this. Anything to [help] do this in an exciting way is an opportunity for us. Its excitement and fun: the joy, not the grind of language. The word "animation", going to the museum - it encourages dialogue" (Teacher, Margaret McMillan Primary School). *Anim8ted* gave the school an opportunity to develop language skills in an entertaining way. The project helped develop new, often technical, vocabulary.

#### Adults learning

Teachers at both schools and the classroom assistant who was interviewed at Margaret McMillan school were all enthusiastic about the new things they had learnt and about the potential for taking this forward.

#### Contributing to community cohesion

Anim8tion contributed towards community cohesion through the Linking Schools partnership, which this project helped to develop. The project was a very effective channel for the schools to come together, offering a real purpose for schools from geographically close but culturally and ethnically different communities to work with each other. "They live in a real enclave, for them to get out and meet other children it's bound to have an effect...they wear the same bobbles in their hair...." (Teacher, Margaret McMillan School).

Although both schools are very different in terms of culture and ethnicity, both are characterised by a lack of exposure to cultures other than their own. It was valuable for children and teachers from both schools to meet each other. The pupils appreciated this and were exposed to opportunities for increased understanding of cultural similarities and differences. "It was more exciting because we can make friends with the people and learn about them and the different things that they like to do" (Pupil, Margaret McMillan School).

The *Anim8ted* project enabled shared experiences from which the two groups could begin to understand new names, customs, religions, differences and similarities. "We were amazed how easily they (the children) mixed together" (Teacher, Margaret McMillan School).

#### Museum used as a place for cultural exchanges

The museum acted as a public space to share new and exciting experiences. Both schools reflect the often rather closed cultural groupings in the community, with all the children at Margaret McMillan School being from Pakistani backgrounds except for one white child, and Lees School being white and equally mono-cultural. The project at the museum offered a space and a purpose to come together to achieve something in a mutual way. This is a use of museums that could be exploited a great deal more than it usually is.

#### Children became aware of cultural resources

Some evidence was found of the impact of Cartwright Hall upon the pupils even though the visit was a small part of the actual project: "It makes me feel quite happy that he [Joseph Lister] gave it, cause now we've got a gallery to keep, to put things inside and we can use it" (Pupil, Margaret McMillan School).

### What the children learnt through Anim8ed

01-311-			
Skills	Keyboard skills – how to use the control and arrow keys		
	Maths skills related to the time factor in animation		
	production		
	How to use the pipette		
	How to manipulate the figures		
	Communicating with new peers (learning new names from		
	new cultures)		
	Working in groups		
	Planning, sequencing, managing processes		
Knowledge and	How TV cartoons are made		
understanding	What side-views and close-ups are		
	It takes 12 pictures a second for an animation		
	New vocabulary (animation stamps, frames, short-cuts)		
	Ganesh and Shiva		
	Even a static picture tells a story		
	How feelings can be shown in a picture		
Attitudes and values	Increased feeling of individual self-confidence		
	Positive attitudes to new friends		
	Positive attitudes to culture		
	Feeling of ownership of animation processes		
Enjoyment, Inspiration,	Inspired by the paintings at Cartwright Hall		
Creativity	Enjoyed the visit and the work there		
-	Enjoyed the whole project		
	Used their imaginations and creativity throughout the		
	project		
Action, behaviour,	Increased confidence in their practical skills		
progression	All of the children from Margaret McMillan School		
	expressed a wish to go back to Cartwright Hall		

### **10.1.5 Critical success factors – project and partnership management**

#### Meeting the needs of schools

The project was successful because it fitted into the needs of the two schools, using animation to bring life into core subjects, such as literacy, and putting theory into practice:

"We did storyboarding, we talked about sequences and related that to the PE work we'd been doing and... they'd drawn some dream sequences in Art before that, so it all went really nicely. The whole thing about the rhythm with the music and the skipping, that lent itself really well, tied in with the literacy and we used that then to build the rhymes from, to animate... So again it reinforces everything that they've done last term, so it's all still fresh and it's constantly "remember when we did this, remember when we did that" (Teacher, Lees Primary School).

The short timescale for getting the project under way meant that the museum developed partnerships with schools which had existing partnerships with the Gallery or interest in the project. Lees Primary School had been involved with Cartwright
Hall in a previous animation project and Margaret McMillan School had attended INSET training at the National Museum of Photography Film and Television and shown interest at being involved in similar projects.

The schools were both proactive and flexible in fitting the project into the curriculum, the teachers were able to see the value of the project and use it well.

### Skilled project deliverers

The success of the project largely depended on the skills and approach of the animators and project co-ordinator, Louise Spraggon (who was personally involved in delivering the Bradford project). The skills, energy and charisma of the project co-ordinator as an artist represented a key strength of the project. This was inspirational, enthusiastic, inspiring creativity, motivating, and a good model of working with professional artists.

Helen O'Riain described her "dazzling the participants with possibilities." She enabled every pupil to contribute in some way.

An HMI Inspection of Lees Primary School was impressed with the quality of her delivery but concerned about the lack of quality of art teaching in the school.

Part of the project is to leave a long-term legacy in the three venues but it also may have long-term impacts in the schools e.g. building capacity to teach animation: teachers learning skills and having access to resources; using the pupils involved in the project to share skills with lower classes (Lees Primary School); continuing to use animation in new ways across the curriculum and having the inspiration to use animation.

"What we did last year with the children who'd animated last year, once they'd done their project in the summer term...the children wrote a short story for the Reception class and animated it and showed their animations, so that they were just developing those skills. What we hope to do is allow the children who are doing the animation at present to share their skills with the younger children... with the next year group down [Year 3]" (Head teacher, Lees Primary School).

### Activities with a clear shape and defined outcomes to the project

Having something to do that was set out through a clear process with defined steps and a clear endpoint was very helpful in enabling the children from the different schools to work together.

### This project built on previous work

Cartwright Hall linked *Anim8ed* to a previous project *ArtIMP* (Art - Interactive Multimedia Project), and they used one of the same animators, Emma Lazenby. Lees Primary School had previously worked with Cartwright Hall in 2001 on an animation project with Arts Exchange funding.

#### The schools already knew each other

The schools were already linked through Education Bradford's Linking Schools programme, which uses cultural organisations to give content to joint working.

# 10.2.6 Issues concerning the use of ICT, animation technology and the focus on skills learning

### Developing ICT skills - challenges

The project exposed evidence of many of the barriers and challenges that faced teachers and artists in developing skills of ICT:

- The access to suitable technology in schools to take part in projects like *Anim8ted* is sometimes limited. In this case, the project co-coordinator used her own equipment in some cases
- Time within the curriculum to manage project-working is difficult to find. Teachers have to be flexible and balances project-time with time for core work
- The skills base of teachers may be low
- Need for artists to be educators can sometimes be challenging: "It's tricky for artists to think in that way"; but in this case, the artists were successful because they fitted into the ethos of the schools: "The animators have been excellent, the quality of work [they have produced] in a short time. And their rapport with the children, it fits well with the school ethos of mutual respect"

#### Skills development

The quantitative evidence gathered through the questionnaires for teachers showed very clearly that all teachers focused less on the development of skills in their use of museums than on the enjoyment and the development of subject-specific skills. This was also the case in the Renaissance report. In the case of teachers of science and technology-based themes, there was very little confidence about skills learning. However, this project shows very clearly how skills can be introduced and enhanced when projects set out to do so, especially when this is planned carefully in advance with teachers.

#### Teaching science and technology in the primary school

This project shows how museums can work with teachers to deliver science and technology. The quantitative evidence gathered for the evaluation indicates very clearly how tentative teachers are when working in museums on science-based themes. They are not alert to the inter-disciplinary possibilities of science, and they have low expectations of the potential of the museum to increase motivation to learn. This project shows how this lack of confidence can be enhanced through carefully planned partnership working and through the use of skilled artists/technicians.

# 10.3 Image and Identity Case study: Manchester Art Gallery

# 10.3.1 Overview

*Image and Identity* was a partnership between the Victoria and Albert Museum (the lead museum); Sheffield Galleries and Museums Trust; Royal Pavilions, Libraries and Museums, Brighton; Birmingham Museums and Art Gallery; Manchester City Galleries and the Harris Museum and Art Gallery, Preston. The intention of the project was to engage young people across these regions in responding creatively to museum collections and to exhibitions of modern popular culture. A major element of the project was the partnership with NCH, a national charity. NCH is one of the UK's leading children's charities. The publicity of the organisation points out that through more than 460 projects, NCH works with over 89,000 vulnerable children, young people and their families to ensure they reach their own potential.

The V&A already had experience of working with NCH as a condition of an earlier sponsorship arrangement, and had found the relationship valuable. This earlier partnership had been very effective at reaching vulnerable young people, and, for the present project, the partnership with NCH had the potential to enable regional museums to make links in their areas with the regional branch of the NCH.

Manchester City Gallery is located in the centre of Manchester. As part of *Image and Identity*, the Gallery held a series of artist-led workshops with school groups and five NCH community groups from across Manchester. This case study focused on one group from Collyhurst, North Manchester, who were in the early stages of a series of sessions held both at the NCH Foundation centre in Collyhurst and in the Gallery.

The purpose of this case study was to explore the partnership between a national museum and a national charity.



# 10.3.2 Research Processes

Helen O'Riain and Ceri Jones visited Manchester Art Gallery on Sunday 15<sup>th</sup> February 2004.

The researchers observed a workshop at the Gallery with the group from the NCH Foundation Centre in Collyhurst, which consisted of five children aged between 10 and 15 years. Two workers from the Centre (Janet and Sol) accompanied the group and took part in the activities. Interviews were conducted with Morrigan Ellis, project co-ordinator from the Gallery, Katy McCall, the artist in residence, and the NCH group including the workers at various times throughout the session.

The group were participating in only their second session at the Gallery, which they had visited for the first time the previous week. Earlier sessions had been held at the Centre in Collyhurst to enable the participants to be introduced to the project in a familiar environment. During the workshop, they worked on a large mural based on digital self portraits with the artist Katy, which was to be hung in their Centre, and printed their images onto t-shirts using a computer programme and helped by Morrigan. The young people were engaged for the whole of the session and although it was only their third session some outcomes were evident. They had learnt practical and creative skills, including painting and drawing; learning about themselves and their own talents. Relations between the Gallery and the Centre encountered some early difficulties but the work observed showed that the relationship established between them, and between the young people and the adults involved, was strong and successful with opportunities for both groups.

## 10.3.3 The project and activities

The young people had been involved in sessions at the NCH Foundations centre in Collyhurst and at Manchester Art Gallery in the city centre. Working with the artist, and the project co-ordinator, the group were engaged in a number of art-related activities. This session was their second at the Gallery; the week before they had visited for the first time to get inspiration for their artwork and been able to watch the Chinese New Year Festival. Using digital cameras, they had taken self-portraits, projected these onto paper and drawn round the images to make a large mural, which they were filling in with paint. They had also made their initials decorated with pictures and logos they found important, and were scanning their pictures onto the computer and transferring these onto t-shirts, after which they would create their own disguises so that they could "change" their identity.

# 10.3.4 Key Findings

## For the young people

### Positive attitudes from unexpected and pleasurable experiences

It seemed that the mix of sessions based in the NCH Centre and at the Gallery was already beginning to have an impact on the group of young people, although the project was still in its early stages. Many were from impoverished backgrounds, and rarely visited the city centre, let alone the gallery. However, all the young people had a positive attitude towards the gallery and most of them had found it different to how they had expected. K, for example, had expected "big drawings" but instead found things that he could touch and dress up in. Another girl, aged 10 years, had been surprised to see an exhibition of different kinds of chairs. K collected a number of comments from the group about the gallery; everybody responded positively with comments such as "I like the Victorian paintings," "Art is likeable" and "After being once and liking it I would come again."

### Increased self-esteem

The art workshops enabled the young people to find out more about themselves – to learn new skills and to focus intensely upon a number of activities connected to art. "They didn't know they had talents before they came here" (NCH Centre worker).

According to the adults involved, the young people were engaged because it was something for them and about them - "This obviously makes a difference to them. They don't have much going for them and this is for them..." (NCH Centre worker). The project leader also suggested that the young people were surprised that they were interested in them: "We took lots of different art materials there [to the NCH Centre] for experimenting and we took digital photos and photographed their shoes and boots and they were amazed that we wanted to..."

Having their own display space in the Manchester Art Gallery was thought to be important to the young peoples' engagement: "It really sank in when they first came to the gallery... When they first saw the display space [for their work] they were overwhelmed... then they were reserving their own space" (Project co-ordinator).

Some of the work was exhibited at the V&A. Having your work exhibited at a national museum is hugely significant for the esteem of young people whose lives are not punctuated with many measures of success. The culminating exhibition bringing young people to the V & A was an important part of the process. The association with a national museum brings status to the work of the young people and to the Art Gallery.



### Increased concentration and involvement

The young people in the group were described as lacking "a great attention span so to get them to come back, they really need to be involved...So for them to come to sessions for 2 and a half hours and not want to leave, it's great" (NCH Centre worker).

### Changed behaviour

The workers from the NCH Foundation Centre, Collyhurst, described how the workshops were impacting on the young people. They were felt to be "in danger of taking the crime route" but some young people had already demonstrated a change in behaviour, including a young person of 15 years whose mother had already commented on this. The NCH Centre worker said: "I will put this in my report to go to court for [K]... He just leaves his friends, comes on his bike, we lock it away and then he joins in. Normally he doesn't concentrate for long – none of them do – but they really want to do this... He is involved enough to leave his friends and that is saying something."

The adults could see the benefits and some of the young people themselves suggested that they were beginning to see the benefits of their involvement in the project. K was interested in doing some artwork after the sessions had finished and one of the girls made comparisons between art at the gallery and at school. At the gallery they were "better than school" because there was more time, more space to paint in and more choice about using paint and colours. At school they only got "a titchy bit of paper" to work on.

### Progression

The Director of Marketing and Communications, NCH, wrote to the Director of Learning and Interpretation, V&A, quoting a member of NCH staff: "C had a really good time (at the Young People's Conference) and as a direct consequence of his experience through Image and Identity has decided to apply to go to Art College to study Graphic Design."

## **Outcomes for NCH Centre staff**

### Changed attitudes to museums at NCH at an organisational level

The project has been persuasive and significant for NCH as an organisation, who are now great advocates of the role museums can play in developing the experiences of vulnerable young people they work with on a day-to-day basis. The NCH has agreed to extend the partnership with the V&A and will be contributing resources towards this over the next two years.

### Changed attitudes to museums for NCH staff

NCH staff have become aware of the potential of museums. One initially sceptical centre manager, David (NCH Manager at Linden Avenue), changed his view during the project as the impact became clear. A was a participant in the project from Linden Avenue, a home for young people with severe learning difficulties and challenging behaviour. A's collage was displayed in the exhibition at the V & A. His mum wrote to David especially to thank him: "The collage was truly unbelievable it made me so proud of I would never have thought he had the ability." David sent back an evaluation form about *Image and Identity*, which included as his final

comment: "I think the Image and Identity package was first class and therefore cannot think of what improvement could be made."

The partnership also provided inspiration for the NCH staff who accompanied the young people to Manchester Art Gallery, where they developed new skills and enthusiasms that they were keen to build on. The NCH Centre workers were very involved in the artwork and one was very keen to repeat the sessions herself after seeing the impact upon the young peoples' behaviour: "I'd like to do art work like this. I'd like to learn some more, get some better equipment... I'm no artist. I've never done this before - but I'm willing to learn. I can see what it does for them."



## Outcomes for the museums

# A new and effective way of reaching community groups was established for museums.

A partnership with a national charity offers direct access to communities through national networks, in this case to vulnerable young people, through the networks that the charity has already set up. This case-study shows how NCH Centre workers were able to introduce Manchester Art Gallery to disadvantaged young people whom they would otherwise have found more difficult to contact.

# A new model was established for national museums that wish to work in communities on a local and regional basis

A partnership with a national charity provides an interesting model for national museums to develop their approach to community outreach work.

At the moment, national museums have generally adopted strategies for contacting community groups directly, and have built their own networks of contacts and relationships. However, there are huge advantages to working in partnership with an organisation whose primary role is to establish, build and maintain community

relationships through a series of regional centres across the country. This is a powerful way for national museums to extend and maximise their outreach work, and, at the same time, to build relationships between national and regional museums. Given the high level of resources that national museums experience in comparison with many regional museums, this three-way partnership (between a national museum, a regional museum and an NCH Centre) would be one way of spreading the resources nationally.

The effective strategies adopted through a national museum, regional museums and a national charity working in partnership raise the possibilities of similar partnerships with other national charities and other national bodies.

### Strengthened relationships and continued projects

An acid test of the strength of a partnership is what happens at the end of a project. The V & A and NCH have agreed to strengthen their relationship extending their partnership for the next two years. All six of the museum partners will come on board and work with NCH, extending the provision to more young people. This time NCH will make a significant financial contribution by paying for all project management costs. One weakness of this project was the short timescale which limited the lead in time; many NCH centre managers and care workers were sceptical, suspicious and resistant at the start of the project, and so training and induction will be a key feature of future projects.

## 10.3.5 Key success factors – project and partnership management

*Highly skilled project management, with effective communication networks* Highly skilled project management has played a critical role in the success of this complex partnership. The project would not have been successful without a dedicated project manager to oversee the entire network of agencies and events.

The project as a whole involved over 30 organisations and individuals of many different types, including museums, charities (NCH), and artists, each with their own professional cultures, styles of working and reasons for being part of the project. Understanding these differences, and mediating and sustaining communication between all parties was key to the success of the project. One strategy used was the involvement of the Arts Project coordinator from NCH attending all monthly project meetings on an equal basis as all the museum partners. These monthly meetings between partners were essential in supporting all involved and in sharing problems and solutions.

# Experienced, energetic and skilled project workers in the partner organisation (NCH)

The enthusiasm and involvement of the NCH workers was key factor of the successful relationship established with the group. At first it had been difficult to establish the partnership because of staff changes at the NCH Centre and also rather unrealistic expectations from them.

However, the involvement of the NCH workers was important because their work was rooted in the community, of which they had an in-depth knowledge and understanding of the particular needs of a specific area and individuals from that area.

The personality of individuals also seemed an important factor in the energy and commitment of the group – "Janet is an extrovert and dives straight in and then they [the young people] follow... If she wasn't the person she is, it wouldn't have taken off as it has" (Project co-ordinator).

### Generous staffing - high ratio of adults to young people

A high ratio of adults to young people was another important feature of the workshops and the relationship between the adults and the young people. Positive interaction was observed during the session at the Gallery – the young people were keen to learn from the adults present and listened to their opinions.

### Shared experience and shared learning in the group as a whole

The close involvement and engagement of the adults was a key factor in the success of the project. Two NCH workers, neither of whom had any art experience, were involved in painting the mural; the young people saw them at work, learning alongside them and taking risks with the paint. The close involvement of the adults enabled the young people to be confident and relaxed around them although they did not know these adults well. The Project co-ordinator and the artist were also personally involved in the project. The group seemed to appreciate this and were keen to have both of them as part of the mural that would be displayed in their Centre.

The young people needed plenty of support and encouragement – for example R who has "very low confidence and low self-esteem and a short attention span" – which the adults were providing. They encouraged the group to be independent but gave help when needed, enabling a relaxed and supportive environment.

The engagement of the young people observed during a session and reinforced by the comments of the adults involved in the project, was a demonstrable impact of the project's success.

# 10.4 Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers Case study – National Museums Liverpool and Leicester City Museums Service

## 10.4.1 Overview

National Museums Liverpool worked in partnership with Sunderland Museum and Winter Gardens, Leicester City Museums Service and Salford Museum and Art Gallery to develop appropriate social and learning activities that would meet the needs of refugees and asylum seekers in their area. A key feature of the project was working with local statutory and voluntary agencies to take advantage of their experience in working with these groups. Some elements built on existing relationships between the museum and other agencies (for example, with the LEA). A major aim of the project was to explore how museums can address the isolation and social exclusion that refugees and asylum seekers may experience. Increasing access for refugees and asylum seekers to arts and culture and social contact, particularly for families and young people, was also a key aim of the project.

Refugees and asylum seekers are new audiences for museums and galleries. Museums have the potential to contribute towards community cohesion through increasing opportunities for refugees and asylum to be both better understood and also involved and included in their local communities. This case study was undertaken to identify the issues that ensue in the relationship between museums and these potentially challenging groups. It focused on National Museums Liverpool and Leicester City Museums Service.

National Museums Liverpool built on existing activities and exhibitions, adapting them for refugees and asylum seekers, working in partnership with local organisations and colleges. In Leicester, the museums service held three events aimed at bringing refugees and asylum seekers together with local communities to celebrate different aspects of culture and art.



Figure 10.2: Organisational map showing the relationship of the case study to the *Engaging refugees and asylum seekers* project as a whole

## **10.4.2 Research Processes**

Three separate visits were made to this project. Eilean Hooper-Greenhill and Jocelyn Dodd visited Liverpool on Monday 26<sup>th</sup> January 2004. Two visits were made to Leicester City Museums; Jocelyn Dodd visited on Thursday 29<sup>th</sup> January 2004 and again on Saturday 20<sup>th</sup> March 2004 with Ceri Jones.

In Liverpool, a number of activities were carried out. A visit was made to Smithdown Bilingual Centre, a community centre for refugees, asylum seekers and bilingual families that runs English classes and *Enjoy Liverpool* orientation programmes. Interviews were carried out with Ingrid Watts, recently retired Centre Manager, and with three members of the Centre who had recently visited National Museums Liverpool. Discussions centred around the value of the relationship with the museum to furthering the work of the Centre and responding to the needs of the participants. The participants discussed their experiences in the museum.

A visit was made to the Maritime Museum to interview Anna Rahilly, dedicated outreach officer for the DCMS project, to obtain her perspective on the success and challenges posed by the project and the outcomes for the museums.

There was an opportunity to observe a session at the Museum of Liverpool Life involving a group of young refugees aged 14-16 yrs from Liverpool Community College, and to interview some of them. Their tutor, Leanne Munroe, was also interviewed.

At Leicester, an interview was held in January with David Horrobin, project officer for *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers*. The opportunity was taken to observe the event held in St Matthews Neighbourhood Centre in March. There were informal discussions with David Horrobin, project officer, and Hitesh Tanner, community outreach officer from Leicester City Museums and with some of the community workers at the centre. There was also the opportunity to talk to some of the participants.

# 10.4.3 The project and activities

Young mothers and their children from Smithdown Bilingual Centre had visited the Museums in Liverpool for a number of activities including a fun day out to the Grossology exhibition, handling demonstrations at the Maritime Museum, puppet-making, glass bottle painting and windowsill herb gardens. Visits were linked to language work at the Centre, both before and after the visits.

Liverpool Community college had been using the museums every few weeks with their students for a variety of purposes including developing language skills and enriching their curriculum. They had been to a nature centre for a memorable behind the scenes visit, looked at Ancient Egyptian collections, African batik, Grossology and Enchanted Forest exhibitions and been involved in art workshops. Activities in the future included dance workshops, trips to the Maritime Museum and Transatlantic Slavery Gallery, and the Planetarium. Back at College, lots of preparation and follow-up work was done to make links with the museum visit.

The event at St Matthews Neighbourhood Centre was a fun day for families with a wide range of activities they could participate in, and prizes were awarded to local school pupils who had entered a writing and drawing competition about their experiences of living in Leicester.

# 10.4.4 Key findings

### Outcomes for the museums

The two museums approached this project in very different ways, with widely differing outcomes for the museums and the participants concerned.

The project in Liverpool built on existing outreach work, was strongly conceived, and very well managed. The project worker had appropriate skills, knowledge and experience and was well supported by the museums and organisations involved. Significant learning outcomes can be identified, with measurable impact on the participants. The museum can feel that it can move forward with confidence using similar methods, strategies and ideas.

In Leicester a different approach was adopted. There seemed to be little continuity between long-established outreach work, and little contact between the project worker for this project and other staff. As a result, strategies were slow to emerge. The first event at Belgrave Hall, *Worlds of Winter*, had a disappointing attendance and the project worker was unable to identify any outcomes for participants. The third event in St Matthews raised issues about the suitability of the event in relation to the needs of the project and the target group, and an apparent lack of connection between the vision of the project, as articulated by the museum, and the reality of the event. The project worker, while committed, lacked certain essential attributes and

the level of museum support was weak. Any future work in this field would need to very carefully planned and new strategies adopted with reinforced support.

# **Outcomes for the participants**

The project in Liverpool resulted in measurable outcomes for the participants.

### Mothers of young children from Smithdown Bilingual Centre

Strong evidence that museums in Liverpool enhanced and improved the life skills and experience of the participants was found during discussions at the Bilingual Centre, both in discussion with key workers and the participants themselves.

For the Centre, the museum acted as:

- A venue for fun and for learning
- A place to stimulate learning
- A place to explore and share culture and experience
- A place to use resources
- An opportunity to develop life-skills

Ingrid Watts described the value of the museum as a venue for learning, a place to stimulate learning, a place to explore and share cultures, a place to use resources and to develop life skills. Making the trip to the museum was an experience in itself, because of having to use maps and public transport.

In the museum, the group was able to make connections between what they saw and what they already knew. They compared the Yemeni Souk, for example, with dwellings in Saudi Arabia. The seaport, the boats the imports and exports helped develop a sense of connection with places they have left behind. Talking about and naming objects also aided language skills. Museum collections enable a very visual way of learning to help those for whom English is not the first language.

Objects also enable different learning styles to be used that do not focus on language. A Sailor's Talk at the Maritime Museum was a practical hands-on activity – passing around jars for participants to identify what was in it through smell. Even participants who did not know the words were able to convey their meaning through mime and demonstration. Ingrid Watts felt that without these experiences at the museum there would have been less sharing of the two cultures and limited development of life-skills.

The significance of the museum to the young women visiting from the Centre included:

- Enjoyment
- Broadening knowledge of the city, it's facilities and environment
- Introducing the museum
- Increasing confidence (finding out how to make the visit, how to use the museum building, finding out that it offered appropriate (vegetarian) food for Muslims)
- Finding out how to use the museum for their own and their children's learning
- Linking the familiar and the new
- Learning in a different way (through mime, when language skills are not in place)

- Linking the museum and popular culture
- Increasing language skills

## Teenagers at the Museum of Liverpool Life

This group was being educated outside mainstream school because of their various challenges as refugees, especially language, and thus the museums represented vital resources for their learning across a range of dimensions.

During the discussions and observations at the Museum of Liverpool Life it was found that the participants could demonstrate a variety of learning outcomes from their experiences, which included new life-skills, increased subject knowledge and improved language skills.

For the young people from the Community College their museum visits were an essential part of their learning. Their tutor said: "In the museum [they can] talk about real things... in the classroom we have to set up role play to get them to talk each other about their backgrounds... [But in the museum it is a] real experience... [They are] using English in a real situation." As a social experience the impact of the museum was also strong. The tutor talked about how the young people were developing relationships between themselves and the lecturers through the visits, which was an important experience because "these kids, a lot of them don't go out, especially the girls. [They are] only allowed to go to school and back again." In this way the museum was not only able to enhance the curriculum at the college but also enhance and broaden the life experiences of the students.

This group had been using National Museums Liverpool every few weeks for a range of purposes, including visiting the Grossology exhibition, art workshops with an artist, a visit behind the scenes of the natural history galleries, a visit to a nature centre with the Natural History curator, a visit to the Egyptian galleries, and an African batik workshop. Further visits were planned to the Planetarium and the Titanic exhibition. Dance workshops were also planned.

Some of the pupils and their tutor described the learning outcomes in detail:

- Learning about the city and the countryside, both orientating themselves geographically and gathering historical information
- Learning about English culture, which enables them to recognise and grasp references in books they read
- Specific language-based follow-up uses the museum experience to extend vocabulary and understanding
- They used knowledge gained in earlier visits on the later visits (i.e. they identified birds (greenfinches) they had seen on the trip to the nature centre when they saw the bird skins behind the scenes at the museum)
- Social interaction and relationships are encouraged (these teenagers came from a large number of diverse countries and did not know each other prior to the involvement with the college they made friends during the museum visit and told each other their often harrowing stories)
- Deeper relationships with the lecturers and other adults were facilitated
- The motivation to find out more was stimulated
- The possibility of return visits was raised

- Students became aware of possibilities for work-placements or volunteer work
- They developed an enthusiasm to learn because of the often slightly bizarre museum experiences (we were told a story by one boy that involved snake pee! This had aroused his interest to discover more about snakes).



## Issues concerning refugees and asylum seekers

## Barriers to participation and some solutions

Discussions with key workers revealed much about the potential barriers that refugees and asylum seekers face when visiting museums, and also showed how these barriers could be overcome.

Barriers include:

- Language spoken by participants
- Language of signage (English only)
- Frightening buildings
- Lack of floor plans
- Food can I eat it?
- Lack of prayer rooms
- Lack of knowledge of museums and that they are free
- Unfamiliarity about what museums are for and how to use them
- Don't know museums can cope with children

Ingrid Watts described these as problems that could relate to many different public buildings: many of these are related to language barriers for example lack of pictures in guide books, lack of clear floor plans and lack of sign posting in different

languages. Museums were also "frightening buildings" as very often participants were unable to see inside.

However the relationship with the museum helped to break these barriers by enabling participants to "go in and experience the welcome" and understand that museums are free and, more importantly, for them.

The enthusiasm of the three participants interviewed at the Bilingual Centre to return to the museum reinforced the value of these visits – they felt more confident, were able to "gossip with friends, with teacher" and enjoyed having more space in which to "play" with their children. One student from the community college who was from Pakistan talked about how he had not known about museums and that facilitates like this did not exist in his country (this was his perception). He enjoyed the visit so much that he brought his family to see the museum and is interested to find out more about Egyptian mummies and visit more museums.

However, it seems clear that refugees and asylum seekers are best approached through the agencies that are working with them and that this is best done after the initial difficulties of finding somewhere to live and managing the basics. The most successful contacts came through educational agencies such as the Further Education College and the Bi-lingual Centre; less successful were attempts to make contact through Resettlement Offices and Local Authority Housing agencies.

# The value of museums to these groups

### Providing links between old familiar worlds and new worlds

Museums can provide some stability and familiarity for those whose lives are in flux e.g. using collections to show the familiar (Yemeni Souk, Somali boat) and relate them to the unfamiliar culture (England).

#### Establishing a sense of place

Museums can help new and migrant populations to establish a sense of place in their new home city, to better understand the context of the city by introducing its history and environment. To provide access to material culture some familiar from their cultures and new objects, which help make sense of their new home.

Museums are well placed to offer a dual role to help establish a sense of this country, but also to demonstrate the significance of worldwide cultures; they give significance to diverse cultural material.

#### Broadening experiences and horizons and extending skills of citizenship

In Liverpool the museum played a vital role in providing new experiences and broadening the horizons of young people and families. A greater involvement in the life and potential of the city.

The museum visit provided experiences of large city centre-based buildings, extending the experiences and building confidence in using the city centre.

The free museum is especially important for refugees and asylum seekers on low incomes.

Museums provide tangible experiences to develop language skills for refugees and asylum seekers.

## 10.4.5 Critical success factors- Project and partnership management

A project worker with skills and experience in <u>both</u> fields of work (museums and specific section of community; in this case – asylum seekers and refugees) and who is supported through effective management by the museum It is vital to build and sustain the trust of community group leaders. Those who worked with the project worker at Liverpool knew she had relevant experience and consequently were confident about her role e.g. Ingrid Watts commented that Anna was able to make a real difference because she had time to focus on the needs of the asylum seekers and adapt existing provision successfully. While this is vital for all engagement with communities, it is utterly essential when working within a short period of time. Anna was able to make an impact quickly because she had contacts and networks within the city which enabled her to fast-track this short-term project. In addition, Liverpool was successful because there was clear support on a regular basis within the museum for the project worker. The project enabled the museum to focus on the needs of the target group and successfully accommodate their needs within the established provision.

While Leicester had identified a real need to work with refugees and asylum seekers in the city and was committed to the concept of the project, in reality a number of factors combined to work against the achievement of successful outcomes. These included the lack of management and direction from the museum – there seemed to be a limited framework of support on a day-to-day basis, either in developing appropriate activities, or in practical matters. In part this was because the museum was already engaged in other projects, was acting as the Hub leader, and was experiencing local authority cut-backs and reorganisation during the life of this project. The project worker was committed and hard-working, but had insufficient relevant skills and knowledge. While he was experienced in working with refugees and asylum seekers elsewhere, he did not have prior knowledge of Leicester and of the refugee and asylum-seekers agencies and networks in the city. In addition, he had no previous museum experience, which meant that he did not know how to use internal informal communication networks, and he was physically separated from the other professional staff, being housed on his own in a historic house, and this increased the difficulties. The isolation of the project worker within the museum service, combined with his lack of museum experience, meant that a fast-track approach was much more problematic and difficult to achieve, and little day-to-day management support was given to assist with this.

# Two models to develop the project – an 'outreach' model and a 'marketing' model

There was a contrast in the two museums in relation to the existing level of engagement in work with this new audience.

Liverpool built on existing work with refugees and asylum seekers (the Paul Hamlyn Foundation Celebrating Diversity) and used this project to improve their provision through a dedicated project-worker. Their method of making contact with refugees and asylum seekers used a classic 'outreach model', where long-term relationships are fostered, contacts are made with community agencies, and sustainability is regarded as essential. In this model, the growth of work in the long-term is slow but steady, building organically as it grows. Clarity of strategic objectives, combined with management of networks and relationships is essential. A different approach was attempted in Leicester. Here, what might be characterised as a 'marketing approach' was used. This involved leafleting specific areas and specific groups to encourage people to attend large-scale one-off events. Through this it was hoped to attract large numbers of refugees and asylum seekers and to raise awareness of the museum. This marketing rather than outreach model was problematic as it did not lead to strong relationships being established with specific refugee and asylum seekers organisations; consequently it was difficult to identify specifically how the museum could relate to the needs of refugee and asylum seekers, it also made sustainability almost impossible.

### A strong museum-based theme

In terms of subject-matter, the events at Leicester seemed remote from the museum and there was little evidence of pathways to the museum being established. There was a lack of a clear museum-related thematic focus to the project. It was hard to see how balloon-modelling and singing competitions enabled the museums to play a unique role. There was no evidence of pathways being created by the event which would lead refugees and asylum seekers to the museums or that would open up the specific roles they can play. While one of the events took place in the community in the St Matthews area the event was not rooted in the community, rather, the community centre was used as a venue.

In Liverpool, the museum collections enabled participants to link their old and new lives and to feel a sense of ownership of the museums.

### High expectations of learning outcomes and overall impact of the project

A difference was noted in the level of expectations of outcomes from the project in the two museums. In Liverpool, museum and community-based staff were articulate about what they felt participants might have gained, and on talking to the participants themselves, their feelings about what they had gained matched these perspectives well. At Leicester, neither museum nor community-based staff were able to articulate in any convincing way any ideas about what participants might have gained from their involvement in the events.

#### Meaningful long-term relationships in the community

Building relationships between communities is a long-term process which cannot be achieved through one-off events. Unless community engagement is developed with mutual engagement, care and respect, the work is in danger of being seen in a negative way and being counter-productive.

# 10.5 Moving Minds Case study: Imperial War Museum North

# 10.5.1 Overview

Moving Minds brought together the Imperial War Museum North with Bradford Museums, Galleries and Heritage, and Leeds Museums and Galleries to develop projects based around the building of understanding and trust between different communities, ethnicities and ages, and different creative ways of resolving conflict. Community groups used the collections of the participating museums to stimulate discussion about their lives today and in the past, and worked with artists to create work that reflected upon their ideas about migration, culture and identity.

The finished work was displayed in yurts; lightweight structures originating in Mongolia which are used as easily moveable homes. Modern yurts are used by aid agencies to build refugee camps and act as temporary hospitals and schools. In past and present times, yurts have been used to house communities - in the same way this project aimed to build communities for the life of the project.

This project contributed towards inclusion by targeting non-museum visitors in their localities, particularly young people, encouraging them to become involved in the life of a museum. It also contributed towards community cohesion by creating opportunities for young people to interact with others from inside and outside their own communities.

The concept of the project was innovative and ambitious, and strong learning outcomes were expected for the young people participating. This case study focused on Imperial War Museum North, the lead partner of the project. The aim of the case-study was to review the complex, multi-layered approach in the light of community cohesion.



# Figure 10.5: Organisational map showing the relationship of the case study to the *Moving Minds* project as a whole

# 10.5.2 Research processes

Jocelyn Dodd and Ceri Jones visited the Imperial War Museum North on Thursday 5<sup>th</sup> February 2004.

At the museum, the researchers met Head of the Learning and Access, Debbie Walker, project co-ordinator Wendy Orr and Imperial War Museum North project leader Simon Austin. The first visit was to Burnage High School to see a group of ten pupils from Year 10 who had been working on an animation project around migration and conflict. In the event it was not possible to meet the teacher or the group because of the death of a pupil that morning in school. It was possible however to interview the animation artist, Beth Senior, and a discussion took place with Simon Austin. Returning to the Imperial War Museum, an observation took place of a group of young Chinese teenagers from Cedar Mount High School, working on a project with Wai Yin Chinese Centre and the Ahmed Igbal Ullah Race Relations Archive. The group of nine Year 10 students were working with an artist to create a film of interviews with Chinese elders at the Wai Yin Centre. During the observed session, the students were working on a collage of pictures to accompany the interviews. Four students were interviewed, along with Anne Hardy, Diversity and Inclusion worker at the Race Relations Archives and Jemma Collins, the artist. A further interview was held with Debbie Walker, Head of Learning and Access for the Imperial War Museum North, and Wendy Orr, Moving Minds project co-ordinator.

# 10.5.3 The project and activities

The group of students from Burnage High School for Boys worked on an animation project based on the themes of conflict, migration and resolution. They visited the Imperial War Museum North to get ideas and inspiration, and then worked with an animator at school to produce a series of short films. The boys were encouraged to really think about the experiences of refugees, asylum seekers and other people affected by migration and conflict, collecting pictures, words and articles to create mood boards. Using the mood boards, the students wrote stories around the main themes, turning them into comic strips, which were then translated into sophisticated animated films using computer software. The group also attended a Winter Festival event in Bradford to meet other Manchester schools involved in *Moving Minds* and engage in activities together.

The Year 10 students from Cedar Mount School worked with an artist to produce a video of oral history interviews with elders from the Chinese community. The students had interviewed the Elders at the Wai Yin community centre individually and in groups, learning how to interview, use a microphone / tape recorder and video recording equipment. On the afternoon of RCMG's visit, the students had visited the museum for the first time that morning to get inspiration from the exhibitions for a collage they were making as a group during the observed session in the afternoon. This would inform the design and backgrounds for their finished film sequences.

# 10.5.4 Key findings

### Impact on young people

### Impact on teenage boys

The artists and project workers were explicit that the impact of the project on the young people concerned was significant. At Burnage High School for Boys, a group of teenagers from diverse backgrounds, were very focused on creating their animation piece for the project and had benefited in terms of:

- Thinking in a sophisticated way about abstract themes and translating them into a piece of animation e.g. war, conflict and migration
- Experiencing the effects of migration and conflict through visiting the IWM North and discussing ideas in depth with the artist, who encouraged them to think about personal stories
- Meeting other schools participating in the project in Bradford and trying screen-printing
- Learning to use animation software packages as a tool for art, rather than an end in its self
- Bonded as a group team working instead of working in established friendship groups
- Focused and on task- motivated

The teenage boys had been able to develop their ideas from initial concepts on paper to sophisticated animation shorts. The impact upon the participants was generated through the skills of the artist who was a trained teacher in animation and who placed great importance on both teaching and learning.



### Impact on Chinese teenagers

The Chinese students from Cedar Mount High School were observed and interviewed at the IWMN. The worker from the Race Relations Archive and the artist talked about the impact of the project upon the group:

- Students had come out of themselves and were asking more questions "reputation for being studious and very quiet"
- Increased confidence from interviewing others as a part of oral history work
- Increase their sense of place and identity importance of Chinese community in Manchester
- Making new friends amongst their community (students had not met before)
- Access to the Wai Yin Centre "This is here for us?"

The students also talked about the impact upon their own learning:

- Enjoyed working with other Chinese students language and cultural similarities, "working with people [from the same culture] helps me be less shy"
- Art was enjoyable "everything for yourself and what you think you can draw rather than somebody telling you"
- Learnt more about the past and their culture through hearing and talking about personal experiences
- New skills video recording, interviewing
- More confident and "speaking more openly"

### Individual learning identified

One student identified his own learning outcomes using the table of Generic Learning Outcomes:

Knowledge and understanding	Learning about the past
Skills	Video recording, interviewing skills
Attitudes and values	He felt that elders were more valued in Chinese communities than in the West, and he already enjoyed this relationship so the project did not change this for him
Enjoyment, inspiration, creativity	Enjoying the project, being creative with video and making collage
Action, behaviour, progression	He felt he could learn faster in the museum because the project was progressing rapidly through specific identifiable steps over a long period of time (whole afternoons)

### Problems with being out of school?

Some of the Chinese students were unclear why they had been taken out of school and were worried about the impact this would have on their school work, "We get there [to Science] and we don't know what we are doing" (Chinese student). In addition, some of the group were very new to the UK and still finding their feet in a general way.

### **Understanding Chinese cultures**

Bringing the group of Chinese students together as a 'Chinese' group seemed to be premised on the idea that there is only one Chinese identity. In fact the students represented people from Vietnam, Hong Kong and the diverse provinces of China. The length of time that the students had been in the UK also varied considerably. Some were very newly arrived in England, and some who were long-term citizens of the UK or had been born in England, so their experiences were very different. Increased knowledge of diverse Chinese identities and of Chinese art and culture would have enabled a better understanding of the participants, their families and backgrounds.

### Understanding the needs of the Chinese teenagers

There seemed to be a lack of understanding about the Chinese students themselves, with the Race Relations Archive worker saying they were all high achievers in school (so there was no problem over them missing school for this project) but the artist commented that they were low achievers at school so this project would give them something to be proud of.

The project did not seem to have any sense of the students needs, but was driven by other agendas.

### Impact on communities

### Chinese elders and inter-generational links

This project illustrates the value to communities of having a voice. The Chinese elders enjoyed being part of the project because they felt an interest was shown in their lives and their stories. They enjoyed talking to young people because it was keeping alive the culture and showing that young people are still interested in their culture. "[Its] not until you get old yourself that you understand the value of it" [Anne Hardy, Diversity and Inclusion worker at the Race Relations Archives]. Community cohesion was increased (to a small degree) through inter-generational links.

#### Different agencies working in partnership towards similar ends

The Race Relations Archive is contributing to community cohesion by encouraging learning between communities. Part of their work, entitled *Exploring our roots*, is to document community history in collaboration with schools. Pupils are encouraged to collect oral histories from their communities to increase their own understanding, raise awareness about that community amongst other communities in the city and increase access to local history through the archives. *Moving Minds* linked into the work being done by the Archive and enabled them to be more ambitious e.g. they had not worked with an artist before. The Archives will use the completed interviews with the Elders, collected by the Chinese students, to increase awareness of the Chinese community and their contribution to Manchester.

### 10.5.5 Partnerships and project management

### Mutual benefits to the project

One factor in successful project development is to work with partners who have relevant skills and experience in place. The partnership was mutually beneficial for the museum and the Race Relations Archive. The Race Relations Archive is used to working with community groups collecting oral history, and it was interested in the Chinese community and its place in Manchester's history. Working with IWM North raised the profile for the Race Relations Archive. The partnership benefited the IWM North, as it enabled access to new community groups. Working with this project also benefited the Chinese community, which tends to be rather isolated, and makes fewer demands than other community groups. This project made this community more visible.

### Long-term benefit to the museums?

It is unclear whether the partnerships between the museums will be sustained in the long term. There were no existing links and no strong structural reason for the museums to work together apart from the project itself.

### Very good project management

The project was well-managed by the project co-ordinator, who acted as a stabilising influence on all three museums involved and was very confident and able - a successful model of partnership management.

### Rather too ambitious? Concept not fully developed?

The IWM North was involved in six projects – was this too ambitious? The management structure ensured that the project was managed well but the idea behind the Moving Minds project was perhaps not strong enough, not fully developed, or not articulated strongly enough, to hold the various participants in the project together. Not all the groups were sure about the connection to yurts, although this was one of the main ideas behind the project

### Multiple challenges for the IWM North and its partners

A number of challenges were identified for this project, and not all were fully resolved.

- A new national organisation, still developing ways of managing itself, was working with new regional partners. A very high level of new procedures, processes and strategies were required
- The Moving Minds project was complex, with multiple strands within it. Although there was a unifying idea, this did not seem to tie the strands together well
- There was a lack of capacity within the museum profession to fulfil the roles for the project; recruitment was problematic
- The commitment of the partners to the project was undermined by delays in the recruitment of project workers (Bradford) and in significant restructuring of positions in the City Council (Leeds); thus time and effort was compromised on several fronts
- The short time scale of the project meant that events moved very quickly

### Employing workers with the relevant skills and knowledge

This project illustrates the importance of understanding the needs of the young people involved. The animation project engaged the teenage boys with the themes of conflict and migration and resulted in highly individual films, as a result of the skill of the artist in understanding the needs of the group. The project with the Chinese students seemed less powerful in its impact as there lacked a similar understanding of the young people by the artist, and as a result the young people seemed less

engaged in the project. Also, one of the young people was concerned that displaying the work at school would bring unwelcome attention to the Chinese students as she had already experienced some racism at school.

# **10.6. Partners in Time Case study: Imperial War Museum Duxford**

# 10.6.1 Overview

*Partners in Time* built on the existing outreach programme at Imperial War Museum Duxford to deliver two programmes of activity around History and Science and Technology to schools in the Eastern regions. IWM Duxford worked in partnership with Norfolk Museums and Archaeology Service to deliver the History outreach programme and with Luton Museums Service and Mid Anglia SATRO Ltd to deliver the Science and Technology outreach programme. Schools from deprived areas in both counties were targeted.

Schools were invited to take part in the programmes, which consisted of an outreach visit to the school followed by two visits to museums chosen by the school. Travel was subsidised in order to increase access for schools where transports costs are a significant barrier to visiting. The aim of the project was to encourage teachers to be more actively involved with museums and to demonstrate how artefacts and museum collections can be used in imaginative ways to support the knowledge and skills development of students.

The interest for RCMG in *Partners in Time* focused upon the use of objects and handling collections by the museum to support skills development in young people; the delivery of outreach sessions on Science and Technology (which are not always common in museums); and to examine some of the barriers to accessing museums for a small rural school in Norfolk.



### 10.6.2 Research processes

Two separate visits were made to the project to observe the issues as outlined above. The researchers who visited were Eilean Hooper-Greenhill, Helen O'Riain and Jenny Woodward.

Helen O'Riain and Jenny Woodward made the first visit on Wednesday 11<sup>th</sup> February 2004 to Northrepps Primary School near Cromer in Norfolk. The school is a very small rural school of only 29 pupils, close to the Norfolk coast. The headteacher operates an "open-door" policy at the school and they are keen to have new people into the school to give the pupils new experiences that they might not otherwise have. A History outreach session from IWM Duxford was observed in which all the pupils from both KS1 and KS2 participated: the school had already made one visit to Norwich Castle Museum a few months before. The session, which was held in the village hall because the school was too small to accommodate it, emphasised the development of questioning and thinking skills through activities with museum objects. After the session, interviews were held with the two class teachers from the school, Stuart Travis and Gill Leah, the Head teacher, Sue Travis, the History outreach teacher who led the session, Sue Graves, and Joyce Murdoch, project coordinator from IWM Duxford.

During the discussions, many of the issues that rural schools in deprived and isolated areas face and the barriers that exist around visiting museums emerged. The school had already made one visit as part of the project but was unable to make a second visit due to the constraints of time and the curriculum, the age range of the pupils, and difficulties related to transport despite the subsidy offered by IWM Duxford. The school was very proactive and keen to take up opportunities for outreach in order to provide a broader range of experiences for their pupils, who live very insular lives and rarely travel further than Cromer. The teachers valued the chance to use real artefacts that the students could handle (often hard to obtain in schools) and the emphasis on a questioning and problem-solving approach to History. They were very positive about the benefits of the session for the pupils and hoped to be able to incorporate some of the activities into their future teaching. It was very early to distinguish learning outcomes for the pupils but they were clearly engaged and enthusiastic during the activities.

At IWM Duxford on Thursday 26<sup>th</sup> February 2004, Eilean Hooper-Greenhill, Helen O'Riain and Jenny Woodward observed two classes involved in science and technology-related sessions. One school from Luton had brought a KS1 class for a session on *Why things fly* following an outreach session to the school. The school was from an urban area and was very multi-ethnic – they were much more representative of the type pf school represented in the project than Northrepps School. The children enjoyed the interactive element of the session and most were able to understand the concepts introduced to them. A KS2 group from a rural school in Bedfordshire looked at Structures, the characteristics of which could be observed in the museum buildings and collections. This second session also had an interactive element, with the students using what they had learned in the morning to construct their own structures in the afternoon. This older group demonstrated very clear learning outcomes and also enjoyed their session at the museum. Interviews were held with Peter Halford, Science teacher at IWM Duxford who led the session on structures, and Alan Rowe from Mid Anglia SATRO Ltd (Science and Technology

Regional Organisation) who were delivering the science and technology programme for IWM Duxford.

The visits related to this project demonstrated many positive outcomes for the schools, museums and organisations involved.

# 10.6.3 The project and activities

Pupils from Northrepps School had already made a visit to Norwich Castle Museum and were taking part in a History outreach session, held in the village hall. The children went round different tables, differentiated according to their Key Stage, and engaged in a number of actives around objects – guessing what they were, looking closely, pairing like objects together and discussing their ideas in groups. The activities were designed to increase their skills of deduction, questioning and observation across the History curriculum.

At Duxford, two schools from the Luton region were taking part in separate sciencerelated sessions. The first school looked at *Why things fly* – they revised concepts they learnt from an earlier outreach session, experimented with paper aeroplanes, learnt the importance of aerofoil and thrust, and watched demonstrations of flight. Pupils from the second school took part in a session around *Structures* – they looked at examples of structures around Duxford, thought about concepts, looked at shapes, learnt that STRUCTURES need to be STRONG, STABLE, and STIFF, and considered what made buildings strong. In the afternoon they put these concepts into practice by building their own structures in groups.

# 10.6.4 Key findings

## Impact on teachers and pupils

The observation of sessions and discussions with teachers and project workers at Northrepps and IWM Duxford revealed strong evidence of learning impact. While the pupils learnt subject-related knowledge and skills, teachers became more aware of the power of museums in learning.

### Value of using objects

The value of using objects across the curriculum linked to the children's engagement with objects: "You could do that with lots and lots of things couldn't you? Because it brings out the vocabulary doesn't it? And everybody's waiting to hear what somebody else is saying so they were quite engaged even when they're not touching. And they're waiting for the next go" (Gill Leah, class teacher).

Teachers at Northrepps were aware of the benefits of using objects as part of teaching: "I mean you try and do the reasoning and speaking and listening all the time, don't you? But when they've got something that they can handle... it gives them a purpose I suppose" (Steve Travis, class teacher). It was very early to see strong learning outcomes but children learnt new vocabulary and increased their understanding of 19<sup>th</sup> century objects. The important emphasis was on skills with children learning observation, questioning, deduction, and classification skills

amongst others. There was also evidence of deductive thinking; one pupil said: "I think there isn't anything plastic on [this table] because it hadn't been invented yet." The children enjoyed the session and were engaged for a longer period than the teachers expected.

Sue Graves who led the outreach session also commented on the enjoyment demonstrated by the children: "Well I think, what I hope and I know from feedback that I get from the children is that they find it, the session, fun. They find it exciting. And I think in a way that is their inspiration, because it's given them an enthusiasm to want to do it again."

### Skills development

The emphasis of the project was supporting skills-based development in pupils and a positive outcome from the sessions is that where follow-up visits to museums had been made, children were demonstrating their new skills: "a general feedback that I've had has been that when schools have visited a museum after they've had an outreach session, they've noticed that the children get a lot more out of their visit because they're immediately homed in on the questions, they remember the questions that they were asked by Sue... and they're thinking, looking, what's it made from, why would it be made from that , are there any bits that move, thinking about those questions" (Joyce Murdoch).



## Improved behaviour, and progression

Teachers also noticed a change in behaviour from their pupils, they are more focused rather than running around: "And the teacher that I was speaking to said it's quite remarkable, the difference in their attitude when they came into the museum... they were very much more homed in" (Joyce Murdoch).

### Accessing new experiences because of the museum's access strategy

The benefits of outreach for Northrepps school was that it enabled the children to have new experiences without the barriers imposed by travel and access difficulties.

Outreach is part of Duxford's wide learning and access strategy: "[outreach] breaks down the barrier for a lot of children or those who would perhaps think a museum's a place that isn't for me, it's not appropriate for me... And I think having somebody coming out from the museum and working in school on their level, on their turf... makes a big difference and again that's something we found from our own outreach programme, which has developed into a partnership thing. We're partnering the schools for a term and breaking down barriers, it's building on that." The outreach sessions also fulfilled the function of enabling children of all abilities to benefit: "This is a beauty of these sessions [that] a child who traditionally fails because they're not very good at reading, or they're not very good at writing can succeed hugely in a session like this because it's all verbal, all ideas are taken on board, everyone can do their bit and occasionally the most unexpected people come up with the right answer" (Joyce Murdoch).

Obtaining objects for the classroom was difficult so having the museum's involvement was really beneficial: "...when I was doing Toys, past and present, parent's toys, that was fine we sent letters home and parents could send in a few things... but it's not the same and you're too frightened really to get the children to do much touching and that kind of thing. I brought in my teddy bear, that's fine, you can break that, you can try, but you know, you're lucky really aren't you if you can get resources" (Gill Leah, class teacher).



#### Remembering and applying concepts

The session at the museum with a KS1 class from a school in Luton showed how the skills and concepts learned in an outreach session could be used during the museum visit. The children were able to remember the visit to their school and some of the concepts introduced to them. They got to grips with new vocabulary and increased

their understanding of difficult concepts e.g. an object moves in the opposite direction from the thrust. Like the other children observed, they were able to stay engaged throughout the session, although there was some restlessness towards the end, and clearly enjoyed the demonstrations.

### Practicing new skills and using new knowledge

The KS2 group at IWM Duxford looking at structures displayed strong learning outcomes. The strength of the session was that pupils were taught the concepts in the morning and in the afternoon could put their understanding into practice by building structures using K'nex construction kits. Pupils were able to demonstrate their understanding of symmetry and balance, design and construction skills – their class teacher commented that "They would not have made all these structures with triangles before – they've absorbed that from this morning." The pupils also worked well together in teams despite it being late in the day! An interesting issue was raised during this session about different learning styles suiting different genders. The class teacher commented, "The curriculum is in some ways very girlorientated... [Some boys] rarely fulfil their potential in class but love this hands-on approach, which isn't encouraged by the curriculum." Peter Halford, who delivered the science and technology sessions at Duxford, reinforced the importance of hands-on activities for supporting theoretical learning by enabling young people to put into practice everything they have learned.

### Barriers to using museums for rural schools

Interviews with teachers and project workers highlighted the barriers that rural schools face in accessing museums.

Northrepps Primary School was very proactive and keen to be involved in anything that could broaden the limited life experience of their pupils: "It's the outside world coming into Northrepps, because they're very insular. Some of these kids only go as far as Cromer, if they go as far as Norwich, they're sick!" (Sue Travis, head teacher).

This project presented an ideal opportunity, particularly the outreach session. However, although IWM Duxford were providing subsidies for schools to cover travel costs, with Northrepps it became clear that barriers to visiting were more than just the cost of travel.

- Very young children not used to travelling long distances
- Fitting museum visits into the curriculum "and we couldn't find one that could be done feasibly with a small number of children" (Gill Leah, class teacher)
- Coach companies not willing to travel "first thing in the morning and last thing in the afternoon, because they've already got contracts" (Gill Leah, class teacher) and the time it takes to travel means there is little time left to spend in the museum
- Difficulties of taking one year group and returning later because many children need taxis to take them home
- High ratio of adults needed to accompany children on trips

Alan Rowe of SATRO Ltd commented that barriers in rural Cambridge are very similar to those faced by Northrepps School, with cost of transport being the biggest barrier. Also the cost of coaches is very high: "There are no funds to subsidise [visits]... There are a lot of rich people in the county, in Cambridge and

Peterborough, but out in the sticks there is no money at all, no big companies to provide sponsorship, no manufacturing or industries... people have sold it to the US and made their money. There's a very extreme contrast."

One possibility that Gill Leah, class teacher, mentioned, was linking with other rural schools, something which Sue Graves also mentioned, as a way of overcoming barriers to visiting. However this was more of a long-term strategy, as visits would need to be integrated into rolling programmes so was not an immediate solution.

Deprivation in rural areas is more than about access as Sue Travis, head teacher, explained: "We have 50% free school meals [which means] the parents can't afford to pay for the coach." Also there is a huge gap between the idealised idea of country living and the reality: "It looks like a "picture-box" area but people retire from London and push the prices up. There are a lot of seasonal jobs and a lot of people on income support."

There is a discrepancy in rural communities between those who are proactive and those with low aspirations: "Lifelong learning is something we as a school are very interested in and want to promote [but we're] having a lot of local resistance because the community is split. The incomers are very keen on promoting the village but most of them are retired whereas the young mums – single parents, depressed – they don't see the benefits." (Sue Travis, head teacher).

IWM Duxford sought to overcome the main barriers through this project. While not all strategies were successful, the museum worked hard to counteract the excluding factors.

- Providing the transport subsidy "[Katrina Siliprandi, Education Officer, Norfolk Museums] made the point...that quite a few schools were coming to Duxford because they could afford the higher coach fares, because of the travel subsidy"
- Targeting schools where there are 25% free school meals. Free school meals are generally a good indicator of exclusion. However, this is not the case in rural areas where excluded children often live alongside extremely affluent children. Northrepps Primary School, which had 50% free school meals, was very unusual and was not representative of the schools that were able to take advantage of the museum's offer
- Trying to broaden children's awareness and raise aspirations: "a head teacher of a school in Norwich... says our children never leave this estate, they never go into the middle of Norwich, let alone anywhere else. They never ever would think of visiting a museum, it's not in the culture. And it's this changing basis, changing cultures... that we're trying so hard to do" (Joyce Murdoch)
- Challenging teachers' perceptions of what museums can offer to schools and raising awareness of the potential they offer: "breaking through [the perception that] museums are about knowledge and that's all it is, facts, to actually we're about more. We can develop skills, we can be crosscurricular..." There was some evidence from Norfolk that teachers were beginning to see the potential of museums: "[Katrina] as a result of the project, she has had teachers phoning and saying "We're doing Florence Nightingale, can you help?" where before she was very clear that the schools

were looking down the list of what is published and saying they can't do what we want... It's this whole opening up, it's the breaking down of barriers between museums, schools, parents, families, community... the mistaken cultural belief that museums aren't for us. You know, they're fusty, they're old, they're boring... and its breaking down the we haven't got time, we can't fit it in, there's too many other demands and you know, heaven knows being a teacher 14 years I have a huge amount of sympathy for that because there are so many demands made on teachers" (Joyce Murdoch)

 Developing the capacity of teachers to teach history and science and technology using different approaches was another important aspect of the project. Alan Rowe of SATRO explained they were encouraging teachers through the outreach and museums visits to see that "they can relate science and technology to wherever they are." Developing the confidence and skills of teachers in the physical sciences was a further aspect of the programme and especially that you are allowed to have fun teaching science

# 10.6. 5 Critical success factors

### Maintaining flexibility

Throughout the project, IWM Duxford has needed to be flexible to cope with issues of timescale and partnership. Firstly, fitting the programme into the curriculum has meant that some of the schools were unable to keep to the original programme. Two of the schools observed as part of the case study made their first visit to the museum before the outreach session and were unable to make a second visit. This meant that some schools were unable to put into practice their new skills in a museum environment as the programme had intended. A reason for this was the constraints of the timescale imposed by the project finding which meant both visits had to be taken by the end of March when many schools wanted to complete the second visit in the Summer term. IWM were able to be flexible "we didn't feel we could be hard and fast about it, it's just not realistic" (Joyce Murdoch). The timing of the project was the most challenging issue as the delay of the project finding meant schools only received information about the project on the very last day of the summer term. Working with SATRO Ltd to deliver the Science and Technology outreach also meant IWM Duxford had to be flexible because they had to fit into their established way of working. Was IWM Duxford being over ambitious to expect schools to have three museum contacts in the timescale?

### Managing the evaluation process

The evaluation process was an issue that had to be handled carefully and was managed variably by the museums on the DCMS/DfES programme. It worked at Duxford because they had planned in administrative support and set up a system for dissemination and completion of forms, with schools unable to claim back the travel subsidy unless they completed an evaluation form.

### Building on established procedures

The existing approach to outreach, which focused on using artefacts to teach historical themes, provided a solid basis on which to build new practices. A system of buses, drivers and booking procedures was already running smoothly and could be extended.

### A strong and simple theme with a clearly defined process

Although the title 'Partners in time' is not very indicative of specific content or educational approach, the strong shape of the project, guided by existing experience

and thoughtful partnership working, and disseminated through very clearly set out booklets for teachers, worked well. IWM Duxford was also proactive in contacting schools to persuade them to take up the project while it was available, though this time-scale did not always suit schools.

### 10.6.6 Benefits to the museums

### At IWM Duxford

- Beneficial partnerships with two regional museum services, which have a chance of being sustained
- Professional development, particularly for Joyce Murdoch, who came to work at IWM Duxford in 2001 from a teaching background. Managing all the different aspects of the project has enabled her to apply skills "to a world she didn't know", and working with different colleagues and museum services has broadened her knowledge of what museums are about
- Raising the internal profile of Duxford's education service through the DCMS/DfES funding
- Developing a new strand to the educational work, which extended good practice into science-based themes. This is a particularly significant outcome, given the general lack of confidence that primary teachers seem to feel in using museums to work with science-based themes
- Experimenting with applying the knowledge and skills learnt in the first educational session in a second session during the same visit. This will now be developed

### At Stockwood Craft Museum

The most successful example of building capacity in the regional museums was at Stockwood Craft Museum, which has benefited from training and support to develop its educational provision from scratch on this site.

### At Norfolk Museums Service

This did not form part of research for the case-study.

# 10.7 Understanding Slavery Case study: National Maritime Museum, National Museums Liverpool and British Empire and Commonwealth Museum, Bristol

# 10.7.1 Overview

The main aim of the Understanding Slavery project was to consult with teachers, students, community educators and community groups to evaluate resources and learning programmes which were developed around the sensitive and challenging subject of Slavery. In partnership with the National Maritime Museum, museums in Bristol and Liverpool explored the educational potential of their collections in relation to history, citizenship and identity, and used these collections as the starting point to develop new resources and projects for the teaching of slavery within the museum and the classroom. The legacy of slavery within society, the impact and implications of racism and the need to challenge misunderstandings and stereotypes were analysed. The project also sought to explore and raise awareness of the museums' potential to contribute to both formal learning and broader social and community citizenship initiatives.

The focus of this case-study was to identify the issues that emerged when tackling sensitive materials and challenging subject-matter.



# Figure 10.7 Organisational map showing the relationship of the case study to *Understanding Slavery*

## 10.7.2 Research process

Four researchers were involved in visiting the three museums and two schools that were part of this case study. Jocelyn Dodd and Ceri Jones visited National Museums

Liverpool on Sunday 14<sup>th</sup> March 2004; Eilean Hooper-Greenhill and Jenny Woodward visited the British Empire and Commonwealth Museum and St Thomas More Catholic Secondary School in Bristol on Wednesday 31<sup>st</sup> March 2004; and Jocelyn Dodd made two visits to London, first on Wednesday 24<sup>th</sup> March 2004 to Thomas Tallis School in Blackheath, London and the second on Thursday 1<sup>st</sup> April 2004 to meet the project manager.

At National Museums Liverpool, the two researchers observed *Connections*, an afternoon of events for visitors held at the Maritime Museum to mark the connection between Africa, the Caribbean and Europe. The activities observed included:

- African drumming workshop with Mamadou, a drummer from Senegal
- *Printing African Textiles* with Afrograph which enabled visitors to handle African textiles and experiment with making their own
- Pilot version of the CD-ROM developed as part of the project, a virtual tour of the Transatlantic Slave gallery bringing to life the testimony of witnesses to the slave trade
- Handling collections in the Transatlantic slave gallery
- Hillside High School, Bootle, performing the South African Gum Boot Dance in the museum foyer

Discussions were conducted with several of the museum staff involved in the project including Alex Robinson, Project Worker; Jacqui Bentley, Formal Education Officer and Julia Bryan, Principal Education Officer. An informal interview was also arranged with Chinedu Okolie, an actor and University student who performs the role of Kofi, a freed slave, on the CD-ROM. Chinedu had been particularly inspired by the story of Kofi and found the project an enriching experience as he increased his own awareness of the story and history of slavery.

In Bristol, a visit was made to St Thomas More Catholic Secondary School, one of the schools involved in the evaluation of resources being developed by the British Empire and Commonwealth Museum around slavery. It is an inner-city school with 550 pupils, 50% from ethnic minorities - Chinese, Asian, African, Eastern European - and recent immigrants from a range of countries (Somalia and Zimbabwe, for example). The school was in special measures facing threat of closure. Interviews were held with Linda Kear, the member of staff responsible for ethnic minorities, and three of the students who had been involved in the museum consultation. The students had been involved in four, day-long workshops at BECM over four weeks covering varied activities such as drama, role-play, script-writing, watching videos and radio workshops with a final performance in April at the school. Their experiences and opinions were to feed into the existing workshops at BECM in order to improve the offer for schools. Overall it had been a positive experience for the school, with one student in particular demonstrating a profound impact in terms of her learning experience. However, the school felt there had been a misunderstanding between the needs of the school and the museum's delivery, which led to some negative feedback from the member of staff.

At the British Empire and Commonwealth Museum, the researchers observed the existing slavery workshop during the afternoon, involving handling collections and a session in the radio room. Interviews were held with a number of museum staff connected to the project: Anna Farthing, drama workshop co-ordinator (freelance); Katherine Hann, head of education and interpretation; Dan Olu, project co-ordinator; Dharani Naidoo, museum education officer; and Lorna Heaysman, freelance artist and community worker. A number of positive benefits to consultation with schools

and community groups were discussed with the staff and the impact of the learning experience upon the students. The partnership with St Thomas More School was found to have raised some challenges for the museum and these had not been entirely resolved. Furthermore, some issues around project management and capacity were discussed but overall the museum seemed to be working positively to develop resources around slavery.

Two visits were made to London. On 24 March, an interview was held with Maria Amidu, project manager of Understanding Slavery, to get an overview of the project and to identify issues relating to management and delivery. Some interesting matters were raised such as the challenges of the short timescale in dealing with such a challenging and sensitive subject and the need for long-term commitment from the museum partners. A second visit on the 1 April was made to Thomas Tallis School in Blackheath following the advice of the project manager after a successful consultation session between the National Maritime Museum and a group of students from the school. It had been intended to observe a session or workshop at the National Maritime Museum itself but unfortunately this fell through. A focus group was instead held with six students, aged 13-14 years, at the school, which discussed the experience they had at the museum and the impact it had had upon them. It had been a positive experience for them and they displayed a range of learning outcomes, including increased knowledge and understanding of slavery and its effects, and they all appreciated the opportunity to see real objects from museum collections. However slavery was not related to their curriculum - the students were studying World War II - and they had not discussed the visit in class so the opportunity to reinforce the learning had not been taken. It was hoped to be able to interview the class teacher about his perspectives of the students' learning but despite several attempts it was not possible to go ahead with an interview.

# 10.7.3 The project and activities

The event at National Museums Liverpool was aimed at the general public, looking at different perspectives of Africa, the Caribbean and Slavery. Activities across the Maritime Museum included story-telling sessions, food tasting, a drumming workshop, tour of slavery-related landmarks in the city, preview of the CD-ROM developed by the Museum for the Transatlantic Slavery Gallery and students from Hillside High School performing the Gum Boot Dance.

Students from St Thomas More School were taking part in sessions at the British Empire and Commonwealth Museum to test new resources for schools developed around Transatlantic Slavery. They were involved in drama workshops, radio-plays, handling sessions and varied activities. A second group at the museum of young people from the local community were creating artworks in response to objects from the museum's collections for an exhibition.

Thomas Tallis School visited the National Maritime Museum for a consultation session around resources developed for schools by the Museum. They looked at different types of resources, including drama, role-play, worksheets, handling collections and online, and were encouraged to give their opinions about the usefulness and relevance of each resource to their learning.
#### 10.7.4 Key findings

#### Impact on young people

The young people involved with the project in general felt it to be an important and positive learning experience. A range of different learning outcomes were found, including one example of a pupil who found that her school teachers and their methods suited her better than the staff she encountered at the museum.

#### Inspired to learn more

One of the actors involved in the CD-ROM felt that the experience of acting out the story of a freed slave, Kofi, was "enriching" and very inspiring because of the determination of the character to improve his circumstances – "If any [outcome], it made me want to learn more."

#### Inspired to work harder; making a personal connection

The project had a profound emotional impact on one 14-year old girl (L) from St Thomas More School, who described how the experience had made her determined to show what she could do: "If I wasn't gonna try before, I would try now, because the sort of people who don't believe in Black people, I would try just to show them... It inspired me in a different way that I haven't been inspired before. It makes you feel that learning, pushing yourself is actually worth something. Sometimes you think what's the point, but if you went to the museum, you think well it is actually worth something, that pride and dignity that they took away from the slaves it's worth giving it back to them."

The staff who led the workshop were aware that the backgrounds of some of the students influenced their responses: "The key thing was that most of these kids were Black or from a Caribbean background...There were 3 white kids in the room, if T was there. Their experience of their own family history, their understanding and interest in it is 'why aren't we taught this?' – for that particular group we were following the strength that was their particular background. (L), she'll tell you that her grandfather was a slave" (Anna Farthing).

#### **Relevant histories**

All the young people recognised the importance of learning about slavery, even if they did not engage as powerfully as the pupil above. Students aged 14 years from Thomas Tallis School agreed that it was important to learn about it because it was part of history and still relevant today:

Boy – I reckon it's there for like some people to learn, because for some people it's like part of their heritage and they may need to explore it and kind of face it. JD - I mean, do you feel its part of everybody's... that everybody needs to know about it?

Boy – Because it's like an historical event. Racism's still quite a big thing today and it's still like that extreme racism - you still need to know about it. To be like educated about it.

#### Linking prior experiences and new knowledge

A second girl (S) from Thomas Tallis School was able to make links between the information she learned during the sessions and a visit she had made to Ghana – she had not understood the connection with slavery but was able to do so following the visit to the museum: "I think I mostly learned about conditions, yeah coz like I went to a place in Ghana where they put all the slaves and I saw some of the rooms and everything and it was disgusting and smelly. And where I didn't really know anything about slaves... it just wasn't anything in my head and like when they went to

the museum and they were like talking about everything...[it made her think about it again]"

#### Learning more

A third student (T) from St. Thomas More (a boy) did not make such strong connections, nor experience such a strong emotional impact. "It was quite fun, I found out a lot I didn't know, all about slavery. I didn't know anything about slavery before." The teacher's interpretation of his lukewarm response was that he felt overpowered by the Black students; as one of the few white pupils in the group, he might have felt uncomfortable with the nature of the material.

#### Preferring more familiar ways of learning

Not all students enjoyed the museum experience more than work at school. For at least one student (J), her familiar teachers and their ways of working were more effective: "We were sitting down and talking about slaves and it wasn't long enough. It didn't make sense to us. It wasn't as good as the drama we did in school. It was kind of weird for us as well." She was not able to connect to the material or find it a positive experience.

#### Appreciating consultation

For the teachers interviewed, the fact that young people were being consulted was very positive: "You have to get their participation, negotiation, and you know, get them to have a relationship with you and then they will do what they feel is for you... not for them as it takes a little while before they realise that its for them..." (Linda Kear). The students of Thomas Tallis school felt it was important to be involved in the process: "Usually it's just like the teacher's responsibility, but if you're actually handpicked and you have to [look at things] it makes you feel important."

#### Value of real objects

Using real objects enables students to have much richer experiences and bring them closer to understanding the reality of the history. They are also experiences that could not happen in the classroom - "Like the girl today who tried on the shackles, she said later in the feedback how she felt really trapped. Words and experiences come out that wouldn't in the classroom" (Dharani Naidoo, museum education officer). Many of the students interviewed appreciated the chance to look and handle real objects. For L it enabled her to understand more about the slave experience: "We'd look at objects, slave whips... I was guite shocked, I knew it was cruel but I didn't know how cruel, I never could imagine... I thought about it in a different way. We actually got to see it and experience what it would have been like. I did know quite a lot but I wasn't able to picture it." S, a student from Thomas Tallis School also commented on the value of seeing real objects: "Because you can see it for yourself... see it for yourself instead of pictures on a board and see it's real, like wow, look at that!" There was also the sense that they could trust objects more than pictures in books: "With pictures in a book... [If] it's been made up, you wouldn't know... like some just drawings, yeah that was from the time but..."(G).

#### Sense of identity and heritage

There was a strong sense from the Bristol case study that young people had become disconnected from their background and lacked a sense of identity. *Understanding Slavery* was enabling some young people to reconnect with that background – "because they know certain amounts about where they would've originated from... I mean some of the children were walking around like they own the whole of Bristol... "We had a culture, Miss, we had you know, we had all this" (Linda Kear). Dharani Naidoo, museum education officer at BECM, reinforced this from her observations: "A subject like slavery can be very sensitive to certain race groups, it can also be a

learning experience. One group of Afro-Caribbean kids were totally in awe. They didn't know that slavery existed. Their families didn't talk about it at home... it gave them an insight, yes, this is our culture; this is who we actually are. For that race group it's very beneficial."

#### Value of learning in the museum

Opportunities at the museum to learn in greater depth than at school and it is more enjoyable - "It was just to try and think a bit more about things and that you can do it as well, whether you're black or white or whatever... They [at school] do things to make you feel that way but not in the same way as when we went to the Empire and Commonwealth Museum. At school they don't have time to go into the sort of details you need to make people understand. That's why I think it was a good experience" (L). Students from both schools appreciated the variety of resources in museums from which they can learn rather than learning from a textbook.

The students from Thomas Tallis School valued the fact that the museum gave a different perspective of history than school: "You're hearing it from other people's point of view... you're hearing it from like different people so you can actually kind of put a story together instead of like hearing it from that one person over and over again" (S). Another important element was the emphasis on human stories: "Because in all topics we do it doesn't really involve like different people, it's always like the big important people like Hitler and things. They like think about other people."



The experience at the museum gave the young people a chance to discuss difficult issues and things of interest to them: "The kids are very able to deal with the subjects, they have no problem dealing with racism, hierarchy, sexual terrorism, terror – controlling people through fear. And we never raised the sexual thing, they did" (Linda Farthing). This also highlights an inversion of the teacher – student relationship in their attitudes towards slavery. The teacher evaluation (Susie Fisher report) found that "teachers were nervous, reticent, to teach the facts, not the legacy because of racism and how to deal with the black kids in the class so they either avoided it or did the minimum." However the students were "a hundred percent into it – it was the most interesting subject, part of our lives, we can deal with it, it's part of history why aren't we taught about it automatically?" (Reported by Katherine Hann).

#### 10.7.5 Impact on the museums

#### National Museums Liverpool

The project was an excellent opportunity to develop museum collections and resources. At Liverpool the project was part of a process of reviewing and reconsidering the Transatlantic Slavery Gallery and a clarification of the experience that visitors and schools would receive. Part of this was a focus on presenting different perspectives of Africa and the Caribbean, broader than the slavery perspective, and presenting a more "personal face" to slavery through the CD-ROM.

Other benefits to the museum included the development of the use of handling collections, the development of a collective responsibility for using slavery material across the education team, and building the capacity of the museum in delivering programmes of formal and informal learning related to slavery.

#### The British Empire and Commonwealth Museum

The British Empire and Commonwealth Museum appreciated obtaining funding from DCMS/DfES, which was seen as signalling the acceptance of BECM within the museum community and a concomitant rise in profile. In addition, as a private museum charged with raising its own funding, these monies represented a considerable increase in budget for educational work.

#### Bristol Museum and Art Gallery

A comprehensive teachers' pack *Transatlantic Slavery at Bristol Industrial Museum: a KS3 resource for teachers* was produced by Bristol Museums and Art Gallery. Bristol Museums limited their involvement in the overall project to this one activity, which contributed to its successful completion. However, this museum was not engaged with the other museums in collective discussions about the intellectual framing and conceptual development of the project.

#### National Maritime Museum

The research for this case-study did not extend to the lead museum.

#### Developing beyond a European perspective on slavery

One of the aims of the project was to present issues of slavery from more than a European perspective, through making connections with Africa and Caribbean histories prior to the slave trade. The project enabled the museums to reconsider the way in which they were presenting slavery and to provide more complex views than previously.

At BECM, evidence was found that these more nuanced views had formed part of the way the material was presented. The teacher interviewed from St Thomas More School agreed that this was an important element of the project because it enabled the pupils to see a more positive aspect to their heritage - "Yeah, there is a sort of 'although the Africans had a culture, it wasn't as good as ours and we taught, we civilised them' [but] they were civilised, if that's what you want to call it...yes, there was a culture, look at these headdresses, look at this carving, look at – they had maths, they had science, a long time before, while we were still painting our faces blue and chasing across the plains" (Linda Kear).

One of the students (L) from St Thomas More School involved in the project also understood the importance of learning about history from more than one perspective as it enabled everybody to benefit: "I talked about it with my friend Helen, she's white and did the project too, and she thought she got something out of it and she understood a bit more about it. We learn about English history but not other cultures' history. It opened up our minds to think a bit more. It was for everyone of all different colours – black, white, yellow, blue, purple, they all got something out of it as well."

#### Developing new approaches using Black perspectives

Employing Black practitioners was an important element of the project. At the British Empire and Commonwealth Museum it enabled the existing staff to integrate different perspectives on the subject – "Because slavery is so evocative and emotional its important that an individual staff member's way of approaching the subject doesn't become the norm, so, for instance, working with Black practitioners... By having outsiders in to do the work it was quite threatening for them [but] actually [the staff] have responded very well... It could have backfired!" (Katherine Hann).

Non-European perspectives challenged existing interpretations: "We tried not to fall into the popular conceptions of slavery which don't tell you enough... We tried to challenge beliefs and look at the issue of resistance. Ask why do we always see them in a broken, beaten state? It was crucial for me to be involved in that" (Dan Olu).

#### Enabling the discussion of sensitive and challenging issues

The project was a chance for museums to impact upon the teaching of a strong and emotive subject: "[it's] been a chance to come to terms with this subject, which is taught sporadically at best, with real varying degrees of willingness and interest. For the teachers it's a matter of confidence and 'how do we tackle this subject" (BECM project worker). However, the consultations with teachers were difficult and diverse views were expressed by teachers. There is clearly a great deal more work to be done to develop the teaching of slavery and to position museums within this development.

#### Suggestions of the potential of museums in teaching history

Thomas More teacher, Linda Kear, had high expectations from being involved with the museum because of its approach to world history: "we were looking for role models for the children... a lot of our children are ethnic minorities... things are getting better, improving but they cannot see a lot of Black or Asian role models within our community."

She felt that the museum could provide access to experiences and history that the students might not otherwise access – "unfortunately with a lot of the children, especially in inner cities, they don't get the stories that I was told... [Their family] they don't have the time to go through rites of passage, culture, what they did when they were home... and the fact that there was a civilisation (prior to the development of the slave trade in Africa)."

#### Going beyond short-term projects to challenge core representations?

This project raised broad issues of history, culture, ethnicity and race and how these are interpreted and represented within museums. *Understanding Slavery* focused on developing education resources but the project raises a number of issues related to the institutional approach to slavery and associated issues. While listening to Black perspectives and developing more rounded views is very positive, the short-term and temporary character of the DCMS/DfES programme did not encourage long-term change. The project manager felt that the bid for *Understanding Slavery* as a whole underestimated the need for change within the museums; she saw it as a much broader and significant issue, one of civic responsibility. She felt the timescale to be "ridiculous and unacceptable" for such an important and significant subject. It is not only about providing resources and learning opportunities but also about

representation in collections and gallery images – a curatorial as well as an educational issue.

The project raises issues about the diversity (or lack of it) in museum staff profiles. Black temporary project workers sometimes found themselves to be the only Black person in museum staff meetings.

Questions remain about the impact of the project as a whole on the broader life of all the museums involved. However, this element did not form part of the case-study.

# 10.7.6 The challenges of working with sensitive material, especially with secondary schools

This project was an ambitious attempt to use museum collections to combat racism, tackle under-achievement and develop citizenship. The themes of identity, social responsibility and human rights were central to its conceptualisation. Understanding the histories and legacies of slavery is a matter of central importance in multi-cultural Britain, and one that is addressed all too rarely in museums. The DCMS/DfES project could only hope to open up some of the issues, but it has made a substantial start to what should remain as a key theme for further work.

While significant successes can be observed in this project, *Understanding Slavery* also serves to illustrate some of the challenges of links between museums and schools. There are specific challenges when working with secondary schools, which are much more tightly time-tabled than primary schools. These become impossible to solve when work is undertaken at a very fast rate, with inexperienced museum staff, and where schools are already under pressure to achieve their own targets. Working with sensitive subjects creates further issues for resolution. Below, some of these matters are identified.

## The significance of schools and museums working together to provide deep learning opportunities where pupils are supported

The experience of St Thomas More School and BECM revealed the potential clash between the needs of museums, schools and individual students. This is a school from inner-city Bristol, where many pupils do not enjoy broad opportunities. The school is under threat of closure. Not all the students were comfortable working at the museum. J was one student who became disengaged with the process - "She [was] first two weeks... fine but then, I don't know whether there was a bit of a personality thing, between the way she was asked to do things and her reaction" (Linda Kear). For J, it was because she knew her teachers at school therefore trusted them more - "Yeah, I would like to learn about it more in school. I've only known [the museum staff] for a few weeks and I know the teachers more than them so I understand what they're chatting about more, I like my history teacher in school." Where pupils need to trust their teachers, the importance of museum staff and teaching staff working together to support the pupil in their learning is highlighted. The workshops with this school extended over four weeks; during this time pupils were drawn from a number of different classes - they did not know each other well, different teachers accompanied the group each time (and sometimes did not remain all day), and the pupils had no debriefing back at school. Under these circumstances, especially when working with such a powerful subject, pupils are at high risk of having mis-educative experiences.

#### Lack of communication between the museum and the school

The school felt that the museum did not really understand their context and the amount of administration that accompanies visits. The museum felt that the school was not as involved in the process as they desired, particularly the teachers who did not help the students to engage: "I would normally expect a teacher to be with a group, participating, interested...being there with them, not sitting at the edge not knowing the group" (Drama workshop leader).

The short time-scale for the project affected communication between the museum and the school in a number of ways. The administrator appointed to this project was new to museum education work and did not fully appreciate the complexities and details of the relationships between schools and museums. There was no time to build a relationship with either teachers or pupils.

#### Working with the curriculum – fitting into the school timetable for teaching

Fitting projects like *Understanding Slavery* into the existing curriculum presented a challenge for both schools involved. Neither school was working on slavery at the time that the consultations needed to take place in order to suit the requirements of project within the time-frame of the DCMS/DfES programme.

For St Thomas More this caused disruption to lessons, with students coming out from different classes to go the museum, and returning to them at the end of a day in the museum (from the trauma of the experience of slavery to French, as one of the BECM staff put it). There seemed to be no opportunity made for the pupils to discuss the day's events. There seemed to be lack of engagement with some teachers who perhaps lacked time and willingness to fit the work into their plans at very short notice. Where work is planned in advance, and most pupils were working within these plans, it is perhaps unrealistic to expect too much change to accommodate those pupils who are withdrawn from classes.

With Thomas Tallis School, where students were studying World War II, the session around slavery was not relevant to their studies and had not been discussed back in school following the visit. The visit from the RCMG researcher was the first opportunity that the pupils had had to reflect on their experience at the National Maritime Museum.

Planning is a huge issue for secondary schools who have highly established cycles and little flexibility. This project, with its delayed and shortened time-scales, was not able to address this issue.

#### Consultation – for whose benefit?

Consultation with those for whom resources are being prepared, whether these are exhibitions, paper-based or web-based resources, is very important. Without researching the interests and needs of those who will use the resources there is a high risk of producing unsuitable material. However, this project illustrates some of the difficulties inherent in the consultation process.

Consultation must be carried out to minimise any potential harm to those being consulted. This is an ethical issue, and of particular importance when young, potentially vulnerable people are being consulted. Sensitivity to the detail of the consultation process is additionally vital when sensitive issues are under discussion. While it is clear that some pupils were able to cope well with the experience of consultation on this project, others felt less positive. The response of the pupils tells

us more about the resilience of young people than it does about the care and attention to their needs of the adults involved.

#### Involving others in the partnerships?

The museums involved in the Understanding Slavery project came together because of their collections and historical and geographical locations as port cities. The partnerships worked well, given the constraints of time, distance and other commitments. However, in relation to the subject matter of the work done – slavery – it is possible that the involvement of other partners already engaged in working in this field would have helped. While many organisations were contacted by the museums, there seemed to be no evidence of a sustained and beneficial engagement that might have helped with debating the issues to arise from the complex and sensitive subject matter. Here, of course, the time-scale of the programme as a whole worked against this kind of further partnership.

The project raises very challenging issues for museums as a whole in relation to which histories are presented and which voices are heard in museums. Given that museums contribute towards the construction of national and local identities, there is much to be explored about how English identity (for example) is produced, and how Black culture and history are represented using museum collections. These matters need to addressed more generally, in conjunction with those individuals and organisations already engaged in understanding the histories and legacies of slavery. This project makes a brave beginning, but there is a long way still to go.

### 10.8 People, Places & Portraits Case study – Beningbrough Hall

#### 10.8.1 Overview

Beningbrough Hall is a National Trust property 8 miles outside York and a longstanding partner of the National Portrait Gallery. One aim of the *People, Places, Portraits* project is increasing access to schools and communities in rural areas through new work with existing partners. At Beningbrough, rural schools, local families and blind and partially-sighted young people benefited from outreach work and the development of materials based on the appreciation and understanding of portraiture, art and history. For schools, this included the development of teaching resource materials based around portraits loaned from the National Portrait Gallery and digital photography programmes both on and off site. Activities for families and local community groups were run over the summer and into early 2004 including interactive sessions with digital cameras, family trails and related activities.

The focus for RCMG was to explore issues around rural exclusion, particularly the development of programmes for rural schools at Beningbrough.



## Figure 10.8: Organisational map showing the relationship of the case study to the *People, Places, Portraits* project as a whole

#### 10.8.2 Research processes

Eilean Hooper-Greenhill and Jocelyn Dodd visited Beningbrough Hall and Goathland School in North Yorkshire on Tuesday 30<sup>th</sup> March 2004.

The first visit was made to Goathland School, a small rural school of 32 pupils near Whitby on the North York Moors. The school had received an outreach visit and

visited Beningbrough as part of the project. A class of mixed age children was briefly observed, and the Head Teacher was interviewed in depth. A focus group was held with three pupils, of mixed age and gender, to discuss their perceptions of the project.

In the afternoon, the researchers visited Beningbrough Hall to interview Ray Barker, Property Manager and Tracey Means, project co-ordinator for *People, Places, Portraits*. They discussed the impact of the project on Beningbrough and how it will affect their provision for rural schools. Many issues were raised about the issues and barriers that rural schools face in visiting museums and the challenges that rural schools pose to museums, for example, differentiation in activities and lack of funding opportunities to meet their needs.

The researchers aimed to develop an understanding of the events that had taken place from a range of perspectives. They discussed the learning outcomes for participants and the impact of the project on the organisations involved.

Issues around rural exclusion and barriers to visiting were explored in all interviews. The problems and solutions to them were discussed.

The outcomes of the project were explored for the school and for Beningbrough.

### 10.8.3The project and activities

The pupils had taken part in varied activities at the Hall including role-play and drawing 18<sup>th</sup> century portraits. Back in school they had made their own photographic and painted self-portraits using what they had learnt about form and composition at Beningbrough. They received a visit from Tracey Means in role as Miss Mary Taylor, where they explored the social context for the 18<sup>th</sup> century portraits. They developed what they had learnt about historic portraits further, over an extended period spanning two terms, by making their own photographic portraits using digital cameras, and by making pastel portraits in the style of Picasso.

It was originally envisaged that video-conferencing would be used with rural schools as part of the National Portrait Gallery project. However, in North Yorkshire the infrastructure did not exist to facilitate this. The Senior Humanities advisor from the LEA advised Beningbrough that all schools in the region had just received digital cameras and laptops, which presented the opportunity for Beningbrough to aid the professional development of teachers through offering INSET training in schools. This tied in with the skills and background of the project co-ordinator, Tracey Means, the needs of the Senior Humanities advisor who was interested in schools using their new equipment in a more effective way.

#### 10.8.4 Key findings

#### Outcomes for the pupils and the impact on the school

#### Positive attitudes to culture: a feeling of ownership

Pupils were impressed by their exposure to real portraits: "It just felt like I've seen the first one in my whole entire life." Pupils made personal connections to the paintings – "Well when you start drawing them it takes quite a while... you kind of feel like you've known this person.



#### Use of the museum learning in the school

Pupils used ideas of composition and meaning to make their own portraits, "Well for the background I used a yellow and a black... I have a happy side and an angry side sort of thing, and the same with the theatre masks I had one skin colour and one white..." The head teacher said, "The children have learnt to look purposefully and closely at the portraits."

#### Memories of earlier visits

Pupils from Goathland demonstrated the memorable experiences that young people can have at cultural organisations as some remembered a visit from several years before and one pupil expected to be going back there again – "Maybe because *when we go back again* we'll probably see all the children doing the same project as we did before like when we saw this time all the children doing Victorians."

#### Increased understanding of the past through a rounded experience

The experience of Beningbrough Hall as a historic building, combined with historical role-play in the classroom, enabled pupils to develop a sense of empathy with past times: "It felt as though you were back in those days." Meeting somebody from the past back at school was also intriguing: "...like weird because she didn't know anything really... because she didn't know all the new... she didn't know of like a toaster or anything." The head teacher said, "...this builds a great round picture of experience they have been able to have...it makes it special and gives a fullness..."

#### Impact on the school

The children's day at Beningbrough Hall stimulated more than a term's work on portraits. They created their own portraits, using digital cameras, drew, used pastel, painted, and used the word processor.

Skills	How to use a digital camera How to use the word processor to manipulate images	
Knowledge and understanding	How identity can be shown in a picture How composition works in making a painted and photographic portrait	

#### What the pupils learnt through People, Places, Portraits

	How to link images from the past to the present	
Attitudes and values	That Beningbrough Hall was interesting and memorable	
	Positive attitudes to culture	
	Feeling of ownership of portraits	
Enjoyment, inspiration,	Increased confidence in their practical skills	
creativity	Inspired by the paintings at Beningbrough	
	Enjoyed the visit and the work there	
	Enjoyed the whole project	
	Used their imaginations and creativity throughout the	
	project	
Action, behaviour,	Experienced the Hall and grounds and the portraits	
progression	Experienced role-play	
	Followed a lengthy project across several weeks	
	Displayed their work in the classroom and labelled the	
	portraits	
	Applied learning at Beningbrough in the classroom	
	Expect to go back at some point	



#### **Outcomes for Beningbrough Hall**

#### New resources

The project has enabled Beningbrough to develop a stock of equipment and resources as part of a longer-term strategy to raise the standard and quality of their provision for rural schools and families, community groups and disabled visitors. Four teachers' packs have been produced with posters, images and information. These will be available for teachers to borrow prior to their visit to the Hall.

#### Increased expertise - for the Hall and for rural teachers

Beningbrough was able to increase capacity to meet the needs of new audiences. It also worked to expand the skills of teachers in using digital cameras, just issued by the Local Education Authority.

#### Sustainable model of teaching/delivery

A sustainable teaching model has been developed which uses paintings as a "stepping stone... a point from which you can do an enormous amount of things" (Ray Barker).

#### Increased local knowledge through the use of a local expert

Beningbrough benefited from the knowledge of local matters of Mike Hollyoak, Senior Humanities Advisor from the LEA, who was familiar with the access issues that are faced by rural schools. He enabled project staff to find the appropriate ways of including schools (pointing out, for example that the planned video conferencing was inappropriate, given the types of technology that schools had) but also making the suggestion that digital camera sessions would be appreciated as schools in North Yorkshire had all been given cameras and laptops.

#### 10.8.5 Issues of rural exclusion – problems and solutions

#### Transport: costs and travel time

The major barriers faced by rural schools are transport costs and distance. The nature of the roads in North Yorkshire means that travel is slow and thus visits demand a great deal of time.

#### Limited resources - Communication

Issues of communication were evident in this case-study. Schools lacked the videoconferencing technology that would have allowed communication and an outreach approach – plans had to be changed radically because of this. Emails were also sometimes problematic for more routine communication with schools, and small numbers of staff sometimes made it difficult to find someone to take/make telephone calls.

#### Limited resources - Funding

There is a perception that there is a lack of funding opportunities for rural schools to enable access to cultural organisations; "I think there's a gap there, there's an awful lot of help gone to urban defined schools and there is a bit of a vacuum when we come to rural schools" (Ray Barker).

#### Limited resources – low numbers of staff

The head teacher at Goathland pointed out that where staff numbers are low, a lack of interest, skills or confidence in using cultural organisations in those staff is likely to have a bigger impact than in schools where a greater number of teachers may mean a broader spread of attitudes to museums and historic houses.

#### Mixed age-groups in classes and on visits

Small rural schools of 20-30 children are likely to bring all or most of the children on a visit. The resulting need for differentiation in museum education programmes was noted. Children of different ages often wanted to work together, and are used to doing this and museums need to understand and anticipate this. This seemed to work well in this project.

#### Limited experience of children

Because of the demands of travel and transport, children in rural areas may have limited experience of the world outside their immediate environment.

"What I think I wasn't aware of was perhaps just how significant it is bringing kids in and have them working in an environment which is outside of the school curriculum, outside of their school room and within the actual property, within Beningbrough... I think it's because rural schools don't get out, well the children don't get out..." (Tracey Means).

The head teacher at Goathland Primary school described issues around rural exclusion: "The children often have very limited experience of the world... there is a wide range of children socially and economically - we tend to think they are not isolated because of the media \*...but their experiences are often limited to Goathland and Whitby. In school we try to give them a broad vision of the world... to inspire them."

\* Goathland is the location for the filming of the TV programme Heartbeat.

#### 10.8.6 Critical success factors - Project and partnership management

#### This project dovetailed into an existing strategic plan.

This project fitted in with the NPG National Strategy (adopted 2003), so the project was a timely opportunity to deliver something the NPG had already committed to. The management of the project by the NPG Head of Education who worked in collaboration with curatorial colleagues meant that the project was firmly embedded within mainstream museum work.

However, it is important to note that, due to the shortness of time to plan and develop the bid, this project had not been written into the corporate plan for 2003/04 and had to be inserted at a later date, thereby necessitating modification of existing plans and activities.

#### The methodology of using the collections was well understood and practised.

The project was part of an established partnership between NPG and Beningbrough Hall. It used an established way of using portraits in a historic context, with the methodology well established and practiced. The innovative element of the project, reaching rural schools, was therefore contained within other established elements. This enabled a tight focus on making the innovative element achievable within the short timescale.

#### Local needs were understood by the partners through high-level local input

The project had a good outside friend/ mentor/ partner in the LEA Senior Humanities Advisor, who had a clear understanding of the issues of rural exclusion.

#### The project developed flexibly to respond to difficulties as they arose

A flexible approach was taken to the development of the project. For example, the use of technology was reduced and there was an increasing awareness of the significance of children having a real not a virtual experience.

"I think the [idea] at one stage was that we might do this room up as a video conferencing room. I think you've got the same problem...because if they're going to come here on a bus, what you want to do is for them to see the real things not just spend the afternoon in here" (Ray Barker).

#### Fitting into curriculum planning

Fitting visits into the curriculum was also difficult. The short timescale of the project, with planning being undertaken late in relation to school planning, meant that both the school and Beningbrough has had to be very flexible and adapt their sessions to fit each others' capacities. Goathland School, for example, had already begun on a

planned theme of World War 2, but was prepared to change to the Eighteenth Century to be able to use the project. Beningbrough Hall made a link between their collections and WW2 to fit in with this situation. There are lessons here about timing and planning in relation to the requirements of the curriculum. Projects need to be advertised to schools by the Easter prior to the September of the year in which the project will take place. Teachers are planning a complete school year at once and begin this work at the end of the winter term in the previous school year.

## Section 11 Conclusions - inspiration, identity, learning: the value of museums

### 11.1 The twelve projects

**11.1.1** The Department for Culture, Media and Sport and the Department for Education and Skills commissioned 12 projects during 2003-2004 which consisted of museum education partnerships between national and regional museums. Eight of the projects had both Education and Community elements; 2 projects had an education element only, and worked only with school groups and 2 projects were involved only with community-based activities. Each of the 12 projects involved a national partner organisation and one or more regional partner organisations, with 42 organisations involved in partnerships in total.

**11.1.2** A number of aims were established by DCMS/DfES for these projects. These aims included both learning outcomes and educational outputs:

A. Education	<ol> <li>Fulfilment and satisfaction from achievement for children</li> <li>Increased learning within a subject area</li> <li>Increased understanding of connections between subjects</li> <li>Increased learning across subjects</li> </ol>	
	<ul> <li>2. Increase in self-confidence and self esteem for children: <ul> <li>Increased cultural understanding and respect and tolerance for others</li> <li>Increased ability to work with others</li> <li>Increased involvement in class, school or community events</li> <li>Ability to make informed choices beyond and within planned experiences</li> <li>Positive attitudes to experience and desire for further experiences</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	
	3. Increase in confidence, expertise and personal satisfaction of teachers	
	4. Increase in total numbers of children and young people who participate in educational programmes in the regions	
	5. Increase in participation of schools (teachers and students) in development of museum programmes	
	6. Increased satisfaction of schools with museum education programmes (as seen through educational attainment of children)	
	7. New partnerships developed with schools	

	8. Increase in volume of on or off-site education by museum education staff	
	9. Increase in object-based teaching at museums or schools	
B. Communities	1. Improved outcomes (motivation, engagement, self-confident, comfort, satisfaction) for participants in museum programmes	
	2. Enhanced perception of importance and value of museum and services they provide amongst participants	
	3. Increase in participation in the museums activities by communities	
	4. Increase in outreach sessions provide by national museums	
	5. Increase in the number of visits to national, regional or hub museums by new users	
	6. New partnerships with communities, or community led bodies	
	7. New projects developed through partnerships with communities or community led bodies: e.g. education programmes, exhibitions, handling sessions, etc	
	8. Repeat visits by new users or increase in repeat visits by targeted groups	

**11.1.2** The Strategic Commissioning Programme 2003-2004: National/Regional Museum Education Partnerships has been evaluated by the Research Centre for Museums and Galleries (RCMG) at the University of Leicester. The evaluation has focused on the impact on learning of the programme and has also reviewed issues of partnerships and project management. The evaluation did not focus on educational outputs, and this evaluation does not represent an evaluation of each individual project. It is an evaluation of the DCMS/DfES programme as a whole; where individual projects were reviewed, and case-studies explored, this was to contribute to the evaluation of the programme overall.

**11.1.3** The DCMS/DfES programme was announced in February 2003, bids were submitted in March 2003 and awards announced in June 2003. The projects ran between August/September 2003 and March 2004. At the same time, the Renaissance in the Regions programme, managed by MLA (the Museum, Library and Archive Council), was initiated. RCMG was commissioned to evaluate both programmes and to use, as far as possible, the same methodologies for both evaluations. The focus of the evaluation for both programmes was the impact of learning, using the General Learning Outcomes (or GLO) approach previously developed by RCMG and MLA.

**11.1.4** However, although it was desired that the evaluation methods should be the same where possible, there were considerable differences between the two programmes. With Renaissance in the Regions, regional museums built on existing educational methods and contacts with schools, with a single objective – that of increasing the volume of school visits. As the final report (*What did you learn at the museum today*? – <u>www.mla.gov.uk</u>) shows, this was achieved very effectively, with a 28% increase in volume of school visits and a very high level of teacher and pupil

satisfaction. This was managed through the employment of additional core and temporary staff, and by increasing levels of core provision. The standard of work was very high, and the evaluation showed four main impacts of the programme:

- Increased high quality provision for schools, building effectively on existing practice
- More teachers using museums to their satisfaction
- Increased and inclusive provision for multiple learning needs opportunities for all pupils
- Increased number of pupils inspired to learn more

The DCMS/DfES programme had broader aims. It was not focused entirely on school visits, and individual projects did not aim solely to increase volume. The programme was approached by the museums involved as an opportunity to do new work that could not otherwise be attempted, or to review and change existing provision. Many of the projects developed ambitious objectives, where the degree of risk was high. New partnerships between national and regional museums and other organisations have been established; new short-term appointments have been made, often with a view to integrating new skills and new expertise into an established education section; and individual projects have attempted to open up and explore new themes. While this has of course been based on existing expertise and experience (some of this very firmly established), the DCMS/DfES scheme has allowed experimentation and leaps into the unknown with the aim of going beyond existing achievements.

**11.1.5** The evaluation included a number of different methods and approaches. Early visits were made to all lead partners, and all project plans were reviewed. The evaluation analysed school use of museums through questionnaires for teachers and children. These questionnaires focused on the impact of learning. All projects were expected to become involved with the assessment of school use. Case-studies of component strands of eight projects were developed to pursue the impact on learning for communities, and to probe the impact on schools more deeply. The case-studies were selected because of the needs of the evaluation of the whole programme. These case-studies involved visits, interviews, group discussions, observations, review of documents and review of outputs of learning (animations, paintings, photographs etc)

# 11.2 Common themes and shared convictions about the potential of museums

The twelve projects that comprised the DCMS/DfES Strategic Commissioning Museum Education Partnerships programme shared a number of themes. Although each individual project had been developed independently, certain defining themes and convictions were evident across the programme as a whole. To a large extent, of course, these common themes were generated by the programme brief, but the convictions that underpin them demonstrate clearly how museums respond, and what they can do, given the opportunity and the funding.

The 12 projects demonstrate the ambitions of museums to work towards social justice, to play a significant and useful social and educational role, and to inspire their visitors.

The projects funded through the National/Regional Museum Education Partnerships programme were aspirational projects, working towards community cohesion and social inclusion. These aspirations are very well embedded in the philosophies that inform the work of many museum educators and curators, and this programme represented an opportunity to put these long-held philosophies into practice. This was achieved through designing projects that aspired to community cohesion, targeting schools in areas of deprivation, working with vulnerable groups and individuals, and working towards the inspiration and empowerment of participants through increased self-esteem and sense of identity.

#### 11.2.1 Community cohesion and social inclusion

Very many of the projects were designed to show how museums can play a central role in social change and were designed to place museums in a central position in relation to contemporary social issues. Projects were planned to address social exclusion and to work towards community cohesion.

Many museums engaged with issues to do with social displacement, diaspora and cultural difference. The intended participants for community outreach in Liverpool and Manchester, for instance, included refugees and asylum seekers, acknowledging the displacement that follows war, conflict, and economic deprivation. Young people who were not in mainstream schools because of their life-circumstances found these museums to be essential resources for learning.

Historical diaspora, racism, hidden histories and the resulting impact on lives today were addressed where slavery materials were used. Pupils at KS3 were moved, sometimes profoundly, by their engagement with collections of artefacts connected to the experience of enslavement.

Projects were designed to enable the development of a shared sense of belonging based on common goals. The acknowledgement of the positive value of difference and the acceptance of reciprocal rights and obligations of different groups lay behind many of the projects. Pupils were brought together through shared experiences generated by involvement in projects. In Bradford, for example, Cartwright Hall worked with Education Bradford and their Linking programme to bring together two schools from different parts of the city. Margaret McMillan Primary School in the Heaton area of Bradford, an inner city school with 90% Pakistani pupils, worked with Lees Primary School in Keighley, a school with a largely white pupil base, on an exciting project, Anim8ed. Both groups began to feel that the museum was exciting and interesting, and through the same experience of developing an animation, began to appreciate that their peers in the other school shared their own attitudes and interests. The pupils enjoyed meeting each other and were exposed to opportunities for increased understanding of cultural similarities and differences. "It was more exciting because we can make friends with the people and learn about them and the different things that they like to do" (Pupil, Margaret McMillan School). The teachers were surprised at how easy it was for the children to work together. "We were amazed how easily they (the children) mixed together" (Teacher, Margaret McMillan School). In this example, the museum acted as a space for cultural exchange through shared events.

# 11.2.2 Working with schools in some of the most deprived areas of England

Museums targeted their educational provision towards schools in some of the most deprived wards in England and the take-up from these schools was very high. The post-code analysis of the schools that participated in the DCMS/DfES programme,

using the Indices of Multiple Deprivation 2000, shows that 22% of the visits were from schools located in the ten percent most deprived wards, and that 43% of the visits were from schools located in the twenty percent most deprived words in England. Analysing the post-codes of the schools in relation to the child poverty index, 19% of the visits were made by schools located in wards classified as among the highest ten percent, and 41% of the visits were from schools located in wards classified as lying within the top twenty percent of wards in terms of child poverty.

These results are confirmed when the analysis is undertaken using the new indices (IMD2004 and IDACI – Income Deprivation Affecting Children Index). Looking at the schools involved in these projects in terms of the Super Output Areas (SOAs), 19% of the visits are from schools located in the ten percent most deprived wards, while 30% of the visits are from schools in the twenty percent most deprived wards. In respect of income deprivation affecting children, 17% of the visits were made by schools located in SOAs which were amongst the highest ten percent on IADCI, while 30% of the visits were from schools in wards classified as lying within the top twenty percent of SOAs.

While not all the museums were in a position to work with large numbers of schools because of the different approaches to project development, overall, the majority of schools involved in working with the museums in the DCMS/DfES programme were from schools located in areas which are classified within the more deprived half of the rankings. However, the projects were involved with schools that represent the whole range of SOAs, although one or two projects, for example *People, Places, Portraits* and *Understanding Slavery*, have particularly high numbers of schools coming from areas in the highest 10% deprivation band. Schools from these areas also figure strongly in the *Partners in Time* project.

These figures attest to the power of museums to engage with some of the most vulnerable children and young people; they also affirm the desire of museums to play their part in counteracting social and cultural disadvantage.

#### 11.2.3 Vulnerable individuals and groups unaccustomed to using museums

Many projects targeted their work towards individuals, groups and organisations that generally find visiting museums either irrelevant to their needs or difficult to achieve. Individuals who do not normally perceive museums as meeting their needs include refugees and asylum seekers, teenage mothers, young people who are not in mainstream schools because of illness, and children who are at risk because of environmental and behavioural difficulties.

The Victoria and Albert Museum and Manchester Art Gallery worked with NCH and a small group of children in Manchester who were at risk of being involved in crime; some in the group were known to the police and one was already in court. The art gallery provided an environment for an out-of-school activity where alternative things to do and ways of behaving could be experienced, and where the children were given opportunities they would not normally expect. The art workshops enabled the young people to find out more about themselves and to learn new skills through focusing intensely upon a number of activities connected to art. "They didn't know they had talents before they came here" (NCH Centre worker). According to the adults involved, the young people were engaged because it was something for them and about them: "This obviously makes a difference to them. They don't have much going for them and this is for them..." (NCH Centre worker). Working with the national charity NCH gave the gallery access to this group.

Organisations who find it difficult to manage museum visits, or who do not see their relevance, include rural schools and hospital schools. Rural schools are often very small and need to bring the whole school on the visit. This will include the youngest children, who may find travelling long distances difficult. Transport costs are high, especially if the coach has to be used during the times of normal school runs. Teachers are uncertain whether museums will be able to cope with teaching mixed age groups. Beningbrough Hall, working with the National Portrait Gallery, worked effectively with rural schools from North Yorkshire; in Eastern England, rural schools appreciated transport bursaries that enabled them to visit IWM Duxford, and Norfolk and Luton Museum Services.

Hospital schools are a new audience for museums. In Newcastle, the Laing Art Gallery, in conjunction with the National Gallery, worked with a cartel of hospital schools. This project was challenging working with young people whose experiences are very different from the mainstream: terminally ill children, vulnerable young people with complex mental health experiences and teenage mothers. Some of the hospital school staff were less confident about the long-term benefits for their young people from paintings and art activities. However, by the end of the project, confidence was beginning to grow, although the development of trust demands work across the long-term. The children themselves, after initial hesitation and suspicion, began to explore new things such as mixing plaster and casting bits of their bodies. Some very young mothers (aged 13 years) began to feel more interested, enthusiastic and positive about what they could do. This was reinforced when their work was hung at the Laing.

#### 11.2.4 Focus on inspiration, identity and the sense of self

Many participants found the projects inspirational and motivating. Pupils enjoyed their workshops with paintings and artefacts and found museum buildings exciting and different. They were inspired to produce high quality art-work, to explore scientific concepts and to link their old and new experiences.

Pupils from Goathland School, on the North Yorkshire moors, for instance, were fascinated by the portraits they saw at Beningbrough, and worked on the themes of portraits for many weeks after their visit. They used the ideas they learnt from 18<sup>th</sup> century portraits about the construction of self-images, and the projection of personal identity, in the production of digital photographs, and then pastel portraits in the style of Picasso. Pupils from Norfolk schools were inspired by the aeroplanes and hangars they saw at Duxford to explore the concept of structures; they learnt about various different kinds of structures (including their own skeletons) in the morning, and applied their knowledge by constructing a structure in a group in the afternoon. Their enthusiasm, new knowledge and skills, and ability to work together to solve the challenges presented resulted in increased confidence and self-esteem and gave them all, including a child with considerable difficulties in concentrating, an experience of successful learning.

Vulnerable teenagers, facing challenges because of pregnancy, learning difficulties, family disruption, or even loss of home, family and culture, found involvement with a museum encouraged a degree of inner resilience. Sometimes this was apparently very slight, but of huge significance to the person concerned. One example was found at a unit for young mothers in Newcastle, where making eye contact, and then stepping forward to volunteer for an art activity, enabled one 13-year-old mother to begin to participate in her group for the first time. Sometimes, the individual was already very confident and looking for new challenges and opportunities. A teenage asylum-seeker in Liverpool found repeated use of the museum as a curriculum resource meant that he began to feel that this might be a suitable place to do

voluntary work. He began to feel a sense of place and belonging. He was part of a group of teenagers from many different countries, all with traumatic experiences in their recent past; working together at the museum gave them all a common experience to talk about as they began to remap their lives and remodel their individual identities to take them forward into a new phase.

Museums are able to find ways to engage with children and young people across the social spectrum. Through empowering successful learning, museums engender increased self-esteem and a higher sense of self-worth. This is valuable for all, but especially important for those who are disadvantaged or disempowered.

### 11.3 The character of the projects: ambitious projects, multistranded and geographically dispersed

One of the most impressive aspects of the projects that were involved in the DCMS/DfES Strategic Commissioning Museum Education Partnerships programme was their ambitious character. These projects were designed to go beyond what the museums were already doing; the Strategic Commissioning Museum Education Partnerships programme was seen as a special opportunity to develop long-held ambitions, to move forward with strategic plans at a faster pace, to review and change current programmes and to extend existing work in new ways. The funding was very generous compared with normal levels of funding for museum education and this encouraged ambitious objectives.

In addition, this programme, with its high levels of funding, and high profile, was seen as an opportunity to show what museum education can do, both within the museum and externally.

#### 11.3.1 Ambitious in scale and complexity

The projects were ambitious in scale and complexity. Each project involved one lead national museum and up to five regional museums. Other national and regional organisations, such as charities, were also involved. Each of these partners involved in the different strands of the projects had their own reasons for being involved, their own ways of working, and their own specific professional cultures and timescales. Each partner also had their own professional networks, and range of informal, freelance and volunteer workers. These projects could be seen as complex organisational webs and multi-faceted communicative networks. The relationships between the different components of the network were highly significant to the success of the projects, and, where successful, resulted in mutual benefits.

*Image and Identity* at the V&A, for example, involved over 30 different organisations. Involvement with a national charity (NCH) opened doors to communities that would otherwise have been hard to locate. Even where fewer organisations were involved, an increased understanding of partners' values and cultures was beneficial. The Science Museum, for example, began to realise how working on a small-scale with community groups enabled access to people who were not their normal users. The values and strategies of the Ragged School Museum, their partner in the *Creative Canals* project, will be explored by the Science Museum in the future.

The multi-layered character of the projects posed challenges for management, communication, recruitment, and project development.

#### 11.3.2 Twelve projects with multiple strands within each project

Within these complex webs of different kinds of organisations, each of the 12 projects encompassed several different kinds of activities. These activities were negotiated according to multiple agendas, time-scales and professional requirements. The various professional fields that found ways to work together productively included Education, Health, Social Services, the Arts, Charities and the National Trust. The various different kinds of organisations included: art galleries, science museums, multi-departmental museums, National Trust houses, special schools, primary and secondary schools, Local Education Authorities, Further Education colleges, universities, hospital schools, artists, and freelance science teachers. There was limited involvement from universities, teacher-training establishments, and training organisations related to the other fields of work (e.g. Social Services, hospitals).

Each of the strands in each project involved a different combination of organisations.

#### 11.3.3 Geographically dispersed

All projects involved a number of geographical locations – this was, of course, part of the character of the programme as a whole, and is an integral element of national/regional partnerships. However, it is possible that the effect of distance and physical separation was not considered carefully enough at the start of the work. The bulk of projects involved a London-based national museum and a number of museums located in the English regions, (in a hub and spoke formation). Some (IWM North and IWM Duxford) involved regional branches of national museums and regional partners, but here too, distance and diversity of location was a factor. Distance led to costs for meetings (which were sometimes limited because of this), and also demanded additional time for travel. Where project co-ordinators were London-based, this meant a life on the road for some months for some project coordinators. Inevitably, this had a human cost, and an impact on previously planned work; however, getting around the partner organisations was also very beneficial. as partners came to understand alternative ways of working and as result, interrogated and sometimes changed their own ways of doing things. Distance, combined with organisational diversity and rapid project development led to challenges with communication. In some instances, successful communication between partner organisations enabled support when issues arose, in others, where support structures were less well established, project workers were isolated and unsure how to proceed.

### 11.4 An opportunity for innovation and experiment

All projects were designed to be innovative, and sometimes experimental, and to enable the museums to develop their work beyond what was possible with their usual level of resources. The National/Regional Museum Education Partnerships led to developments in five main areas.

#### 11.4.1 New audiences

Many new audiences were sought. National museums were enthusiastic about being able to make contact with regional and local audiences. This programme enabled new efforts to be made to widen the use of museums both by schools (such as hospital schools) and by community groups who are not normally regarded as those who would use museums. For example, the project led by National Museums Liverpool developed new forms of good practice and identified how museums can be successfully used by asylum seekers for learning. Successful and less reliable ways to make contact with these groups have been identified. The National Portrait Gallery reached disadvantaged rural and urban communities through working with their regional partners. It used the ability of regional museums to push out and reach new audiences to increase access to NPG collections in the regions.

#### 11.4.2 New partnerships

New partnerships were established between national and regional museums. The theme of *Understanding Slavery* linked the National Maritime Museum, National Museums, Liverpool, the British Empire and Commonwealth Museum and Bristol Museums and Art Galleries. IWMN built a new partnership with Leeds Museums and with Cartwright Hall in Bradford. Prior to the *Partners in Time* project, Stockwood Craft Museum and Gardens had no educational provision. Through involvement with IWM Duxford, lesson plans were developed, a mobile classroom was put in and a teacher was recruited. Training and support from Duxford will enable teachers to do Science and Technology sessions at Stockwood.

#### 11.4.3 Existing partnerships used in new ways

Some existing partnerships were used in new ways. The partnership between Beningborough and NPG built on an existing long-established partnership between a national museum and the National Trust, but extended the work to rural schools - a gap identified in users. IWM Duxford also successfully engaged with rural schools in a new way.

#### 11.4.4 Expanded scope and scale

Some museums took the opportunity to expand the scope and scale of successful projects. The National Gallery, for example, had been running a project called *Take one Picture* very successfully for ten years. This involved teachers coming to the National Gallery in London for CPD courses. While over 9,000 teachers had been involved from across most of England and Wales during this ten-year period, it was felt that taking the National Gallery staff and methods to the regions would enable this way of working to be disseminated more widely, with a regional focus. Teachers were known to use the methods they learnt for many years after the CPD courses, and these methods could be successfully delivered in the regions.

#### 11.4.5 Extended existing work into new subject areas

At IWM Duxford, a different approach was taken to expanding on existing successful educational provision. Here, the museum had developed an outreach service with a Heritage Lottery Fund grant that used artefacts to teach historical themes in schools. The National/Regional Museum Education Partnerships programme presented an opportunity to sustain the scheme and also to extend it to teach science in addition to history. The teaching of science and technology-based themes was new for Duxford; the success of this project (which involved schools in science workshops in school and at the museum) means that the museum has now expanded what it can offer to schools on a regular basis.

### 11.5 Partnerships and project management

The core of the DCMS/DfES Strategic Commissioning Museum Education Partnerships programme was partnership. Partnerships between national and regional museums, reinforced and extended by partnerships with other kinds of organisations, were developed and established through projects. The evaluation procedures enabled a review of the workings of these partnerships.

#### 11.5.1 Project management

The evaluation shows that partnerships in the DCMS/DfES programme tended to be a bit top-down; on the whole, they were given direction by the national museums. The national museums appeared to have more experience of project management, and had access to a range of good project managers. They also had more experience of handling large numbers of participants and multiple levels of projects. The higher levels of resource in the national museums meant that there were fewer issues of capacity overload, which was extreme in some of the regional museums, some of whom were involved in more than one of the DCMS/DfES projects and also in Renaissance in the Regions. However, most involved in these projects have been very stretched.

Communication has been led by the national museums, who have articulated the links between their regional partners and themselves. There have been rather limited links between and across the partner museums, although it had been anticipated in most project plans that these would develop.

Each museum partner has tended to work independently. The joint working of partners has been limited for a number of reasons:

- Geographical separation means time, effort and costs for meeting up
- Short time-scale for project development meant partnerships were not fully developed at the beginning of the programme
- Partners sometimes did not know each other well
- Short time-scale for project delivery meant all efforts were focused on getting the work done
- New staff on short-term contracts were unfamiliar with their employing organisation, and even more unfamiliar with partner museums
- Short-term employees tended to be managed by the organisation where they were based, rather than by the project

All organisations and partnerships achieved something, but the depth varied. Some of the most over-stretched organisations found the integration of the evaluation procedures very difficult. In one or two instances, the museum was very involved in internal procedures that meant the development of the project was hindered.

#### 11.5.2 Partnership models

A number of different models of partnerships were observed. Each individual project has developed in a different way according to local circumstances. While most partnerships have been made between national and regional museums, other bodies have been very much involved. The Victoria and Albert Museum established a partnership with another national organisation the NCH (formerly the National Children's Home) which also operates regionally.

The DCMS/DfES programme as a whole can be seen as a mosaic of smaller projects. While there are 12 large projects, these involve 39 museums and a very large number of other community organisations such as the Bilingual Centre in Liverpool and other organisations working closely with schools and museums. The educational and community themes represent a bricolage of earlier and new work. Building on existing activities, themes have evolved to bring together a large and diverse range of activities, events and partnerships. The partnership activities are multi-layered and fluid; while the partners themselves and the project objectives were generally agreed fairly early in the development of the programme, the strategies adopted by the partners to achieve the project objectives have been fluid,

developmental and subject to pragmatic modification. This seems entirely consistent with a large programme, involving considerable funds across a very short time-scale.

Although the shape and dynamics of these partnerships are individual and at times quirky; an attempt has been made in each of the case-studies to map the organisational relationships. These are presented in the body of the report.

#### 11.5.3 Diverse methods of project development

The development of the individual projects has sometimes been planned thoroughly in advance, but more often has grown in an organic and creative manner. Where work was based firmly on earlier projects and methods, it was easier to plan in a strategic manner.

At Duxford, for example, the *Partners in Time* project built on an earlier outreach to schools programme that had been funded by HLF over two years. This programme was coming to an end as the DCMS/DfES programme began. People, procedures, and processes (booking and marketing systems, ways of working with objects in the classroom, vans for delivering objects, introductory and follow-up materials for teachers) were already in place. The DCMS/DfES programme enabled this to be continued and extended to include new museum partners (Norfolk Museum Service and Luton Museum Service); new subject-related themes (these had formerly been confined to history, now, a science theme was added for the first time); and new schools (the funds for travel enabled rural schools to visit the museums for the first time). This relationship of the DCMS/DfES project *Partners in Time* to the earlier HLF-funded outreach work is far more than a mere continuation of the earlier work. It represents a step change. A second example of solid achievement based on a well-established base can be seen with the National Gallery project *Take One Picture North East*.

Where the opportunity to develop new work from a standing start was taken, it was much more difficult to design processes and procedures. Where there was too much attempted innovation, where structures, employees, patterns of working and partnership relationships were not in place, the successful achievement of project aims was hampered

#### 11.5.4 Developing projects with hard-to-reach communities

Many projects have worked with challenging groups. Working with communities with complex needs demands very effective networks and the building up of relationships. These processes take time, skill and contacts and need to evolve. The pressure of project deadlines can work against the development of appropriate strategies and competencies, and relationships can be hurried for the purposes of delivering the project rather than meeting the real needs of communities. Organisations with least experience, and thereby skill, and fewer networks and contacts, lacked the competencies to react quickly once the programme began. Those who were most successful during the DCMS/DfES programme were those who were either already working effectively with hard-to-reach groups, and/or who made use of those who were already embedded in this kind of work. For example, in the *Moving Minds* project, the partnership between the Ahmed Iqbal Ullah Race Relations Archive, Manchester and IWM North enabled the museum to learn from the expertise of the Archive in collecting oral histories with community groups across Manchester.

#### 11.5.5 The appointment of new staff – recruitment and retention

New staff were appointed to manage and deliver much of the DCMS/DfES programme. In these appointments, efforts were made to appoint people with the

skills and experience relevant to the target audiences (e.g. experience of refugees and those organisations who work with them); knowledge of schools and/or community organisations; expertise in project management and delivery; excellent networking skills; and museum experience. These people have been very thin on the ground – this combination and degree of expertise is rare. Accordingly, not all projects managed to make successful appointments at the start of their projects. At the Maritime Museum, the first trawl produced no one suitable and the recruitment process had to be repeated; this led to delays in project development. At Stockwood Museum (Luton Museum Service) the person appointed went through her initial training and then left the project; the funds have been spent on a freelance person known to the museum (from SATRO), which has been effective, but which may cause problems with sustaining the new educational work at Stockwood.

Retention of project staff was a problem for several projects. The Laing Art Gallery lost their project worker in the middle of the project and then very successfully took over the project management in house. This did, however, have a significant impact on other priorities, some of which were neglected. In those cases where the appointee did not have museum experience, whilst, perhaps, having the relevant community experience, a strong network of support in the museum was needed to help establish, organise, market, deliver and evaluate the project activities in the short space of time available. Where this team was not in place, and project-workers were left to their own devices, inappropriate decisions were made and solid outcomes were hard to find. Where the supportive team has been in place, the appointee has brought new skills, new contacts, and new ways of working into the museum.

In some museums, it proved so difficult to find the right person that internal secondments were made.

### 11.6 Critical success factors for projects

The evaluation looked at a small number of component strands (8) in detail, and also looked across the programme as a whole. From this, a number of critical success factors for projects have been identified. While very many strands of these 12 multi-stranded projects were not examined in detail, the conclusions about the critical success factors have been tested in two seminars with participants from variable parts of the programme and have been found to be resonant with experience.

The critical success factors identified and discussed below apply to individual project strands; where projects are multi-stranded, additional factors such as effective communication networks, strong links between the strands, and effective partnerships, are necessary.

Projects had most chance of success where five elements were in place:

- Limited innovation
- Strong museum-related ideas
- Appropriate management
- Project workers with appropriate skills and experience
- Participants and partners needs are met.

Two-further programme-related points arise:

- The need for time, support, experience and planning
- The time-scale of projects.

#### 11.6.1 Limited innovation

Where there are too many new elements, projects are likely to struggle. The potential for new elements in the DCMS/DfES programme was high. The evaluation found examples of:

- New organisations
- New organisational partners
- New ideas
- New collections
- New ways of working
- New audiences
- New project deliverers
- New administrative systems
- New communicative systems

Given that new things are generally unpredictable to some degree, and that more than one element of newness increases this more than is sometimes anticipated, those projects that limited the new elements had the greater chance of success. For example, in *Anim8ted*, the schools were already linked through Education Bradford's Linking Schools programme. Thus the schools knew to some degree what to expect when working together. One of the schools had also worked with Cartwright Hall on a previous project, so this too provided familiar ground. A balance is clearly needed between innovation and familiarity, and this balance needs careful thought.

#### 11.6.2 Strong museum-related ideas

With a large range of organisations (some non-museum organisations), spread across several geographical regions and working in different ways on different interpretations of one over-all idea, that idea is itself crucial. A very strong, well-developed idea that can be clearly articulated and communicated is essential.

This idea needs to be based on the museum and its collections. While this seems obvious, there were (a few) examples of very weak ideas with no strong museum base, and there were (more) examples of ideas that were potentially very strong, but which had not been fully thought through or developed. Where ideas are linked to sensitive materials or are rather abstract, it is even more important that the concepts on which the practical work is to go forward should be developed. At the same time, open-ended abstract concepts (image, identity, animation) enable a range of interpretations and this is important for creativity and innovation in projects for both project deliverers such as artists, and project participants. There is no single solution to this, but the evaluation found a number of examples where projects appeared to have worked less well than they might have done because there was no strong central conceptual core.

Some projects identified themselves through the audiences they were seeking to reach. This meant that while the audience could be identified, the content of any activities was left wide open. Themes enable purpose and focus and give an overall identity to the work that is done. Themes enable the selection of ideas and collections, and suggest the kinds of activities that might be carried out. Where the theme was weak or non-existent, museums either struggled to know what to do, or did what they normally did.

As museums have no curriculum, vast resources, and are capable of working with a great number of different audiences, the identification of a theme, combined with one or more audiences, is an essential prerequisite of any project.

#### 11.6.3 Appropriate management

These were complex, multi-stranded projects, frequently working in new areas (new audiences and/or new subject-matter). The time-scale was short, and there was a feeling of compulsion to achieve objectives funded through an external source. The management of the projects was time-consuming and needed to be proactive. Highly skilled project management was therefore required to oversee these frequently large and diverse networks of agencies and events, where there were many professional cultures, styles of working and reasons for being part of the project. Understanding these differences, and mediating and sustaining communication between all parties was key to the success of a number of projects.

One successful strategy, used by the *Image and Identity* project, was the involvement of the Arts Project coordinator from NCH in all monthly project meetings on the same basis as all the museum partners. These monthly meetings were essential in supporting all involved and in sharing problems and solutions. A second successful strategy, used at the National Portrait Gallery, was the close involvement of a senior member of the museum management team (the Head of Education), who was able to call on additional help and resources as required.

Where project co-ordinators were on temporary appointments, unfamiliar with the museum, and unable to call on (in fact had to fight for) additional resources, things were much more difficult.

#### 11.6.4 Project workers with appropriate skills and experience

If any project is to be carried out successfully, the specific work that the project worker is going to do needs to be worked out carefully, and the necessary skills and experience defined. While this seems obvious, it did not always happen. Sometimes people were appointed with some, but not all of the skills needed, and sometimes people more-or-less rewrote their own job-descriptions after appointment to suit their own interests, while neglecting their actual responsibilities. However, many museum staff spoke enthusiastically of the skills, energies, community contacts and new knowledge that their short-term project workers brought into the museum. Where this worked well, new ideas and energies carried the project forward.

#### 11.6.5 Participants and partners needs are met

For partnership projects to work, all partners must feel a sense of ownership. This means careful negotiation of agendas and approaches, and thoughtful consideration of multiple perspectives by all parties. It is not enough to inform people what is going to happen; if this does not accommodate their interests, requirements and constraints, then problems will ensue. An understanding of how other organisations and individuals operate, and a realistic identification of the strengths and weaknesses of all partners is essential at the start of projects. Where projects built on existing networks and relationships, it was easier to identify both what partners needed and what could be achieved with the resources available.

Museums attempting to build successful partnerships with community groups face a considerable challenge as the value positions of museums and community groups are unlikely to be very close. The issues that emerge can only be resolved through discussion and mutual accommodation.

#### 1.6.7 The need for time, support, experience and planning

The five critical success factors are all required if projects are to be successful. The evaluation showed that in some projects, some of these elements were in place, but others were not, and thus, however strong the existing critical success factors, problems emerged. The five elements all take time to build and critically review. In order for projects to have maximum chance of success and maximum impact within the museum, the director and senior staff need to actively support the work. Only by understanding the project can it be used for effective advocacy with the museum's stakeholders and governors – and these projects have considerable potential to be used in this way. The museum staff who manage and deliver these projects require considerable levels of experience, skill and knowledge. The evaluation has shown the sophistication of the decisions and judgements that have to be made, and the range of knowledge of diverse organisations that is needed to both develop and monitor the projects. High-level leadership and management skills are essential in overseeing these complex, innovative and fast-moving projects, which need to be well planned in advance.

#### 11.6.8 The time-scale of projects

There was considerable anxiety at the beginning of the work on these projects about timing. Some of this anxiety remained a concern at the end of projects. There were anxieties about the time permitted to develop the initial bid, which was far too short, and the evaluation has shown some of the effects of this on the projects and partnerships that emerged. There were problems over matching the project time-table to the timetables of schools and curriculum – and this is out of the hands of the museums who are limited to understanding how schools are required to work and then fitting in with these requirements. There were also anxieties about the short time-scale of the delivery of the projects, although here, there were also a number of positive comments about the energy generated by having to move fast to get things done. It is also true to say that the rapid time-scale did, to some extent, generate creative solutions to problems that could not wait for more ponderous resolutions.

# 11.7 The impact of the DCMS/DfES programme on schools - the use of museums by teachers

Most of the projects worked with schools. A large part of the evaluation focused on assessing the impact of this work. This section describes the schools that were involved with the DCMS/DfES projects, describes the pupils who completed questionnaires, the way teachers used museums and what they felt about this. Comparisons are made to comparable data from the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation.

#### 11.7.1 The Evaluation Packs – Form A for teachers

There were 29,701 contacts with school pupils as part of the 12 DCMS/DfES projects from September 2003 to March 2004. Teachers visiting museums (and in some cases receiving outreach visits) were asked to complete questionnaires (Form A) about their visits. They were also given the opportunity to allow their pupils to complete questionnaires. These questionnaires were contained in Evaluation Packs.

A total of 620 Evaluation Packs were distributed to teachers and students by 27 organisations across 10 of the 12 projects in the DCMS/DfES Programme. 545 packs were received back by RCMG, a very high overall response rate of 88 %. Of these packs, 503 contained teachers' questionnaires that were suitable for analysis.

These represented 424 distinct museum visits, which involved 12,009 pupils, accompanied by 735 teachers and a further 1458 adults.

## 11.7.2 The schools using museums as part of the DCMS/DfES programme

From September 2003 to March 2004, the majority of schools visiting museums as part of the DCMS/DfES scheme were primary schools (71% of the total). Secondary schools and colleges made up 18% of the total and there was a very low proportion of other schools such as special and private schools. When these findings are compared with those from the Renaissance in the Regions Education programme evaluation it can be seen that the DCMS/DfES programme reached a higher proportion of secondary schools (18% of the total compared with 13%).

Just under one third of the visits from schools in the DCMS/DfES programme were located in wards classified (by IMD2004) as the twenty percent most deprived, and where child poverty is highest (according to IADCI).

#### 11.7.3 The pupils responding to questionnaires

Two age-related questionnaires (Form B) were prepared for pupils to complete. 9415 completed Forms B were returned to RCMG in the Evaluation Packs (approximately 63% of the pupils whose teachers completed their own questionnaires).

- 7354 pupils completed Form B KS2 (78% of the total of pupils completing forms, compared to 86% of the total for Renaissance in the Regions)
- 2061 pupils completed Form B KS3 and above (22% of the total of pupils completing forms, compared to 14% of the total for Renaissance in the Regions)

Looking at the pupils, it can be seen that 78% of pupils were Key Stage 2 and below and 21% of students were Key Stage 3 and above. At KS2, the gender breakdown was male 48% and female 50%; at KS3 there were more girls (56%) than boys (42%). Thus the DCMS/DfES programme attracted more older pupils than the Renaissance in the Regions programme and of these older pupils, more were girls (56% of the total compared to 50%). Further differences emerge with the older pupils when comparing the DCMS/DfES data with the Renaissance data. Where the older pupils were highest in number at 11 years, and numbers declined steadily as pupils got older, with the DCMS/DfES programme, there was a high proportion of pupils at 13 and 14 years, and less at the older and younger ages. This suggests that secondary schools are attracted to museums where the projects are seen to be relevant. It is difficult to know why higher numbers of older girls than boys were taken to the museums. Was this because of the type of projects offered? Are boys not expected to be interested in cultural/historical matters? Further research would be needed to tease out the answers to these questions.

#### 11.7.4 Teachers' use of and attitude to museums

66% of teachers responding to the questionnaires said that the visit they had just made was the first time they had visited this museum with a class. The DCMS/DfES programme attracted more teachers who were new to museums than the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation, where 47% were first time users of the museums concerned. 78% of these teachers used other cultural organisations, compared to 85% of the Renaissance teachers.

When asked 'To what extent has the experience of this visit increased your confidence to use museums more as part of your teaching?' 56% of teachers who responded to this question agreed that the visit was very likely to have increased their confidence in using museums, and a further 34% thought it was quite likely. For Renaissance in the Regions, 62% of teachers thought it was very likely to increase their confidence and 27% thought it quite likely to increase their confidence.

The majority of teachers said that museums were either very important (47%) or important (47%) to their teaching. In the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation, 58% of teachers said that museums were very important to their teaching and 37% said it was important. Overall, 85% of teachers visiting museums as part of the DCMS/DfES scheme agreed that their visit was directly linked to the curriculum. This was less than for the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation where 94% of teachers agreed with this question. Most teachers who completed Form A were satisfied with their museum visit. 68% of teachers were very satisfied and a further 28% were satisfied. This is comparable to the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation, although here slightly more (72%) teachers were very satisfied with the museum's provision, while a further 24% were satisfied. The overall slight drop in confidence and satisfaction with the DCMS/DfES teachers can probably be explained by the fact that more of them were new to museums and were uncertain about how useful they would in the end prove to be.

#### 11.7.5 The themes that teachers used

Teachers were asked to specify the theme that their class was studying. The responses to this question were coded into the following categories: History, Science/Technology, Geography, Art, Citizenship and PSHE, Literacy/English, Cross-curricular and Other. Most teachers in the DCMS/DfES programme were visiting for themes related to History (51%), Science/Technology (26%) and Art (18%), with much smaller proportions for other subjects. A comparison with the breakdown of themes in the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation reveals important differences. In the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation, the proportion of teachers bringing groups for History related themes was far higher, at 70%. The proportion visiting for Science/Technology and Art themes was lower (7% and 15% respectively). The DCMS/DfES programme has given proportionately more emphasis to Science/Technology themes and less to History themes, although the majority of teachers were still studying History themes. The higher proportion of Science-themed visits is likely to be due particularly to the large number of Science sessions provided by the Partners in Time project with the Luton schools, while the Creative Canals project also focused on science.

The emphasis on science is interesting, as digging deeper into the data, it is those teachers who are working with science-based themes that are the least confident about using museums, and the least likely to use them in a broad-based way. Reviewing the question about whether the visit just carried out was likely to increase teachers' confidence, for example, teachers of science-based themes were least likely answer positively to this. There are significant opportunities here to be developed; museums are well-placed to work more closely with teachers to help them address the science curriculum. The inter-disciplinary methods used by museum educators enable a wide spectrum of collections to be considered from a science-based perspective. The chemistry of paint, for example, has been used to introduce pupils to science-based issues in art galleries.

# 11.8 The impact of the DCMS/DfES programme on learning - two illustrative examples

The main focus of this evaluation has been on the outcomes of learning. DCMS/DfES suggested a suite of learning outcomes and these are identified below. The outcomes of learning from two projects are then presented to show how museum work achieves these and other outcomes.

#### 11.8.1 The learning outcomes suggested by DCMS/DfES

In the project brief, DCMS/DfES identified a number of possible learning outcomes for pupils, teachers and community members. The learning outcomes identified for pupils and teachers are linked to the Generic Learning Outcomes in the table below.

Learning outcomes for children	Knowledge and understanding Skills	<ul> <li>Increased learning within a subject area</li> <li>Increased understanding of connections between subjects</li> <li>Increased learning across subjects</li> <li>Increased cultural understanding</li> <li>Increased ability to work with others</li> </ul>
		<ul> <li>Ability to make informed choices beyond and within planned experiences</li> </ul>
	Attitudes and values	<ul> <li>Increase in self-confidence and self-esteem for children</li> </ul>
		<ul> <li>Increased cultural understanding and respect and tolerance for others</li> </ul>
	Enjoyment, inspiration, creativity	<ul> <li>Fulfilment and satisfaction from achievement for children</li> </ul>
	Action, behaviour, progression	<ul> <li>Increased involvement in class, school or community events</li> </ul>
Learning outcomes for	Attitudes and values	<ul> <li>Positive attitudes to experience and desire for further experiences</li> <li>Increase in confidence, expertise and personal</li> </ul>
teachers		<ul> <li>satisfaction of teachers</li> <li>Increase in satisfaction of schools with museum education programmes (eg: as seen through educational attainment of children)</li> </ul>

This evaluation has produced a very large amount of evidence of the impact on pupils' learning of the programme. Each of the case-studies has produced an impressive range and depth of evidence. The learning outcomes from two case-studies are summarised below to show how, in each case-study, the suggested outcomes are achieved, as are some others.

#### 11.8.2 What the children and the teachers learnt through Anim8ed

Anim8ted is a partnership between the National Museum of Photography, Film and Television, and Cartwright Hall in Bradford and the Castle Museum in York to explore the potential of animation as a learning tool for delivering a variety of subjects across the National Curriculum. The project used museum and gallery collections to inspire young people to create their own animations by working with an artist.

Knowledge and	How TV cartoons are made	
understanding	<ul> <li>What side-views and close-ups are</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>It takes 12 pictures a second for an animation</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>New vocabulary (animation stamps, frames, short-cuts)</li> </ul>	
	Ganesh and Shiva	
	<ul> <li>Even a static picture tells a story</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>How feelings can be shown in a picture</li> </ul>	
Skills	<ul> <li>Keyboard skills – how to use the control and arrow keys</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Maths skills related to the time factor in animation production</li> </ul>	
	How to use the pipette	
	<ul> <li>How to manipulate the figures</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Communicating with new peers (learning new names from new</li> </ul>	
	cultures)	
	Working in groups	
	<ul> <li>Planning, sequencing, managing processes</li> </ul>	
Attitudes and	<ul> <li>Increased feeling of individual self-confidence</li> </ul>	
values	<ul> <li>Positive attitudes to new friends</li> </ul>	
	Positive attitudes to culture	
	<ul> <li>Feeling of ownership of animation processes</li> </ul>	
Enjoyment,	<ul> <li>Inspired by the paintings at Cartwright Hall</li> </ul>	
inspiration,	<ul> <li>Enjoyed the visit and the work there</li> </ul>	
creativity	<ul> <li>Enjoyed the whole project</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Used their imaginations and creativity throughout the project</li> </ul>	
Action,	<ul> <li>Increased confidence in their practical skills</li> </ul>	
behaviour,	<ul> <li>All of the children from Margaret McMillan School expressed a</li> </ul>	
progression	wish to go back to Cartwright Hall	

The evaluation found an excellent range of learning outcomes for pupils:

The learning outcomes for teachers included:

Knowledge and understanding	<ul> <li>Changed perceptions of what animation can be used for e.g. in numeracy, PE, RE, literacy</li> </ul>
Skills	<ul> <li>Learning animation skills alongside the pupils e.g. duplicating frames</li> <li>And improved teaching skills - Increasing pupils understanding through putting theory into practice e.g. literacy</li> </ul>
Attitudes and values	<ul> <li>Enthusiasm of pupils inspires and pleases the teachers (increased satisfaction with museum's provision)</li> </ul>
Enjoyment, inspiration, creativity	<ul> <li>Inspiration to teach in more creative ways</li> <li>Increased pleasure from teaching e.g. literacy a "grind" so can help to make it less so through animation</li> </ul>
Action, behaviour, progression	<ul> <li>More confident using animation - seeing increased possibilities for using it across the curriculum</li> </ul>

# 11.8.3 What the pupils and teachers learnt through *People, Places, Portraits*

Beningbrough Hall is a National Trust property 8 miles outside York and a longstanding partner of the National Portrait Gallery. At Beningbrough, rural schools experienced a visit to the Hall and outreach work with a digital photographer and artist, based on the appreciation and understanding of portraiture, art and history. This included looking at portraits, historical role-play, making their own portraits and digital photography.

Pupils learning included:

<ul> <li>How identity can be shown in a picture</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>How composition works in making a painted and</li> </ul>	
photographic portrait	
<ul> <li>How to link images from the past to the present</li> </ul>	
How to use a digital camera	
How to use the word processor to manipulate images	
<ul> <li>That Beningbrough Hall was interesting and</li> </ul>	
memorable	
Positive attitudes to culture	
<ul> <li>Feeling of ownership of portraits</li> </ul>	
Increased confidence in their practical skills	
<ul> <li>Inspired by the paintings at Beningbrough</li> </ul>	
Enjoyed the visit and the work there	
Enjoyed the whole project	
Used their imaginations and creativity throughout the	
project	
Experienced the Hall and grounds and the portraits	
Experienced role-play	
<ul> <li>Followed a lengthy project across several weeks</li> </ul>	
• Displayed their work in the classroom and labelled the	
portraits	
<ul> <li>Applied learning at Beningbrough in the classroom</li> </ul>	
Expect to go back at some point	

Teachers' learning included:

Knowledge and understanding	Broader perspectives - history and story behind Art
Skills	<ul> <li>Using digital cameras and laptops</li> </ul>
Attitudes and values	<ul> <li>Satisfaction from access for school pupils to broader and richer experiences through the visit</li> </ul>
Enjoyment, inspiration, creativity	<ul> <li>A special experience - access to "real" objects</li> </ul>
Action, behaviour, progression	<ul> <li>Access to specialists and new perspectives for teaching Art and other areas of the curriculum</li> <li>Increased experiences for teachers (personal and professional)</li> </ul>

The learning outcomes from the two case-studies summarised above are examples of the scope and depth of learning across the DCMS/DfES programme as a whole. They show very clearly how effective museums can be in stimulating learning across the range of dimensions encompassed by the five Generic Learning Outcomes.

In the next section, each of these GLOs is briefly considered in turn. More details of the learning outcomes from these and the other six case-studies are presented in the full report.

# 11.9 The impact of the DCMS/DfES programme on learning in schools: The five Generic Learning Outcomes

The Generic Learning Outcomes approach was used to focus the evaluation, to structure research tools and to analyse and interpret the data. Teachers were asked how important for their pupils they thought each of the GLOs was as a result of the museum visit (or museum outreach). In this section, each of the GLOs is considered in turn, looking at the extent to which the teachers expected the pupils would have achieved each outcome; this is then placed in relation to what the pupils said they had achieved. In each case, pupils are more positive about their learning than teachers. A very small sample of qualitative data from younger pupils is presented. Finally, some of teachers' barriers to using museums, which were exposed by the research, are listed.

#### 11.9.1 Valuing the GLOs

Teachers completing questionnaires were asked how important they considered each of the five Generic Learning Outcomes to be. Each GLO was rated separately on a scale from 'very important' to 'not at all important'. Teachers classified the GLOs as 'very important' as follows:

Enjoyment, inspiration, creativity	79% *
Knowledge and understanding	63%
Attitudes and values	55%
Action, behaviour, progression	50%
Skills	46%

\*(i.e. 79% of those teachers completing questionnaires rated EIC as 'very important')

From this, it can be seen that teachers value museums most highly for the enjoyment and inspiration that their pupils gain. Knowledge and understanding is also important, while other outcomes seem less important for teachers. There were only minor differences between teachers of primary and secondary pupils.

Combining the numbers of teachers ticking 'very important' and 'important' in the case of both Enjoyment, inspiration, creativity and Knowledge and understanding, it emerges that 97% of teachers tick either of these categories in both cases. Clearly both these GLOs are of very high importance to all teachers. Evidence from the teachers' questionnaires and focus groups during the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation also showed how strongly enjoyment and inspiration are linked to knowledge gain. In the focus groups carried out for the earlier research, teachers continually emphasised the value of visiting museums, the fun that pupils experienced and the long-term knowledge-based learning that ensued. This is now confirmed by this research. It is clear from the teachers' questionnaires that
museums are felt to strongly enable learning across these two dimensions. This is an extremely strong endorsement of the value of museums.

When the values accorded to the five GLOs are analysed according to the themes the teachers are following with their pupils, some significant differences do, however, emerge. The table below shows the percentages of teachers classifying each GLO as 'very important', cross-tabulated with the theme on which they are working during their involvement with the museum. When teachers (and these are largely primary teachers) are working on art-based themes, they are less concerned with the knowledge and understanding that will result from their museum use than when they are working on either history-based or science-based themes. For example, it can be seen that 68% of teachers working on history-based themes rated Knowledge and Understanding 'very important' compared with 45% of teachers working on art-based themes.

	History	Art	Science
Enjoyment, inspiration, creativity	79%	80%	75%
Knowledge and understanding	68%	45%	64%
Attitudes and values	57%	63%	45%
Action, behaviour, progression	51%	46%	51%
Skills	46%	48%	41%

### 11.9.2 Enjoyment, inspiration, creativity

When asked how important Enjoyment, inspiration, creativity is for their pupils' learning in museums, 79% of teachers rated this as very important. From the pupils' responses to questionnaires, it is very clear that this learning outcome is being achieved. 91% of pupils at KS2 and below agreed that they had enjoyed the visit. The evidence from the KS2 pupils in the Renaissance in the Regions research was very similar to that from the DCMS/DfES evaluation; 94% of pupils at KS2 and below stated that they had enjoyed the visit.

The (DCMS/DfES) older pupils were also enthusiastic about museums, with 64% of the KS3 and above pupils agreed that a museum visit or outreach session was inspiring for school-work. While this is percentage could be seen as rather low, the question itself is not one that teenagers would normally be asked, and the positive character of the response is very encouraging.

Pupils were more enthusiastic and confident about the value of museums in inspiring work at school than teachers expected. With the DCMS/DfES evaluation (unlike for Renaissance in the Regions) it has been possible to cross-tabulate the responses of teachers and pupils in relation to the pupils' enjoyment and inspiration. Even where teachers were not convinced that their pupils would enjoy or be inspired by their visit, approximately two-thirds of their pupils stated that museums did make school-work more inspiring. This more positive outlook was found on more than one occasion when cross-tabulations were carried out, which suggests either that museums have a greater potential to stimulate learning than teachers are. In either case, it suggests that teachers can use the enthusiasm, and learning, more effectively than they are at present.

Many examples of enjoyment and creativity can be found in the case-studies. *Anim8ed* offered a chance to think in imaginative and creative ways, which engaged the children deeply. The children were inspired by the paintings at Cartwright Hall. They looked at *Nursery Rhymes for Dmitri* by Balraj Khanna, and used their imaginations to find shapes for their animations. The interest and engagement at the museum inspired creative thinking after the visit. As one child, at Lees School, described: "Last night, before I went to bed I were thinking of some more, and when they blow up, I thought of the spaceship spinning and getting smaller and smaller, then it came back, picked the buggy up, dropped it, and the spaceman came back, and then it went on his head and hit him right in the ground."

While inspiration is not perhaps what might be expected from a collection of artefacts related to the slave trade, when asked if she had been inspired by her experience, one 14-year old girl from St Thomas More School in Bristol thought for a moment and then replied: "If I wasn't gonna try before, I would try now, because the sort of people who don't believe in Black people, I would try just to show them... It inspired me in a different way that I haven't been inspired before. It makes you feel that learning, pushing yourself, is actually worth something. Sometimes you think what's the point, but if you went to the museum, you think well it is actually worth something, that pride and dignity that they took away from the slaves it's worth giving it back to them."

This extremely powerful reaction to museum objects is only unusual in that, in this instance, the girl concerned experienced a very strong affirmation of her identity. The strength of the reaction and the impact on her sense of life purpose is perhaps rare – however, objects frequently have powerful effects in motivating learning and increased self-confidence; and indeed, in this study, other examples were found of strong impact on the developing sense of self. The lack of research into the power and depth of the impact of museum collections on learning means that this finding is difficult to place in the context of other research.

### 11.9.3 Knowledge and understanding

Teachers valued Knowledge and understanding highly, with 63% rating this GLO as very important, and 34% as important. When asked whether they thought their pupils would have gained subject-specific facts during their museum experience, 67% of teachers replied that this was very likely. The evidence from their pupils suggests that this is being achieved, possibly to a higher degree than teachers expect. Pupils at KS2 and below were asked if they had learnt some interesting new things, and 90% of pupils agreed with this. Did the pupils understand what they had been exposed to at the museum or outreach session? Although the majority of younger pupils agreed with this statement whilst 21% were either not sure or did not understand most of the activity.

There were a number of questions about knowledge and understanding for pupils of KS3 and above.

- **89%** of KS3 and above pupils agreed that '*I* discovered some interesting things from the visit today'
- **77%** of KS3 and above pupils agreed that '*The visit has given me a better understanding of the subject*
- **77%** of the KS3 and above pupils agreed that '*Today's visit has given me lots to think about*'
- **74%** of KS3 and above pupils agreed that '*I* could make sense of most of the things we saw and did at the museum'

The cross-tabulations between the teachers' and the pupils' responses show that where teachers feel it is not certain that their pupils will increase their subject-related understanding, pupils themselves feel more positive. When teachers answered that it was 'neither likely or unlikely' or that it was 'quite unlikely' that the visit would support pupils' subject-related understanding, 80% and 83% of their pupils respectively still answered yes when asked whether the visit had given them a better understanding of the subject.

One example that illustrates this is from *Take One Picture North East*. The story of Isabella and the Pot of Basil enabled the schools to talk about a challenging and disturbing subject and there were reservations from all the schools about the challenging subject of the painting. However, the pupils at St Marks School showed a depth of understanding concerning Isabella's fate – they were able to discuss difficult issues around relationships, death and violence with confidence and maturity.

### 11.9.4 Attitudes and values

Over half of the teachers (55%) rated Attitudes and values as a very important GLO. One of the detailed questions probed their views on the likelihood of pupils feeling more positive about museums and galleries, with just under half (47%) thinking this was very likely.

When asked whether they found the museums they visited an exciting place, 83% of KS2 and below pupils agreed with this statement; similarly 83% of the younger pupils agreed that a visit was useful for school work. 86% of the older students thought that museums were good places to learn in different ways from school. Pupils themselves, therefore, are very enthusiastic about learning in museums, and this enthusiasm is found at all ages and in both boys and girls. Teachers underestimate the potential of this.

Positive attitudes to culture and a feeling of ownership are generated in museums through pupils finding a way to build relationships with the collections. At Beningborough Hall, for example, pupils were impressed by their exposure to real portraits: "It just felt like I've seen the first one in my whole entire life." Pupils made personal connections to the paintings – "Well when you start drawing them it takes quite a while... you kind of feel like you've known this person" (Pupils from Goathland School).

Pupils' attitudes to learning and to themselves as learners can also change in museums. Pupils at Margaret McMillan School in Bradford, for instance, were given responsibility through sharing skills with others in their school, assisting with "evaluation" by interviewing each other with a camcorder, by voting for the best work, and by peer teaching. This approach increased their self-confidence and pride in their work: "It will be exciting... we're gonna watch it and if it's a good film I'm gonna feel that we worked really hard and we did our best" (Pupil, Margaret McMillan School). It has also been shown that *Anim8ed* increased pupils' confidence and self-belief through successful learning experiences.

### 11.9.5 Action, Behaviour, Progression

The active experiences that pupils (and teachers) have in museums and on museum outreach visits led to changes in behaviour and actions, and to progression more generally. Half of all teachers (50%) thought this a very important outcome. There were two questions for pupils on Form B KS2 and below that focused on the development and progression that might occur after the visit.

- **73%** of KS2 and below pupils agreed that '*The visit has made me want to find out more.*'
- **71%** of KS2 and below pupils agreed that '*Visiting has given me lots of ideas for things I could do.*'

Older pupils were asked if they might want to visit the museum in the future and 55% agreed that they might.

Again, it seems possible that teachers underestimate how much pupils can move forward in their learning as a result of engagement with museums. The *Anim8ed* project provided an example of two pupils who was able to articulate this process very clearly. During the life of the project, children developed their ICT skills and understood that their skills had grown. This enabled a clear expression of technical competence and of progression: – "Well, at the beginning I didn't know what were what and all the buttons, and she showed us what, all the buttons and now I can just do anything to animate now" (Pupil, Lees Primary School). "We practiced and now… we know how to do it". (Pupil, Margaret McMillan School).

### 11.9.6 Skills

It is a disappointment that only 46% of teachers appreciated the value of skills as a very important learning outcome. The quantitative evidence gathered through the questionnaires for teachers showed very clearly that all teachers focused less on the development of skills in their use of museums than on the enjoyment/inspiration and the development of subject-specific knowledge. This was also the case in the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation. Even in the case of teachers of science and technology-based themes, there was very little confidence about skills learning.

Again, pupils seem more aware of this particular potential than teachers. The KS3 and above pupils were asked about their view of the museum as a place where new skills can be picked up, and 70% agreed that it was.

This evaluation shows very clearly how skills can be introduced and enhanced when projects set out to teach skills, especially when this is planned carefully in advance with teachers. Each of the case-studies resulted in some skills development, and the two specific summaries above (*Anim8ted* and *People, Places, Portraits*) give particular examples.

Skills were a specific focus of *Partners in Time*. At Duxford, pupils were able to learn new concepts and ideas in the morning and practice the development of related skills in the afternoon by building structures using K'nex construction kits. Pupils were able to demonstrate their understanding and skills of symmetry and balance, design and construction. Their class teacher commented that, "They would not have made all these structures with triangles before – they've absorbed that from this morning."

The outreach sessions organised by Duxford to teach pupils the skills of analysing historical objects were also effective. The project manager commented: 'A general feedback that I've had has been that when schools have visited a museum after they've had an outreach session, they've noticed that the children get a lot more out of their visit because they're immediately homed in on the questions, they remember the questions that they were asked by Sue (the outreach worker)... and they're thinking, looking, what's it made from, why would it be made from that, are there any bits that move, thinking about those questions.'

There is work to be done by museums (and teacher-trainers) to make teachers more aware of this dimension of museum-based learning.

### 11.9.7 Pupils were amazed by...

The last section of the KS2 questionnaire asked the pupils what amazed them most about the visit. From the drawings and comments made by the pupils, it is clear that children were impressed and surprised by what they had experienced at the museum.

Below are two comments from returned Form Bs that illustrate some of the pupils' responses to their experiences.

What amazed me most on my visit..... The thing that amazed me on my visite is when they showed us what they would eat and what they would use to cook, and what sailors would ship to Africa, 1 learnt that British Sailors would take guns to Africa and brade for slaver who would be laker things from thousands of years ago and atually touching them and it amazing how heavy the coins Me feel. It also amazes Seeing people live like that years

### 11.9.9 Barriers for teachers

Although it is clear that museums are very effective in stimulating learning, teachers do not always use them. The evaluation has exposed a number of barriers to using museums.

- Transport and its organisation
- Administration and risk assessment
- Constraints of curriculum
- Getting cover for secondary teachers
- Knowledge of what is possible and realistic to expect museums to do
- Communication with the museum

# 11.10 The impact of the DCMS/DfES programme - the use of museums by communities

The projects of the DCMS/DfES programme included communities in addition to schools as audiences. The scope of the engagement with communities is presented below. 'Community' is a diffuse concept, and museums found a range of ways to interpret this. DCMS/DfES suggested a small number of possible outcomes for communities. Where community groups were already engaged in learning, museums were found to have potentially very strong impacts. Some barriers to engagement also emerged.

### 11.10.1 Community use of museums

There were 34,147 contacts with participants in community events, workshops and activities in the 12 DCMS/DfES projects between August 2003 and March 2004. In addition, there were 1609 contacts with community workers who facilitated these events, and also 1748 contacts with other participants who benefited from the projects more indirectly.

Museums interpreted 'communities' in a number of ways. Some examples of Community elements within projects include:

- Family Days and Adult Study Days at Montacute House (October to December) followed by outreach sessions with Brownie packs
- A small group of blind and partially sighted people working with Beningbrough Hall (January and February)
- Youth groups working with British Empire and Commonwealth Museum to produce a community travelling exhibition (October to March)
- Informal 'object of the month' talks for adults at Abbot Hall Art Gallery (February and March), using artworks on loan from Tate
- Approximately 2000 people taking part in the Big Draw linked to the *Image* and *Identity* project in Brighton and Hove (October)

A mixture of large and small scale events and workshops held by the V&A, including 1250 people who were involved in the 'Day of Record' project at London Asian Mela, 2231 people involved in the Big Draw in October, and much smaller numbers of

young people from NCH and the Gifted and Talented programme taking part in Saturday workshops.

### 11.10.2 DCMS suggested learning outcomes for communities

A small number of learning outcomes were suggested as appropriate for communities. These focused on attitudes to museums and the experience they offer.

Learning outcomes for communities						
Attitudes and values	<ul> <li>Improved outcomes (motivation, engagement, self- confident, comfort, satisfaction) for participants in museum programmes</li> </ul>					
	<ul> <li>Enhanced perception of importance and value of museum and services they provide amongst participants</li> </ul>					

The case-studies provide examples of how the involvement with museums can sometimes be much more substantial than might be expected in terms of learning outcomes, especially when museums are working with community groups who are engaged in activities that focus mainly on learning.

Two snapshots from the visit to the *Engaging Refugees and Asylum Seekers* project in Liverpool illustrate these learning outcomes for project participants.

## 11.10.3 Learning outcomes for Asylum Seekers and Refugees who are mothers of young children

Smithdown Bilingual Centre works with mothers to teach language and life-skills. Here, the research found the significance of the museum to the Centre was as:

- A venue for fun and for learning
- A place to stimulate learning
- A place to explore and share culture and experience
- A place to use resources
- An opportunity to develop life-skills

The significance to the participants included:

- Enjoyment
- Broadening knowledge of the city, it's facilities and environment
- Introducing the museum
- Increasing confidence (finding out how to make the visit, how to use the museum building, finding out that it offered appropriate (vegetarian) food for Muslims)
- Finding out how to use the museum for their own and their children's learning
- Linking the familiar and the new
- Learning in a different way (through mime, when language skills are not in place)
- Linking the museum and popular culture
- Increasing language skills

The members of this group that were interviewed were new to using museums and had initially not understood that museums could be useful for them or interesting. Having visited, these mothers felt they might be able to revisit, even without their husbands, with some confidence.

## 11.10.4 Learning outcomes for refugees and asylum seekers who are young people

An observation of a class visit to the Museum of Liverpool Life involved talking to the students and the tutor of a class of 14-16 year olds who were, or had been, refugees. This group had been using the museum every few weeks for a range of purposes, including visiting the *Grossology* exhibition, doing art workshops with an artist, a visit behind the scenes of the natural history galleries, followed by a visit to a nature centre with the Natural History curator, visiting the Egyptian galleries, and an African batik workshop. Further visits were planned to the Planetarium and the Titanic exhibition. Dance workshops were also planned. This group was being educated outside the formal classroom because of their various social challenges as refugees. The museums in Liverpool presented powerful resources in the absence of curriculum-based teaching materials.

Some of the pupils and their tutor described the learning outcomes:

- Learning about the city and the countryside, both orientating themselves geographically and gathering historical information
- Learning about English culture, which enables them to recognise and grasp references in books they read
- Specific language-based follow-up uses the museum experience to extend vocabulary and understanding
- Social interaction and relationships are encouraged (these teenagers came from a large number of diverse countries and did not know each other prior to the involvement with the college – they made friends during the museum visit and told each other their often harrowing stories)
- Deeper relationships with the lecturers and other adults were facilitated
- The motivation to find out more was stimulated
- The possibility of return visits was raised
- Students became aware of possibilities for work-placements or volunteer work
- They used knowledge gained in earlier visits on the later visits (i.e. they identified birds (greenfinches) they had seen on the trip to the nature centre when they saw the bird skins behind the scenes at the museum)
- They developed an enthusiasm to learn because of the often slightly bizarre museum experiences (we were told a story by one boy that involved snake pee! This had aroused his interest to discover more about snakes)

This group benefited from the power of the museum to enable social learning integrated with subject-based learning. Pupils needed to learn both about how their new country and city worked, but also needed to increase their knowledge of English language, history, natural history etc. They needed to learn about their own talents and skills, and also to find out how to relate to new people. The integrated and multi-faceted character of learning in the museum was very appropriate for these young people.

### 11.10.5 Individual learning identified

One student involved in the *Moving Minds* project in Manchester identified his own learning outcomes using the table of Generic Learning Outcomes:

- Knowledge and Understanding learning about the past
- Skills video recording, interviewing skills
- Attitudes and values he felt that elders were more valued in Chinese communities than in the West, and he already enjoyed this relationship – so the project did not change this for him
- Enjoyment, Inspiration and Creativity enjoying the project, being creative with video and making collage
- Actions, Behaviour, Progression he felt he could learn faster in the museum because the project was progressing rapidly through specific identifiable steps over a long period of time (whole afternoons)

### 11.10.5 Progression after involvement

One or two examples of progression emerged during the research. The Director of Marketing and Communications, NCH, wrote to the Director of Learning and Interpretation, V&A, quoting a member of NCH staff as reporting that, "one young person had a really good time (at the Young People's Conference) and as a direct consequence of his experience through *Image and Identity* has decided to apply to go to Art College to study Graphic Design."

## 11.10.6 The value of museums to communities, especially vulnerable and/or new communities

Museums can provide links between old familiar worlds and new worlds by using collections to compare the familiar and the unfamiliar across cultures. This enables people new to this country to see their familiar objects (e.g. a Yemeni souk or a Somali boat) in relation to English homes and modes of water transport, but it also enables those more familiar with English artefacts and ways of life to relate these to unfamiliar examples. Museums are well placed to play a dual role; to help establish a sense of this country, but also to demonstrate the significance of worldwide cultures. Museums give meaning and significance to diverse cultural material.

Museums can establish a sense of place, and can help new and migrant communities to establish a sense of place in their new home city and country, and to better understand the context of their environments by introducing its history and environment. They can broaden experiences and horizons and extend skills of citizenship, including language skills.

In making relationships between former and present artefacts and ways of living, museums have the potential to enable a broadening of identity. This can help those who need to find ways to reconcile their individual pasts with their current opportunities and their future aspirations. Free museums are especially important for refugees and asylum seekers on low incomes.

### 11.10.7 Exposing the barriers to museum use

Some barriers to the use of museums, particularly by new communities, emerged during the evaluation:

- Lack of awareness of museums
- Feeling excluded "Not for the likes of me."
- Lack confidence "Understanding art"
- Perceptions "Fusty, boring, unwelcoming."
- Perception of actual provision as inadequate "Food in restaurant for Muslims, prayer rooms."
- Limited travel outside immediate area
- Costs of travel

- Time required if distant
- Language

### 11.11 The impact of the DCMS/DfES programme on museums

The evaluation research focused on the impact of the DCMS/DfES programme on the outcomes and impact of learning. This concentrated on pupils' and teachers' learning in schools, and learning for community groups. However, it became clear during the research that there was also an impact on the museums who were involved. Although this impact is clear in much of what has already been presented, some further elements are summarised below. These include new resources that have been produced during the programme and factors that suggest the potential for future impact.

### 11.11.1 A range of new resources produced during the programme

The DCMS / DfES programme enabled museums to develop a range of different resources to disseminate their projects to schools, communities and the wider museum community. Some of these include:

New teachers'	• The Transatlantic Slave Trade at Bristol Industrial Museum:
resources	A Resource for KS3 teachers - Bristol Museums and Art
	Gallery
	Freedom - National Maritime Museum
	<ul> <li>Image and Identity - V&amp;A</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Take one picture - National Gallery / Laing Art Gallery</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>4x resource folios – Beningbrough Hall</li> </ul>
	The Box – New Art Gallery Walsall
	Money Matters – Manchester Museum
CD-ROM / DVD /	<ul> <li>Transatlantic Slavery Gallery Virtual Tour - National</li> </ul>
video	Museums Liverpool
	<ul> <li>Anim8ed – National Museum of Photography, Film and</li> </ul>
	Television
	<ul> <li>Making the most of museums (teacher training video) – IWM</li> </ul>
	Duxford
	<ul> <li>Image and Identity – V&amp;A</li> </ul>
Increased handling	Manchester Museum
collections	<ul> <li>Understanding Slavery Museum partners</li> </ul>
Schools	National Maritime Museum
programmes and	<ul> <li>Slavery: Interpreting the evidence - British Empire and</li> </ul>
workshops	Commonwealth Museum
	<ul> <li>Money Matters and 'Explorer' sessions – Manchester</li> </ul>
	Museum
	Science Museum
	IWM Duxford
New websites	<ul> <li>Anim8ed – <u>www.nmpft.org.uk/anim8ed</u></li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Moving Minds – <u>www.moveyourmind.org.uk</u></li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Take one picture – <u>www.takeonepicture.org.uk</u></li> </ul>
Professional	<ul> <li>Evaluation Toolkit and Best practice guide for engaging</li> </ul>
development	refugees and asylum seekers, National Museums Liverpool
materials	<ul> <li>Toolkit: What makes an effective partnership? – V&amp;A</li> </ul>

Exhibitions, displays and interpretive materials	<ul> <li>Evaluation Toolkit and Best practice guide for engaging refugees and asylum seekers, National Museums Liverpool</li> <li>Interpretive materials for blind and partially sighted – Beningbrough Hall</li> <li><i>InsideOut</i> exhibition – Sheffield Galleries and Museums Trust</li> <li><i>Image and Identity</i> exhibition and Young Peoples' Conference V&amp;A</li> <li>Enhanced permanent displays – NMPFT, Cartwright Hall Art</li> </ul>
	Gallery, Bradford and York Castle Museum

### 11.11.2 Building resources and future impact

Foundations have been laid which will enable the museums to develop the success, impact and momentum of the projects:

- A network of artists and freelancers; at the Laing Art Gallery, for example, the artists used for *Take one picture North East* have developed their capability of working with disadvantaged young people and museums
- Training and development of volunteers; for example at Manchester Museum, and Montacute House
- Greater understanding of the issues and challenges faced by partner museums and organisations
- Increased understanding of the needs of target groups and audiences; e.g. Beningbrough Hall (rural schools), National Museums Liverpool and partner museums (Refugees and asylum seekers)
- A range of new partners and contacts, with whom skills and expertise can be shared. For example, National Museums Liverpool worked with the LEA advisor for refugees and asylum seekers to target specific groups including bilingual families through the Smithdown Bilingual Centre and young refugees and asylum seekers in formal education and Beningbrough Hall responded to the needs of rural schools through consultation with LEA senior Humanities advisor, who had a clear understanding of the issues around rural exclusion in North Yorkshire
- Consolidating relationships between former partners and establishing plans for the future. For example, the V&A had already worked with NCH to reach young disadvantaged young people, often excluded from school, through the regional networks established by the Charity; the DCMS/DfES programme confirmed the value of the partnership for both organisations and its success has led to the extension of the partnership for a further 2 years
- New schools using museums. 66% of teachers involved in the DCMS / DfES programme were visiting that museum with a class for the first time.
   Transport subsidies helped many schools from areas of rural and urban exclusion to cover the costs of visiting museums. Norfolk Museums Service reported to IWM Duxford that many schools were using them for the first time because they perceived them as flexible and able to fit into their needs

- Professional development for staff. For many of the museum staff involved in the programme, coping with the demands of the tight timescale, managing larger budgets and administration across partner museums and organisations was significant for their own professional development. This remains as an important long-term benefit to the organisation and the profession. Specific examples are at Duxford and the Laing.
- Development and trialling of current educational workshops and new projects. *Understanding Slavery* acted as a pilot phase for the museums involved, and a second phase will consider long-term learning and access strategies for future partnership working.

### **11.12 Key issues for the future**

The analysis of the impact of the DCMS/DfES programme has revealed a number of key issues that are important in considering future work of this kind. In the final section of the conclusions, these key issues for the future are discussed.

## 11.12.1 The potential of museums revealed by the evaluation of the DCMS/DfES programme

The potential for museum-based learning is shown very clearly in this research.

Museums:

- Engage learners across all age ranges
- Engage both boys and girls
- Engage vulnerable pupils and those that find learning difficult
- Can operate effectively in relation to deprivation and disadvantaged individuals and groups
- Can work in relation to all curriculum areas
- Can work effectively with primary and secondary curricula (although secondary schools have specific difficulties getting out of school)

A great deal of highly successful work has been carried out and in many cases, the impact on learning is extremely impressive. The majority of schools that museums worked with were located in areas of very high levels of deprivation. Some of the communities that museums engaged with were very challenging. It is clear that there is a huge potential for using museums to engage with children and young people who have challenges when it comes to learning and who are often not reached, or stimulated, by more conventional methods of teaching. This is in addition to the power that museums have to work with mainstream formal education, and with informal museum visitors, which should not be forgotten. Museums can work effectively with both special needs and vulnerable groups <u>and also</u> with the mainstream.

## 11.12.2 Maximising the potential of museums – the development of strategy

The evaluation research for the DCMS/DfES programme shows the great power and potential of museums as places to stimulate and enhance learning. This has also been shown in recent years by a number of large scale research and evaluation projects (for example, the evaluations of MGEP1 and MGEP2, and the Renaissance in the Regions evaluation).

The challenge now is to find the structures and the means to use this power more effectively and more consistently. This means developing a more structured and focused strategic approach. It may mean developing this approach slowly, in consultation with senior staff in museums, and with other key stakeholders. It may mean considering how this initiative can operate in relation to other related initiatives (such as Renaissance in the Regions).

It may mean conceptualising the funding as 'development funds', available on a regular basis, and running alongside mainstream provision. 'Development funds' could be used to necessitate reflection and innovation. 'Development funds' could be used to require all museums who receive them to work on a few themes, for example rural exclusion, or children at risk, so that collectively there would be a large, but focused, impact. Such an impact would enable museums to demonstrate what they can do, to build relevant partnerships and to lay down sustainable strategies. This would give museums the opportunity to make their presence felt by those professionals and agencies who are more centrally engaged with mainstream social issues (e.g. health, social services, crime prevention, education). It would serve to build capacity in relation to specific fields of work. However, this approach necessitates a long-term vision, which may be difficult to sustain.

It has become clear during the research that museum education is very underresearched compared to other areas of educational provision. Museum education is not integrated into the mainstream here either. There are large sums being spent by the University Research Councils (ESRC, AHRB) on educational and cultural research, where museums figure rarely. Programmes such as the ESRC Teaching and Learning Programme, for example, established specific research projects to research strategies and procedures that can improve provision in various targeted areas. It may be that there are opportunities to link with these, or other programmes, for example, those funded through the DfES research division, in order to improve understanding of the potential of museum-based learning, and in order to integrate museums more fully into the various research communities.

### 11.12.3 Characteristics of the DCMS/DfES programme

While the additional funding for the DCMS/DfES programme presented significant and new opportunities for museums, there were several characteristics of the programme that were challenging.

The first concerns purpose and focus. In some respects the purpose of the programme was too broadly cast. A number of purposes were expressed in various documents at various points of time:

- To raise the status of education staff
- To increase numbers of education staff and quality and quantity of educational work
- To enable schools to use museums more effectively
- To enable museums to penetrate communities more deeply and effectively
- To enable museums to share good practice
- To establish long-term links across the museum field
- To effect culture change in museums

There is a sense in which the purpose of the funding is evolving, along with the evolution of the museum education strategy. Changes of personnel at DCMS have

also added to the fluidity of purpose. Clear and transparent definition of purpose would help structure project and organisational goals.

Secondly, the parameters of the DCMS/DfES programme as a whole were undefined, broad and unfocused. Museums could work in a number of ways, with a large choice of audiences, and with any appropriate theme. This meant that museums had to find their own audience and collection focus and this was not always done well. The funding has the power to make a significant contribution if focused in a narrower way.

Thirdly, the timescale for this programme was challenging. The invitation to bid was sent out in February 2003, and some education officers did not receive this until three weeks before the bids were due to be submitted. While the main emphasis of the programme was on school provision, there was no indication that the timetable on which schools operate was acknowledged. There was insufficient time for the bids to be developed as fully as they could have been and this meant that in many cases, ideas had to be developed very quickly, and partners contacted and secured. Some unrealistic (and un-researched) ideas resulted. However, where bids were built around well-established and successful practice some strong work was planned. A revised timing of bids and projects might suggest a longer period for planning and development while retaining a tight timetable for delivery.

Extra funding makes things happen. These things will happen more effectively if the purposes and parameters of the funding are clear and there is time to develop, plan and deliver the programme. This research shows that the will and the skill to respond is present in museums.

### 11.12.4 Museums and schools

### 11.12.4.1 Teachers' attitudes to and use of museums

Teachers' satisfaction levels and confidence levels following museum use could be improved. The rates are consistently lower than was found in the Renaissance in the Regions research. The reasons for this may be because:

- Some projects were too unfocused and teachers were unclear what their benefit might be
- The link to the curriculum was poorly identified in some cases
- Where the link was identified, there was insufficient time to build the project into the curriculum
- Schools were not prepared for the projects and therefore were not ready to use them in an in-depth way
- Schools were not expecting the project and could not change their plans easily, so project were not fully integrated into mainstream teaching

### 11.12.4.2 Teachers' underestimation of the power of museums

There is evidence that teachers are underestimating the power of museums to stimulate learning and to provoke learning in some of the more intangible dimensions of learning. Pupils are consistently more positive about their learning than teachers are. The barriers to teachers' use of museums includes lack of awareness of the potential of museums and also lack of effective strategies to maximise that use.

### 11.12.4.3 Teaching science in museums

Teachers working on science-based themes were consistently less confident about the way they used the museum – their work was narrower in compass and they were less confident of success. Given that the bulk of the teachers were primary school teachers, who probably worked with themes relating to history and art and other subject areas as well as science, it is likely that it is the subject-matter that makes all (primary) teachers feel less confident rather than a specific group of teachers who are using museums less well than other groups. While this has broad implications about the teaching of science in general in schools, the evidence of this evaluation suggests that when museums work with science-based themes, they are very successful. Museums can, therefore, work with primary teachers to increase their skills and confidence with science-based work.

### 11.12.5 Museums and communities

The way museums are conceptualising 'community' is fluid. There are a number of ways in which communities might be defined and these include characteristics such as ethnicity, location, life-stage, interests. A range of ways of 'working with communities' was observed during the DCMS/DfES programme, including:

- General visitors to exhibitions or the museum
- Vulnerable or sick children
- Asylum seekers working with FE colleges
- Former refugees working on language skills
- People with specific disabilities
- Minority communities

While it is perhaps difficult to be specific in a generic discussion of 'communities', lack of clarity in relation to particular groups is problematic. Many communities have individual and unique characteristics. And, many communities are very difficult to access. In contrast to schools, the structures are not in place, it is hard to know who to contact, or when to do this. Some groups are very small, often informal, could be transient, and are often dependent on short-term and fugitive funding. In addition, there are fewer models of good practice to work with in the museum world, and far fewer people who are familiar with them, although there has been some significant development in this area.

With groups such as these, it takes a longer time to build relationships. It takes a long time to build expertise in working with these groups. Partnerships with organisations and agencies who are already involved with specific groups are essential and extremely valuable, as was demonstrated with the partnership with NCH. In some ways, museums can be very naïve in thinking they can do everything on their own without working alongside other professionals.

However, the work observed as part of this evaluation shows how very effective work with communities, especially vulnerable communities, can be. An engagement with communities is a very significant and important part of the work of museums, but it has to be planned for in the long term, and in acknowledgement of the issues.

## 11.12.6 Museums as resources where schools struggle – working with community organisations

This programme has shown how successful museum can be when working with low achievers and those who find learning a struggle. Many of the issues of low attainment and under-achievement in schools are the result of complex social issues, such as health, parental employment and education, and neighbourhood capacity.

Solutions are complex too, but frequently the focus of schools is inward, with an emphasis on improving achievement especially in literacy and numeracy.

Museums in partnership with community organisations, such as hospital schools, language centres and centres for children and young people at risk, can offer highly successful alternative approaches to learning, providing different routes to learning for these children and young people. Museums are good at providing alternative types of engagement. This is a strength which can complement the work of schools and colleges, but as yet the structures are not in place to enable this strength to be exploited. The partners that can help museums to move forward in working with complementary educational providers are unlikely to be formal education providers, so may be harder to identify. The national charity NCH is a very good example of this new way of thinking, but there must be other kinds of organisations or charities that could also offer valuable assistance to museums.

### 11.12.7 Issues for museums

Three large long-term and deeply embedded matters stand out as major issues for museums to consider when seeking to move with forward programmes such as these. These issues concern capacity, organisational culture and the expectations of audiences and partners.

Firstly, there is a capacity issue if museums are to increase and improve their work with schools and communities. Numbers of education and outreach staff at present limit what can be achieved. While numbers of education staff are increasing rapidly across the sector, this increase needs to be at least maintained, and in order to respond to programmes such as this, this increase may need to be more rapid. There are issues of supporting resources, and training. In addition, it is not more of the same that is needed, but more staff with a greater range of specialist expertise. If museums are to fulfil their potential to help teachers deliver science-based themes, for example, then science education staff are needed. Similarly, if museums wish to work in the long-term with specific community organisations such as hospital schools, then staff with knowledge and experience of these agencies are required. These are serious issues involving long-term strategic planning.

Secondly, if programmes such as the DCMS/DfES programme are to achieve their full potential, there needs to be further change in museum culture. Education needs to become a more central matter. A deeper understanding of what museums can achieve needs to permeate organisations. At present, education in museums is still conceived too narrowly. Education is frequently understood as intentional, purposeful and focused on collections. The inspirational and identity-forming elements of learning are seen as outside the compass of education. The contemporary focus on learning, and the conceptual framework of the Generic Learning Outcomes, seeks to go beyond the narrow cognitive definitions of 'education' to articulate a more powerful and deeper vision, one that can carry museums forward.

At present, many museums have not yet embraced education and learning as a core element of their culture. This research has found examples of the following:

- Heads of learning/museum education who are not at senior levels
- Museums which are not maximising the expertise of their education staff through involving them in exhibitions and forward planning
- Education staff who are burdened with too many initiatives that are not fully integrated into the museum as a whole.

If education were more centrally embedded in museum culture, we would see examples of consultative work with schools and communities feeding into major exhibitions; themes of programmes such as the DCMS/DfES programme being articulated through exhibitions so that the same conceptual and intellectual research informed both educational projects and exhibitions; curators and educators would work more closely together to develop related projects; directors and senior staff would be well informed about the objectives and outcomes of educational projects and would have met some of the partners and participants. Some of the issues that these ambitious projects tackled would be more embedded in the work of all museum staff and would be more visible through the interpretation of collections.

The ambitions and aspirations that underpin the projects in this programme are linked to broad and current social agendas. Some examples are the construction of identities in diasporic and post-colonial communities, the reconceptualisation of history and tradition to encompass previously hidden or buried histories, the working towards greater social justice and the combating of disadvantage and deprivation. These issues were very much to the fore in many of the projects. But, while these are central matters for museums on a global stage, and they are central to current government agendas in England, they are seldom discussed (in these terms) in many museums. Museums have a job that they can do here, and as these projects show, have the potential to do it, but these critical issues of identity, difference and voice need to become more central to museum philosophy.

This takes us on to the third issue, which is that of the expectations of audiences and partners. As this research shows, many actual and potential partners and members of visitors and users remain unaware of the great changes that have taken place in museums in recent years. Many community organisations, for example, do not expect museums to be interested or willing to work with them. Teachers are not all aware of how powerful museum learning can be, are not always sure how to use the museum to fit in with the curriculum and do not understand the broad dimensions across which museum can stimulate learning (e.g. attitudes and values, progression, skills). Museums have to connect into wider social networks and key contemporary agendas if museums are to fulfil the ambitions that they establish for themselves in projects such as these. The limited expectations of audiences and partners can be seen as clear evidence that these connections are weak at present.

While museums are changing, becoming more in tune with contemporary issues and more aware of their social potential, the DCMS/DfES programme shows how the social value of museums can be enhanced far beyond what is currently expected. This research provides examples of the extraordinary power of museums and their collections, but also shows clearly some of the challenges that museums face in realising this power.

## Appendix 1 Research Tools

- Form A: Evaluation of museum school visits
- Form B: My Visit Key Stage 2
- Form B: My Visit Key Stage 3 and above
- Form C: Numerical data collection of pupil usage September 2003 to March 2004
- Form E: Record of DCMS/DfES scheme community activities between August 2003 and March 2004
- Form H: Summary of DCMS/DfES Project

### Briefing Note for teachers

In this evaluation pack you will find:

- One copy Form A
- 40 copies Form B for KS2 pupils
- 40 copies of Form B for KS3 and above pupils

Please complete Form A yourself.

Please select the correct Form B and ask your pupils to complete it.

This is not a test but a highly valued contribution to a national research study of museums and learning.

Please hand the envelope with the completed Form A and Forms B to the museum staff BEFORE YOU LEAVE THE MUSEUM.

## Very many thanks for your help.

Renaissance in the Regions and DCMS/DfES Museum Education Evaluation



re:source

department for education and skills



### Form A: Evaluation of museum school visits

The Research Centre for Museums and Galleries (RCMG) at the University of Leicester has been commissioned by Resource: the Council for Museums, Archives and Libraries and by the Department for Culture, Media and Sport /Department for Education and Skills to evaluate the value to schools of a museum visit. Thank you for your help with this research.

## Please complete this short questionnaire and hand it to a member of museum staff BEFORE you leave the museum. Thank you.

Q1. Name o	of museum:								
Q2. Name	of teacher	completing	g this form	(PLEASE PRI	[NT):				
Q3. Date:	1 12	2003							
Q4. What	theme are	you studyii	ng?						
Q5. Name	of school vi	isiting:							
Address of	f school:								
			Pos	t code:					
Q6. Type o	of school (T	ick all the	boxes that	apply)					
Nursery	Primary	Infant □	Junior	Middle	Secondary	College	Special	Private	Non-UK
Q7. Year(s	) of pupils/	'students (	Tick all the	boxes that a	apply):				
Early Ye Receptio Y1		У2 У3 У4		У5 У6 У7		У8 У9 У10		У11 У12 У13	
Q8. Total r	number of p	oupils in th	e visiting gr	oup:					
Q9. Total r	number of t	teachers a	ccompanying	g the visiting	group:				
Q10. Total	number of	accompany	ying adults v	with the grou	ıp:				
Q11. Has tl	his school c	completed <sup>.</sup>	the 'My Visi	t' sheets?	Yes 🗆	No			
KS1 pupils	should not	complete c	ı 'My Visit' s	sheet.					

KS2 pupils should complete the 'My Visit KS2' sheets

KS3 and above should complete 'My Visit KS3 and above' sheets

### Your school's museum visit

Please complete this quick questionnaire to help us with a national survey of the value of museums to schools.

Q12. Is this your first visit (as a teacher) to this museum with a class?	Yes 🗆 No 🗆
Q13. Is the work done with the museum today directly linked to the curriculum?	Yes 🗆 No 🗆
Q14. Does your school make regular visits to cultural organisations?	Yes 🗆 No 🗆 Don't Know 🗆

#### We are interested in what your pupils will gain from the museum visit.

Q15. To what extent do you think pupils will have gained facts and information during their museum visit? (please tick one box for each)

	Very likely	Quite Likely	Neither	Quite unlikely	Very unlikely
Subject-specific facts					
Inter-disciplinary or thematic facts					
Information about museums or galleries					
Facts about themselves, their families or the wider world					
Other kinds of facts					

Q16. To what extent do you think that your pupils will have increased or gained skills during their museum visit? (please tick one box for each)

	Very likely	Quite Likely	Neither	Quite unlikely	Very unlikely
Numeracy skills					
Literacy skills					
Communication skills					
Spatial skills					
Thinking skills					
Social skills					
Practical skills					
Creative skills					
Other skills					

Q17. To what extent do you think the museum visit will have enabled pupils will to feel more positive about any of the following? (please tick one box for each)

	Very likely	Quite Likely	Neither	Quite unlikely	Very unlikely
Themselves and their abilities					
Other people/communities					
Learning					
Museums /galleries					
Anything else					

Q18. To what extent will you be using the museum experience to promote creativity? (please tick one box for each)

	Very likely	Quite Likely	Neither	Quite unlikely	Very unlikely
Designing and making					
Exploring new ideas					
Dance/drama					
Creative writing					
Other forms of creative work					

Q19. To what extent do you think that the experience of the museum will result in you working with your students in a different way? (please tick one box for each)

	Very likely	Quite likely	Neither	Quite unlikely	Very unlikely
Using their new skills					
Enabling them to work with their peers in new ways					
Undertaking new activities					
Other new ways of working in the classroom					

Q20. To what extent do you anticipate that the museum visit will support pupil development: (please tick one box for each)

	Very likely	Quite likely	Neither	Quite unlikely	Very unlikely
In their subject-related understanding					
In learning across the curriculum					
In their cultural understanding					
In increased motivation to learn					
In increased confidence					
In their assessed work					

Q21. For each of the following potential outcomes from the use of the museum, please could you rate the importance of each one in your view: (please tick one box for each)

	Very important	Important	Neither	Not very important	Not at all important
Knowledge and understanding					
Skills					
Attitudes and values					
Enjoyment, inspiration, creativity					
Activity, behaviour, progression					

#### And what do you feel about school visits to museums?

	Very important	Important	Neither	Not very important	Not at all important
Q22. How important are museums to your teaching?					
	Very satisfied	Satisfied	Neither	Dissatisfied	Very dissatisfied
Q23. How satisfied are you with the museum's provision?					
	Very likely	Quite Likely	Neither	Quite unlikely	Very unlikely
Q24. To what extent has the experience of this visit increased your own confidence to use museums as part of your teaching?					
Q25. Did you organise this visit?	Yes		No 🗆		
Q26. Would you be willing to be contacted later in our resear	ch? Yes		No 🗆		

Contact phone number (including STD): \_\_\_\_\_

Thank you very much for your time. Please return the form to the museum staff.

### Form B - My Visit

Key	Stage	2
-----	-------	---

What is your age? Are you Boy?	Girl?		
Please tick	Yes	No	Don't Know
1. I enjoyed today's visit			
2. I learned some interesting new things			
3. I could understand most of the things we saw and did			
4. This is an exciting place			
5. Visiting has given me lots of ideas for things I could do			
6. A visit is useful for school work.			
7. The visit has made me want to find out more			

Form B - My Visit Key Stage 3 and above

Age Male Female				
Please tick one box for each question	Yes	No	Don't Know	
1. Today's visit has given me lots to think about				
2. I discovered some interesting things from the visit today				
3. A visit to a museum/gallery makes school work more inspiring				
<ol> <li>The visit has given me a better understanding of the subject</li> </ol>				
<ol> <li>A museum visit is a good chance to pick up new skills</li> </ol>				
6. The museum is a good place to learn in a different way to school				
<ol> <li>I could make sense of most of the things we saw and did at the museum</li> </ol>				
8. I would come again				
9. I've left the museum more interested in the subject than when I came				
Renaissance in the Regions and DCMS/DfES Museum Education Evaluation	re:SOURC	***	For office use	

### Form C: Numerical data collection of pupil usage September 2003 to March 2004

Name of project	
Name of museum	
Museum code	
Name of person completing this form	

Please put the total number of pupils involved in DCMS Strategic Commissioning National / Regional Partnerships 2003 -2004 activities (including visits to museums, outreach to schools etc) in the table below:			
September			
October			
November			
December			
January			
February			
March			

Please send each monthly total by the 7 of the next month (e.g. September's figures for the 7 October, October's figures for the 7 November and so on).

Email to ...

Renaissance in the Regions and the DCMS / DfES Museum Education Evaluation



**Ve:Source** The Council for Museums, Archives and Libraries

education and skills



### Form E: Record of DCMS scheme community activities between August 2003 and March 2004

Name of project	
Name of museum	
Museum code	
Name of person completing this form	

Month	Total no. of participants in community activities	Total no. of community workers e.g. artists, poets, scientists, writers	Other participants*
August			
September			
October			
November			
December			
January			
February			
March			
*Please specify ot	her participants	1	

Please send each monthly total by the 7 of the next month (e.g. September's figures for the 7 October, October's figures for the 7 November and so on).

Renaissance in the Regions and the DCMS / DfES Museum Education Evaluation RCMG Research Centre for Museums and Galleries



education and skills



### Form H: Summary of DCMS/DfES Project

Name of lead museum:

Name of partner museums:

Aims of project

**Project description:** 

Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

Major intended outputs:

Major intended outcomes:

Appendices

## Appendix 2 Completed Form H

- The Story of Money
- Texts in Context
- Partners in Time
- People, Places, Portraits
- Understanding Slavery
- Anim8ed (formerly Animation!)
- Creative Canals
- Supporting Regional Schools
- Image and Identity
- Take one picture north, east, south, west
- Engaging refugees and asylum seekers
- Moving Minds

### Form H: Summary of DCMS/DfES Project

Title of project: Manchester Money Gallery Project

### Name of lead museum: The British Museum

Name of partner museums: Manchester Museum

### Aims of project:

- To develop a long-term audience, particularly among schools, for the Manchester Money Gallery
- To increase understanding among visitors of all sorts of the history of money
- To increase access to British Museum and Manchester Museum collections in the Manchester Museum
- To deepen an already profitable relationship between the two museums
- To improve the British Museum's own programming on the subject of money

### **Project description**

- 1. An evaluation of the Manchester Money Gallery, leading to modifications and/or the development of resources to ensure that the gallery is appropriate and accessible for a wide range of audiences (in particular families and school children)
- 2. The development of schools' programme and resources on the subject of money (to include taught sessions in four subject areas and teacher-led 'Explorer' sessions)
- The establishment of a volunteer-run object-handling programme on the subject of money

## Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

- 1. KS2 students
- 2. Other visitors, and particularly those who find traditional museum displays inaccessible

#### Major intended outputs

- 1. 10,000 visitors using handling collection
- 2. 2,000 children to attend taught sessions
- 3. 30 schools trained in Explorer sessions
- 4. 30 schools to attend private view of gallery or teacher focus groups in gallery.
- 5. High quality teachers' resources on the subject of money; paper-based and webbased
- 6. A high quality handling collection of objects related to the history of money

### Major intended outcomes

The long-term legacy of the project will include:

- 1. An established volunteer programme, focussing initially on object handling in the galleries, but with considerable potential in other areas of museum operations
- 2. A gallery that will be accessible to a wider range of visitors than would otherwise have been the case
- 3. An established clientele for the gallery among a previously sceptical schools' audience, including a new style of teacher-led sessions
- 4. A rich public programme on the subject of money using a high-quality handling collection

### Form H: Summary of DCMS Project

Title of project: TEXTS IN CONTEXT

Name of lead museum: BRITISH LIBRARY

Name of partner museums: British Empire and Commonwealth Museum, Bristol Dorset County Museum Philpot Museum, Lyme Regis Roman Baths and Pump Room, Bath

### Aims of project

The aim of this project was to explore the possibilities for school students to engage with facsimile texts from different historical periods, representing situational variation. The central shared objectives of *Texts in Context* were that school students at KS3 or AS/A2 should: gain knowledge and understanding about language; develop skills in critical thinking; develop appropriate attitudes and skills related to research. The project was also designed to contribute to the professional development of teachers by extending their knowledge of new resources and their pedagogical skills in incorporating them into their practice. An additional aim was to enable museum educators to engage in an underdeveloped area and an innovative form of collaboration.

### **Project description**

The project involved a collaboration between the British Library (source of the texts), four museums and six secondary schools in the south west. Each teacher worked with one museum. Classes were from KS3 and AS/A2 level. The encounter with the facsimile texts lay at the heart of the project. The role of local museums was to enrich the possibilities for situating the texts in different contexts. Experiences through drama, simulation, site visits, handling artefacts and texts were incorporated. The museums also provided opportunities for students' directed and self-directed research. Student learning on the project was articulated by individuals or groups in a self-selected creative form.

A texts-only pilot in the autumn term, using facsimiles from recipe books from the 17<sup>th</sup> century to the present, was undertaken by the teachers. Then themes were negotiated jointly by teachers and museum educators for the major project. Texts in facsimile form were researched and produced by the British Library. Each class made two whole day visits to their museum. Themes were: Shipwrecks, Smuggling, Taking the Waters, Town and Tourists, Experiences of Empire. Discussions were designed to encompass the global and well as the local, the generic as well as the specific.

The creative outcome from an A2 class, for example was in the form of a radio programme from the 1903 Delhi Durbar incorporating interviews with Lord and Lady Curzon, an argument between a colonial hunter and a present day animal rights activist and several advertisements for Edwardian products. A KS3 class produced a multi-voiced narrative, based on a record in the church register of burials, of the death of a fifteen-year-old apprentice at the hands of preventive officers in a smuggling incident.

The evaluation of the project is informed by ongoing video and audio recordings in class and museums and by the creative responses. This is in conjunction with teachers records and reflections and interviews with all participants.

## Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

Eight teachers and their students from six schools in the SW region. The students in KS3 (three classes) include a high attaining Year 8 class, a high attaining Year 9 class and a lower attaining year nine class. Six A2 English Language (AQA) classes focussed on Language Change or Editorial Writing.

### Major intended outputs:

Digitised British Library Sources of facsimile texts made available generally to teachers and other interested parties.

Creative Projects by Students

Dissemination of the results of the project to teachers and others via the British Library website.

### Major intended outcomes:

- 1) To develop critical awareness of English in relation to world languages and history, making connections.
- 2) For students in the project to have developed positive attitudes in relation to the roles and potential of libraries, museums and record offices in learning
- 3) For students to have developed skills in research and critical thinking
- 4) Professional development for the teachers involved
- 5) An opportunity for the British Library to bring to light rarely seen texts, and for these to be available after the project in a sustainable way
- 6) For the museums to have a professional development opportunity for staff, experimenting with new types of education programme.
- 7) To correct an imbalance in the range of material available for English Language teaching in most secondary schools.
- 8) To address specifically recent developments in the AL English Language specifications and the new KS3 strategy for English which provide opportunities for development in English language study. In particular to provide resources to support thinking about texts as emerging out of a genealogy of text types, or registers and developing an understanding that all texts emerge out of cultures of production and are read in cultures of reception.

### Form H: Summary of DCMS/DfES Project

Title of project: Partners in Time

Name of lead museum: Imperial War Museum Duxford

### Name of partner museums:

Luton Museums Service Norfolk Museums and Archaeology Service Mid Anglia SATRO Ltd (Science and Technology Regional Organisation)

### Aims of project:

- To deliver activities supporting both History and Science & Technology elements of the National Curriculum by means of Outreach and museum visits in Norfolk and Luton, focussing on areas of deprivation
- To raise awareness in teachers of the resources available to them in regional museums
- To increase access to regional museums
- To increase motivation for using museums to support the curriculum

### **Project description:**

Schools in the relevant areas have been invited to join the project, which offers free skills based Outreach session per class in the relevant subject. They are then invited to visit two regional museums to support work being covered in the classroom. All museum admission and teaching is free of charge. In addition, each class participating is eligible to claim up to £150 per visit towards the cost of travel to the museums of their choice. The museums offer a range of programmes to appeal to as many school topics as possible.

## Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

Any class from targeted schools, from Year 1 to Year 10. Both mainstream and special schools have been invited to join.

#### Major intended outputs:

In each County involved in the project, 90 classes will have the opportunity to take part in a total of 3 sessions (an Outreach visit + 2 museum visits). Total possible numbers are therefore;

 $90 \times 2 = 180$  classes involved.

180 x 3 = 540 sessions, if each class takes its full quota of sessions

540 x 30 (assuming the average class size to be 30 children) = 16200 pupils seen over the lifetime of the project.

Major intended outcomes:

- Increased awareness for teachers of what museums have to offer in terms of supporting classroom teaching
- Increased visits to museums from relevant schools
- Increased confidence for teachers in teaching history or science & technology skills
- Increased enjoyment of, and motivation to use museums, both in school time and in leisure time
- Increased knowledge and understanding of relevant subject matter

### Form H: Summary of DCMS/DfES Project

Title of project: People, Places, Portraits

Name of lead museum: National Portrait Gallery

Name of partner museums: Beningborough Hall Montacute House Sheffield Galleries and Museums Trust Sunderland Museum and Winter Gardens The Wordsworth Trust, Dove Cottage

### Aims of project:

- To develop new partnerships between the National Portrait Gallery and the regions
- To give access for new audiences to the Gallery's collections, in particular in rural and urban areas through local education and community work

### Project description

(i) Activities based on the history of portraits, costume, art and Tudor life at Montacute House, with new groups in Yeovil and the surrounding rural area

(ii) Work based on 18<sup>th</sup> Century portraits at Beningborough Hall for rural schools, families, blind and partially sighted visitors, local colleges and education volunteers

(iii) Video and creative writing sessions led by artists for pupils from local disadvantaged secondary schools, based on Byron at Dove Cottage

(iv) and (v) work with secondary school pupils and teachers and community groups leading up to the creation of an exhibition in Sheffield and Sunderland

## Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

Secondary school students, families, visitors with special needs (e.g. blind and partially sighted), community groups

### Major intended outputs

Dove Cottage: 45 school children taking part from 4 local schools (1 from Cumbrian Rural Economic Development Zone)

Montacute House: 3,200 children, 15 new schools, 20 learning volunteers, 3 new community groups involved, 5 special family days

Beningborough: 525 children from rural schools, 10 partially-sighted/blind children, INSET for 40 teachers, 970 from community

Sheffield: 15 schools and 5 community groups in workshops, all Sheffield schools invited to exhibition and resource space

Sunderland: 200 community representatives and 400 school children participating, INSET for 40 teachers, 35,000 visitors to exhibition

### Major intended outcomes

5 General Learning Outcomes as defined by Research Centre for Museums and Galleries – related to each part of the project e.g.:

- Developing knowledge and understanding about local and national collections and cultural heritage, about the range and purpose of portraits, how to analyse and interpret them and relate them to your own life and times. For teachers, how portraits can be used to teach citizenship and literacy
- Development of self-expression and judgement in the creative processes involved in the workshops and gallery visits
- Working as part of a group with others from diverse backgrounds, or as an individual and sharing knowledge and experiences with peers, family and friends
- Encouraging local communities to engage with the development of the region, creating a greater sense of pride and investment

### Form H: Summary of DCMS Project

Title of project: Understanding Slavery Initiative

Name of lead museum: National Maritime Museum

#### Name of partner museums

British Empire and Commonwealth Museum, National Museums Liverpool, Bristol City Museums and Art Gallery

### Aims of project

- To consult with teachers, educators and students to ascertain how they would like to teach and learn about the Transatlantic Slave Trade.
- To use existing museum collections as the starting point for the research and development of new resources and projects to teach the subject in museums and in classrooms.
- To produce new resources and workshops, following the results of consultation with schools and community educators.
- To raise awareness of the British involvement in the Transatlantic Slave Trade in relation to citizenship, heritage and social responsibility.
- To evaluate Phase One of the project; to share and disseminate the findings with other stakeholders; and to develop a strategy to implement Phase Two - long-term learning and access strategies and programmes
- In addition, the partnership began to explore how curriculum-based activity in this subject area can also support informal learning activities for young people.

### **Project description**

The Understanding Slavery Initiative is an innovative and significant pilot project seeking to engage teachers, educators and students in developing museum and classroom based resources to teach and learn about the history of the Transatlantic Slave Trade, and its social, economic and cultural impact. In Phase One projects and resources were produced to support the KS2 and 3 History and Citizenship curricula.

## Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

KS2 and 3 students – in formal learning and during extra-curricula activities Teachers, Community Educators, General Audience

### Major intended outputs

- Consultation Report assessing needs for teaching and learning about the subject
- New print-based resources for school and museum use
- New museum-based teaching programmes and workshops
- New Handling Collections
- Web-based resources
- CD ROM
- Project Report and Evaluation Report
- Strategies for new INSET and teacher training programmes
- Strategies for research and development

### Major intended outcomes

- Will encourage learning through objects, museum visits and curatorial activity
- Will encourage the teaching of the Transatlantic Slave Trade at KS2 and 3
- Students will understand that the subject is complex and relates to citizenship issues today
- Students will have learnt various research methodology ICT, original artefacts, interviewing
- Will increased teachers self-confidence when teaching the subject and encourage cross-curricula study history and citizenship
- Will increase confidence in students in negotiating complex issues, asking questions and articulating idea.
- Will facilitate the research and development strategies for new audiences
Title of project: Animation!

Name of lead museum: National Museum of Photography, Film & Television, Bradford

#### Aims of project:

- To explore the potential of Animation to deliver the National Curriculum particularly art
- To discover how Animation works as a learning tool both in schools and in museums/galleries
- To establish partnerships between National Museum of Photography, Film & television, Cartwright Hall (BMG&H) and Castle Museum (York Museum Trust)
- For three partner venues to forge new supportive partnerships with school and community groups
- For staff in all three organisations to learn, share skills and make links
- To have a long term effect leave a legacy in all three organisations: CH and Castle Museum (start of year long season theme of animation) will showcase the work of schools and groups as part of permanent displays and have lifelong legacy developed via web presence
- To gain new insights into historic objects and the collections at all three sites

### Project description:

10 animation projects (8 schools + 2 community groups) will be undertaken across the partner venues and localities between Dec 03 and April 04. Each project will be based upon animation-related objects/collections/exhibitions in each venue and will contribute to enhanced permanent gallery displays across all 3 sites. An learning-based Animation! Website will be integral to the project and an additional resource-based legacy of the animation projects.

# Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

8 schools – key stage 2 & 3 2 community groups - one young adult, one young people

#### Major intended outputs:

- 10 completed animation films
- Animation! Website
- Enhanced permanent gallery NMPFT
- Cartwright Hall will showcase the children's work and have new facilities for future groups to work using animation
- Castle Museum will have a display in the foyer and permanent exhibits interpreting their objects using animation throughout the museum

- Learning tools, expertise and resources for the Learning Depts in each partner institution (eg list of freelance animators, staff with newly acquired animation expertise, new resources for using animation with learning groups.)
- Enhancing children's achievements and the delivery of the art National Curriculum.
- Teacher professional development acquisition of new skills
- New partnerships established between deliverers and participants in all three localities leading to shared learning, which has already begun
- Visiting public will gain an increased understanding of animation, benefit from enhanced displays/ special displays in each partner institution and the work of the project groups will be acknowledged and validated through temporary and permanent display. (300k visitors per year to Castle Museum, 700k to Cartwright)
- Beyond that all those who use the Animation! Website will continue to reap the benefits of the project

Title of project: Creative Canal Project

Name of lead museum: The Science Museum, South Kensington

Name of partner museums: The London Canal Museum The Ragged School Museum Beauchamp Lodge (floating Classroom)

### Aims of project

- To bring hands-on science to London's waterways and link the science and technology of the canal with the history of Victorian London
- To create sustainable relationships with partners-uniting expertise, resources and the diverse audiences of the four organisations
- To create high impact outreach targeting underachieving schools and groups at the heart of London's disadvantaged communities
- To leave every group with a fun, memorable experience and positive association with science, canals and museums

### **Project description**

This is an innovative, dynamic, educational project that takes place on and around Regent's Canal. The 'floating classroom' plays a central role in the project and is a venue for many workshops and science education, also central to the project. The two partner museums provide the other venues along the canal.

The participants are from schools and communities along or near the canal. They get a unique experience and learn about the canal through exciting science shows, history, storytelling and hands-on workshops delivered by experienced science communicators. They also get to understand the canal's environment from actually being on the canal instead of beside it.

We have funding for 40 sessions on the boat and some mornings are spent onboard, while the afternoon's fun takes place in a partner museum. School groups then swap at lunchtime so that two classes can enjoy the experience in one day.

# Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

KS2 schools, teenagers, grandparents with under 7's and community groups. We have had adult ESOL groups, toddlers, Moroccan Welfare group and a couple of year 10 pupils from secondary schools.

### Major intended outputs

- Trained, enthusiastic science communicators
- Informal science education outreach
- Shows
- Workshops
- Canal boat trips
- Museum visits
- A science night at the Science Museum

- Create sustainable relationships between partners
- Raise profiles of all partner museums and increase audiences
- A sharing of skills, expertise and training amongst partners
- Increase awareness of the Regent's canal and the local environment
- Promote social inclusion
- A raised awareness, interest and positive association with science
- Creating a memorable, fun, educational experience for 2000 participants

Title of project: DCMS Strategic Commissioning Project

### Name of lead museum: Tate

### Name of partner museums

Lakeland Arts Trust; Norwich Castle Museum; Sheffield Galleries and Museums Trust (SGMT); The New Art Gallery Walsall

### Aims of project

- 1. To encourage national and regional partnerships between museums, galleries and communities
- 2. Sharing expertise and collections to develop partnerships
- 3. To provide new learning opportunities and different learning experiences.
- 4. To improve language and ICT skills of children.
- 5. To improve and increase educational resources within museums and galleries.
- 6. Using available resources to encourage teacher confidence

### Project description

- Educational Scheme teaching knowledge about art and teaching of art through the Tate Collection.
- Working with the educational impoverished, those who find it difficult to access education.
- Working with special needs; gifted and talented and children with challenging behaviour.
- The educational resources will be provided by the participating galleries and will relate to the exhibition.

# Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

KS3, GCSE pupils from schools local to the museums and galleries involved.

### Major intended outputs

(This is being gathered from the individual galleries involved)

- To encourage and make a substantial increase in children's learning and confidence.
- To encourage teamwork among children and the community.
- To support and provide children developing through experience.
- To promote teachers and students working together within the museum/gallery environment.
- To develop access to museums and galleries and to gain contact with skills.
- To increase children's educational attainment.
- To increase the amount of participation within schools both on and off site.
- To get in touch with the community and schools and forge new partnerships.

Title of project: Image & Identity

Name of lead museum: Victoria and Albert Museum

### Name of partner museums:

Birmingham Museums & Art Gallery; Manchester City Galleries; Royal Pavilion, Libraries and Museums, Brighton & Hove; Harris Museum & Art Gallery, Preston; Sheffield Galleries & Museums Trust

### Aims of project

A national/regional partnership, Image & Identity will engage young people, families and community groups in six regions of the UK - many of the young people are from schools with multiple characteristics of disadvantage – in responding creatively to museum collections and displays of modern popular culture. It's main aims are to:

- Inspire creativity, through drawing and image making in all media
- Increase participants' self-esteem, confidence and sense of entitlement to participate in cultural activities
- Increase their sensitivity to cultural difference
- Improve young people's performance, behaviour and attitudes to learning across the Curriculum

### Project description:

In addition to the museum partners other active partners are: the regional MLACs; the Campaign for Drawing; NCH- the children's charity and the National Foundation for Educational Research (NFER). Taking as its starting point collections of twentieth-century fashion, photography, graphic art, and Cinema India (the V&A's award winning exhibition of Bollywood film posters) the project will encourage children, young people and community groups to explore the ways in which this material conveys social, historical/cultural messages about the societies in which they are produced. Each museum will bring young people in to work with their collections, and related material borrowed from partner museums, in original and print reproductions. Cinema India will tour to Preston (Nov 8 – Feb 15) and to Birmingham (Mar 19 – June 20). Partner museums will exhibit special temporary displays on the image & identity theme.

Each museum will develop activities using drawing (in many different media) and image making as core processes for recording and design. Participants will be encouraged to record their own image and identity as represented in fashion, on their bodies,

The project is managed by the V&A on behalf of the museums, project co-ordinators at the partner museums meet once a month.

# Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

Young people, Secondary school students KS3, 4 and 5, Families, Local Community groups and Community workers, NCH (formerly National Children's Homes), Asian Communities in Birmingham.

### Major intended outputs:

- A range of workshops and events across the project. Four of the museum partners will work with 19 NCH centres; NCH works with some of the UK's most vulnerable youngsters. Each museum will participate in the October Big Draw using Image and Identity as the main theme. Day of Record events will be held at three of the partner museums
- The impact of the project on 14 -16 year olds will be evaluated by NFER
- An Image & Identity teachers' pack will be produced by the V&A, 2000 copies will be printed for secondary schools. INSET courses for secondary school teachers on Image & Identity will take place at the partner museums
- An Image & Identity exhibition will be held at the V&A in March 04 providing an opportunity for partners to display work from participants across the project. The V&A will host a Young People's conference with the launch of the exhibition. The conference will enable young people to present their work and give their views on how future projects should be developed. A conference for professionals will take place in March 04 in Sheffield. The MLACs will help the museums to collaborate with regional museums, libraries and archives and use the project to develop skills of museum and gallery professionals

- To increase the participation of non-users and under-represented groups in learning programmes through local and national museum collections
- To increase the number of school children benefiting from education programmes through our museums and collections
- To test and develop effective ways for young people to participate and learn in museums
- To foster a positive attitude to and continuing desire for engagement in museumbased cultural activities
- To foster the skills and interests of young people in drawing (across a range of media) and communication
- To increase learning by young people within and between curriculum subjects
- To create a permanent record of young people's lives in 2003, and of their creative responses to museum collections, by selecting and retaining examples of work from the project
- To establish sustainable relationships between museums and educational institutions in participating regions
- To increase the confidence of teachers to work with museums and cultural artefacts, and integrate museum-based learning into schemes of work
- To increase the confidence and skills of youth arts and community workers in using museums
- To test and develop an innovative model for future partnerships, enabling regional museums, learning and access teams and community organisations to develop relationships of leadership and exchange

Title of project: Take One Picture: North, East, South, West

Name of lead museum: The National Gallery, London

### Name of partner museums:

Bristol Museums and Art Gallery Laing Art Gallery, Newcastle -upon-Tyne

### Aims of project:

- Increase the numbers and range of children, teachers and community groups enjoying and benefiting from paintings in the collections of the National Gallery, Bristol Museums and Art Gallery and the Laing Art Gallery.
- To exchange and share expertise, knowledge and skills with regional partners on education, outreach work and the National Gallery's 'Take One Picture' methodology.
- Through 'Take One Picture' promote the importance of the visual arts by encouraging primary school teachers to use paintings as a resource to inspire creative teaching, not only in Art & Design, but across the primary curriculum
- To encourage a culture of gallery use as a source of lifelong learning

### Project description:

The project extends the 'Take One Picture' scheme to regional partners. The project allows for Bristol, Newcastle and London to run a series of 'Take One Picture' CPD training courses and the production of supporting teaching aids.

Following the training, schools develop cross-curricular projects in Art, Literacy, ICT, Citizenship, Numeracy, Design & Technology. To assist the teachers, weeklong artists residencies will be organised at schools in Newcastle and 20 x 1 day follow-up workshops will be held in schools in Bristol and at the Bristol Museums and Art Gallery. A wide range of innovative work created by schools taking part in the scheme will be exhibited at the galleries during Spring 2004. Selected works will be exhibited on the new Take One Picture: North, East, South, West web site.

A series of educational and informal learning, family events and outreach work will be held at the National Gallery, Bristol Museums and Art Gallery and Laing Art Gallery, Newcastle upon Tyne to coincide with the launch of the Touring Partnerships 'Making Faces' exhibition.

Production of an ambitious new web resource aimed at primary school teachers across the UK. The site will contain information about all aspects of the scheme, free online resources including teachers' notes and images, case studies and online exhibitions of students' work.

# Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

Primary School Teachers, Head Teachers, Key Stage 1 & Key Stage 2 students, Hospital Schools, Families, Young Mothers, Artists

### Major intended outputs:

- 10 x CPD Training Courses (London, Bristol, Newcastle)
- 1,500 Take One Picture Teacher Training Information Packs
- Family Events (35 x London, 3 x Bristol)
- London: Outreach work with Young Mothers
- Newcastle: Artists in residence in schools (13 x primary schools, 7 x hospital schools)
- Bristol: 20 x 1 Day Workshops in Primary Schools
- 2 x Take One Picture schemes involving over 3,000 children
- Take One Picture exhibitions held at The Laing Art Gallery and Bristol Museums and Art Gallery.
- Production of the Take One Picture: North, East, South, West Web Site

- To have introduced teachers to the highly successful 'Take One Picture' scheme, which supports teachers in delivering a wide and balanced curriculum with quality resources and CPD courses
- To have widened the general public's access to the collections of the National Gallery, Bristol Museums and Art Gallery and the Laing Art Gallery, Newcastleupon-Tyne. Increase the numbers and range of children, teachers and community groups enjoying and benefiting from paintings in the collections of the galleries.
- To have developed cross-curricular projects using the Take One Picture methodology in Art, Literacy, ICT, Citizenship, Numeracy, Design & Technology
- To have continued to share expertise between the Touring Partnership education departments
- To empower young people by stimulating creativity, raising awareness and encouraging ownership of cultural heritage
- Produce a website to expand the scheme's reach, to inspire teachers nationwide and make art accessible to the widest possible audience The site will provide a lasting and meaningful record of the project and access to valuable teaching resources.

Title of project: Engaging refugees and asylum seekers

Name of lead museum: National Museums Liverpool

Name of partner museums: Salford Museum and Art Gallery Leicester City Museums Tyne and Wear Museums

### Aims of project

- To provide learning and social opportunities for refugees and asylum seekers
- To explore the contribution museums and galleries can make in supporting refugees and asylum seekers
- To develop resources for other museum professionals

### **Project description:**

The project will provide museum based activities for refugees and asylum seekers such as hands-on workshops, trails etc. We will work in partnerships with local support agencies to ensure the appropriate targeting of activities to refugees and asylum seekers.

We will use our experience to create resources such as multi-lingual information, ESOL curriculum linked trails or similar, and disseminate findings to other museum staff.

# Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

Refugees and asylum seekers in the four project locations: Liverpool, Salford, Sunderland and Leicester, particularly children, young people and family groups.

#### Major intended outputs:

- 600 refugee and asylum seekers visits to participant museums
- Creation of 4 new museum resources targeted to the needs of refugees and asylum seekers
- Development of a best practice guide for other museum staff
- Improved networking between museums and refugee support organisations
- Project seminar

- Participants feel more aware of museums and galleries and are more confident in accessing city facilities
- Participants enjoy their museum experience and have learnt something new
- Support agencies are more aware of the potential benefits of partnership with museums and galleries
- Museums are more aware of refugees and asylum seekers needs and issues

Title of project: Moving Minds

Name of lead museum: Imperial War Museum North

### Name of partner museums

Bradford Museums, Galleries and Heritage Leeds Museums and Galleries

### Aims of project

- To promote and encourage awareness and understanding of culture, migration and identity across communities.
- To develop new audiences for the partner museums and galleries involved.
- To assist participants in producing creative works of an excellent, exhibitory standard.
- To form equal, creative partnerships between museums, galleries, freelancers and communities.
- To enhance capacity within the cultural (museum and gallery) sector through training and development of staff, artists, volunteers etc.
- Evaluate how people learn within a museum/gallery environment.

### **Project description**

Moving Minds aims to bring together museums and galleries from Bradford, Leeds and Manchester with communities and artists to create work that reflects their ideas on migration, culture and identity. Community groups will use the collections of the participant museums to stimulate discussion about their lives today and in the past.

Each of the partner museums will target specific communities in their locality, to involve them in the construction of yurts and in the creation of the exhibits, stories and lifelines that will be displayed within them. Yurts are lightweight structures that can be constructed and moved easily; they originated in Mongolia where nomadic peoples designed them as simple and easily moveable homes; today, modern yurts are used by aid agencies to build refugee camps, hospital stations and temporary schools, and are thus appropriate structures for this project. In past and present times, yurts have housed communities, in the same way that we aim to build communities during the life of this project.

This project will be a learning experience for the project leaders and workers as much as the participants, and we aim to share experiences and expertise as much as our collections. Thus an important function of the project will be as a training and developmental experience for staff, artists and participants alike. Participants and workers will be able to travel between the different partner venues to further develop their skills, knowledge, understanding and self-confidence.

Description of participants e.g. KS2 students, refugees and asylum seekers, families...

Mainly young people (10-16yrs). A number of projects also worked with adults of all ages. Most participants came from the inner city areas of Bradford, Leeds and Manchester and cover a diverse range of cultures and communities.

#### Major intended outcomes (processes)

- To promote cultural awareness and interaction between different communities.
- To reinforce principals of lifelong learning in professionals and participants.
- To learn new skills, have fun, do something different and increase confidence in participants (including workers).
- To create sustainable, creative partnerships between museums, galleries, freelance workers and community groups.
- To achieve a greater understanding of what and how people learn in museums, using the generic learning outcomes.

# Appendix 3 Teachers' Themes

Responses to Question 4, *What theme are you studying?*, Form A were coded under the following themes:

### HISTORY

HISTORY HISTORY FOR BEGINNERS

SYNOPTIC UNIT AFRICA PREHISTORY TO PRESENT DAY

ANCIENT EGYPT EGYPTIANS AND ROMANS

ANCIENT GREECE ANCIENG GREECE GREECE GREEKS ANCIENT GREEKS ANCIENT GREECE & EGYPT

ROME ROMANS THE ROMANS INVADERS AND SETTLERS - THE ROMANS CELTS AND ROMANS CELTS & ROMANS ROMANS/MONEY ROMANS (INTRODUCTION)

MEDIEVAL REALMS MEDIEVAL TIMES LIFE IN A CASTLE MEDIEVAL NORWICH, DIFFERENCE BETWEEN LIFE THEN AND NOW MEDIEVAL PERIOD

### TUDORS

TUDOR **TUDOR HISTORY TUDOR EXPLORERS HISTORY - TUDORS RICH AND POOR** THE TUDORS **HISTORY - THE TUDORS TUDOR LIFE** TUDOR ENDLAND (COSTUME) **TUDORS - RICH AND POOR TUDOR LIFE - RICH & POOR** ELIZABETHAN ARCHITECTURE ELIZABETHAN COUNTRY ....? **TUDOR HOUSES HISTORY – TUDORS** Histroy – Tudors **TUDOR TIMES TUDOR ENGLAND** 

### THE FIRE OF LONDON

BRITISH EMPIRE TRADE IN BRITISH EMPIRE BRITISH EMPIRE, SHOULD WE BE PROUD OF IT? TRADE AND EMPIRE BRITISH TRADE & EMPIRE THE BRITISH EMPIRE

THE INDUSTRIAL REVOLUTION INDUSTRIAL REV/SLAVENY INDUSTRIAL REV/SLAVERY IND

SLAVERY SLAVERY/BLACK HISTORY MONTH SLAVE TRADE SLAVERY & FREEDOM BLACK HISTORY SLAVERY AS PART OF BLACK PRESENCE IN LONDON SLAVERY - BLACK HISTORY MONK BRISTOL & SLAVERY SLAVERY (FREEDOM PROJECT) SLAVERY/FREEDOM BALCK PEOPLES OF THE AMERICAS TRANS-ATLANTIC SLAVERY FREEDOM PROJECT (SLAVERY/BLACK HISTORY) SLAVERY/FREEDOM DANCE

FLORENCE NIGHTINGALE

VICTORIANS THE VICTORIANS VICTORIAN CHILDREN/SERVANTS VICTORIAN TIMES CHILDREN IN VICTORIAN TIMES VICTORIAN VICTORIAN WASH DAY VICTORIAN LIFE VICTORIAN SERVANTS VICTORIAN CHILDREN

WW1

WORLD WAR II BRITAIN IN 1940 EVACUEES WORLD WAR 2 & EVACUEES, FLORENCE NIGHTINGALE. EVACUEES WORLD WAR II WW2 THE HOMEFRONT AND CHILDREN WW2 CHILDREN IN WORLD WAR II WORLD WAR TWO WWII CHILDREN AT WAR WW2 CHILDREN IN THE SECOND WORLD WAR CHILDREN IN WWII WORLD WAR 2

BRITAIN IN 1930S BRITAIN SINCE 1930S CHANGE IN BRITAIN 1930-PRESENT DAY BRITAIN SINCE 1930 ENGLAND 1930 WW2 ONWARDS BRITAIN AFTER 1930

HISTORY OF TOYS TOYS/OLD & NEW TOYS TOYS (HISTORY) TOYS FROM THE PAST TOYS IN THE PAST/HOUSES LONG AGO

DOMESTIC OBJECTS FROM LONG AGO USING ARTEFACTS - COMPARING TO MODERN DAY USING ARTEFACTS TO COMPARE TO MODERN EQUIV THINGS IN THE PAST ARTEFACTS

LIVING IN THE PAST LIFE IN THE PAST LIFE LONG AGO/IN THE PAST

WORKHOUSE AGRIC OLDEN DAY FARMING AND HOMES

JOURNEYS

MONEY

HOMES HOUSES & HOMES

MEDICINE SMUGGLING TEXTS IN CONTEXT/SHIPWRECKS

### SCIENCE / TECHNOLOGY

SCIENCE

HOW THINGS FLY HOW DO THINGS FLY WHY THINGS FLY FLIGHT Flying WHY THINGS FLY? FORCES FLIGHT/FORCES FLIGHT/STRUCTURES FLIGHT RELATING TO CREEK NIGHTS FLIGHT & FORCES HOW THINGS FLY? HERE STUDYING FORCES IN SCHOOL MOVEMENT (FLIGHT)

MOTHER NATURE DESIGNER MOTHER NATURE, DESIGNER

FORCES FORCES (NEXT TERM) SCIENCE - FORCES/STRUCTURES PUSH & PULL (SCIENCE) PUSHES AND PULLS (SCIENCE) FORCES - PUSHES AND PULLS SCIENCE/FORCES ECONOMIC/FORCES FORCES FRICTION FORCES/FRICTION FORCES, WHEELED VEHICLES FORCES, WHEELED VEHICLES FORCES, FRICTION ETC... FORCES & MOVEMENT FORCES & MOTION (SPRINGS & WHEELS)

FRICTION (FORCES) FRICTON/MECHANISMS FRICTON/SPRINGS

STRUCTURES STABLE STRUCTURES BUILDINGS STRUCTURERS STRUCTURES/SHELTERS D.T. SHELTERS

LEVERS, LINKAGES, BRAKES, WHEELS PUSHES & PULLS & DT MAKING THINGS. PIVOTS & LINKAGES MECHANISMS SPRINGS & WHEELS SPRINGS AND WHEELS SPRINGS VEHICLES MECHANISMS IN VEHICLES TRANSPORT & FORCES

RIVERS, FORCES WATER - WHERE FOUND, USES

**ROCKS & MINERALS** 

MATERIALS

MATERIALS - KSI

DIGESTON/CONDUCTION CONVERTION RADATION

SPRING ON THE FARM FARM ANIMALS

HEALTH & GROWTH

CREATIVE PROJECT CREATIVE CANNAL PROJECT SCIENCE - CANAL BOAT TRIP, FORCES, BRIDGES, BOAT BUILDING

EKECTRUCUTY AT SCHOOL (FORCES LAT 1/2 TERM)

### GEOGRAPHY

ENVIRONMENT/FOREST

### ART

ART

IMAGE & IDENTITY IMAGE AND IDENTITY IMAGE AND IDENTITY PROJECT UNAGE & IDENTITY IDENTITY SELF IDENTITY IMAGES AND IDENTITY IDENTITY SELF PERSON POT

MARK MAKING

PORTRAITS PORTRAITURE MAY CORNET PORTRAIT WORKSHOP PORTRAITS/IMAGES PORTRATIVE PORTRAITURE FACES & FEELINGS/PORTRAITS PORTTRIATURE

PRINT/PATTERN

TURNING HEADS

ILLUSTRATION

SCULPTURE SCULPTURE (CASTING)

TOUCH AND DRAW FEEL AND DRAW

### FEELING AND DRAWING

WILLIAM BLAKE/IMAGE AND IDENTITY WILLIAM BLAKE WILLIAM BLAKE - EXHIBITION

PEOPLE IN ACTION THE HUMAN BODY IN ART

ART SELF PORTRAITS/PHOTOGRAPHY

CREATIVITY IN THE CURRICULUM

CUBISM

CONFLICT, EXPRESSIVE ARTS

CINEMA INDIA MULTICULTURAL ART

DRAWING THE BIG DRAW

CULT OF THE CELEBRITY - CONNECTED WITH BYRON EXHIBITION FAMOUS PEOPLE CELEBRITY LIFESTYLES HEROES CLAIM TO FAME EXHIBITION - CLAY TILE WORKSHOP

ANIMATION/POP ART

Sculpture/Dance based on works by Degas and Picasso

PORTRAYING RELATIONSHIPS

NARROW BOAT ART

### CITIZENSHIP AND PSHE

CITIZENSHIP/IDENTITY CITIZENSHIP

## LITERACY / ENGLISH

LANGUAGE CHANGE/A2 ENGLISH LANGUAGE LANGUAGE CHANGE FAIRY TALES AND TRADITIONAL TALES CREATIVE WRITING

## CROSS-CURRICULAR

FORCES/WW2

FORCES & WORLD WAR II FORCES/CHILDREN IN SECOND WORLD WARS FRICTON (SCIENCE) WWII (HISTORY)

TRANSPORT TRANSPORT/TRAVELLING TRANSPORT NOW, WWII NEXT, FORCES LAST TERM FORCES (BEFORE XMAS) TRANSPORT (AFTER XMAS) JOURNEYS/FORCES

CASTLES & MEDIEVAL NORWICH (& MATERIALS IN SCIENCE)

ROMANS AND HABITAT

MAGNETISM/LOCAL HISTORY

TUDORS AND PORTRAITS PORTRAITS (LINKED A LITTLE WITH 2ND W.WAR) THE TUDORS & TUDOR PORTRAITS TUDOR PORTRAITS

ANIMATION (SHADOW PUPPETS AND WITH ICT)

LINK WITH PERFORMING ARTS/LITERACY EXPRESSIVE ARTS - FUSION OF ART/CREATIVE WRITING EXPRESSIVE ARTS/CREATIVE WRITING

HISTORICAL/LITERACY

CROSS CURRICULAR BASTED UPON FLIGHT VICTORIAN HEARTH & KITCHEN/ANIMATION ART/HISTORY/LITERACY LINKS ANIMATED PROJECT (TO ANIMATE OBJECTS AT THE CASTLE MUSEUM YORK) AUTUMN/FARM/THE PAST TAKE ONE PICTURE MUSIC/PORTRAITS JAKE AND KATE (TAKE 1 PICTURE)

## OTHER

ASKRIGG PRIMARY SCHOOL LARKMAN FIRST SCHOOL EXCHANGE (FRENCH) GREENLEAS LOWER SCHOOL THIS WAS A VISIT FOR PLEASURE